



**IPCC WGII
Fourth Assessment Report
Climate Change Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability
*Government and Expert Review of Second Order Draft***

Specific Comments

EXPERT REVIEW COMMENTS

Chapter 10

August 2006

Organization of the review comments file

Comments are organized as follows:

- (a) First are the comments from the Co-Chairs and TSU. These:
 - (i) track the development of the ZOD and FOD, and your responses to review comments on each of these drafts, and then
 - (ii) present comments on the Second-Order Draft
- (b) Second are the comments from the Expert Reviewers, organized in the same format as your FOD comments file.

**Government and Expert Review of Second Order Draft
Confidential, Do Not Cite or Quote
August 2006**

Discussion of expert review comments and record keeping

IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT:

- AUTHORS BEGIN WORK ON THE COMMENTS IMMEDIATELY. SUBSTANTIVE COMMENTS NEED TO BE SEPARATED FROM NON-SUBSTANTIVE, AND THE TWO SHOULD BE TREATED DIFFERENTLY
- CONTACT IS MADE BETWEEN AUTHORS AND THEIR REVIEW EDITORS IN AUGUST

Substantive comments

- The chapter writing team should discuss all substantive expert review comments, by email and/or at Cape Town.
- Substantive comments require full and proper consideration. The *Principles Governing IPCC Work* state that:
 - genuine controversies should be reflected adequately in the text of the Report and
 - it is the role of the Review Editors to advise the lead authors on how to handle contentious/controversial issues
- You must record the outcome of these discussions in this document, under the column 'Notes of the Writing Team'.

Non-substantive comments

- For non-substantive comments, a very brief entry should be made in the column 'Notes of the Writing Team'. The following terms are acceptable:
 - Addressed
 - Not applicable
 - Text removed
 - A tick to denote a comment has been addressed (somewhere on the document this should be stated)

General

- The record should be kept in this document, ideally electronically.
- The document becomes part of the traceable account of the Working Group II Fourth Assessment. When completed to the satisfaction of the Review Editors, a copy should be returned to the TSU by the **8th December 2006**.

Chapter 10

Comments from the Co-Chairs/TSU are laid out as follows: first we comment on whether the SOD addresses the comments we made on the ZOD; second we comment on whether the SOD addresses the comments we made on the FOD; our concluding comments on the Second-Order Draft are at the end

	Chapter 10 ZOD comments by Co-Chairs and TSU	Has this been addressed in the SOD?	Author response
10.Z1	The ZOD is substantially over length, we estimate by around 30 text pages or 19 printed pages (see Blue Book Doc 3). Much condensing and prioritising is required	Still over length (see below)	
10.Z2	All sections are present, and follow the Plenary-agreed Outline. Authors will have to make hard decisions about what's important and what's not - there are 71 pages		
10.Z3	The TAR conclusions (10.1) can be shortened to just one page, using bullet points	Still over a page (1.5), bullet points used in SOD	Shortened according to specifications
10.Z4	Section 10.2 can usefully be shortened from 30 pages to 10 pages, to allow more space for the core section 10.4. It generally has too many descriptive sections. 10.2 reads like a geography textbook. It contains too much material on climate which would be more appropriate in WGI	10.2 is 13 pages Less material on climate but superfluous text still present. For example, too much detail about SRES and experiment design in sections 10.3.4 (ln49 p22 – ln7 p23) and 10. 3.1 (6-16), respectively	Shortened according to specifications
10.Z5	In Section 10.3, authors should provide information on futures, covering population, income, etc. However, authors can reduce space given to <u>climate</u> futures in this section by referring to Chapter 2	The majority of the section is still focussed on climate and should be reduced.	Revised as suggested.
10.Z6	Section 10.4 is the core of the assessment and might usefully comprise half the total space in the chapter, i.e. it could be expanded from the current 13 to as much as 24 text pages. It currently starts on page 45 of the ZOD – this is far too late	10.4 now starts much earlier on p24 and takes up 14.5 pages. This section should account for about one-half of the chapter length, as it does in other chapters.	Revised as suggested.
10.Z7	Section 6 Adaptation: Could much of this text be effectively summarised in a table? And Table 10-1 should really be here	T10.1 is no longer in the SOD. More is needed here	Revised as suggested
10.Z8	It is suggested that you highlight your conclusions regarding how this assessment: i. confirms conclusions of TAR or ii. revises them	Not clearly done	Revised as suggested.
10.Z9	It is not always clear what the timescales are of your assessed effects under mean climate change: i.e., are they for the 2030s, or 2050s or 2080s?	Still not always clear in the SOD	Timescales more appropriately highlighted.
10.Z10	Is it possible to say anything about effects under: i. scenarios of stabilisation and ii. different development pathways (e.g. SRES	Nothing said about stabilization. Very little specific reference to SRES scenarios in the impacts section. Terms such as 'the	New materials on SRES reviewed and incorporated

	scenarios)?	most conservative climate change projections' tend to be used	
10.Z11	Is there value in having tables that update key tables in the TAR such as 11.7, 11.8 and 11.9 (but in a reduced form)?	Some summary tables exist but were also present in the ZOD e.g. 10.7 and FOD e.g., 10.11	What exactly is needed from us on the said Tables?
10.Z12	In each section, the authors deal with one geographical region at a time. There is no attempt to draw inferences between the different regions. This is very inefficient of space, and surely there are some common points which could usefully and informatively be made. While in the TAR there were four sub-regions, now in AR4 the authors have adopted six sub-regions, which is just compounding their difficulties with space	The authors have made attempts to group regions together where commonalities exist	Further condensing made where appropriate
10.Z13	Authors of this chapter generally need to use more tables and figures to condense information	Figures haven't been used to full effect. There are a lot of tables in the SOD used to summarise information	A few figures added
10.Z14	The Chapter 10 ZOD is short of sub-regional information on some issues (for example, Human Health in Eastern Asia)	Better in the SOD	Furhter improved in FGD
10.Z15	This draft included (in pages 34 to 41) a set of four boxes complementing the text on some specific issues. Some of them, like Box 10.3 on Aral Sea desiccation, call for coordination with Chapter 1. Others (Box 10.4) calls for coordination with the ZOD text	These boxes no longer exist in the SOD. Instead, Megadeltas and Himalayan Glaciers make up the case studies section 10.6	
10.Z16	Coral bleaching. This material appears in Small Islands, in Coasts, in Australia and New Zealand, and in Section 10.4.3.1 on page 50. This is a lot of repetition – authors need to work across chapters to save space	P31 in SOD = much more Asia-specific information on coral reefs with a new table. The third paragraph on p31 (2 nd para of coral section) could be deleted as it's quite general.	Done as proposed.
	Chapter 10 FOD comments by Co-Chairs and TSU	Has this been addressed in the SOD?	Author response
10.F1	There are 8 Contributing Authors, which is a low number for such a large continent. Regional imbalances are beginning to emerge. If we count CLAs+LAs+CAs, then we have 6 authors from China, 5 from Japan, but only 1 from India and none from Indonesia. It will look better in the final chapter if there is some contribution from currently-absent important countries such as Malaysia and Indonesia, and other contributors from India to balance the very large contingents from China and Japan.	No change in author numbers or composition	New CAs added
10.F2	Headings: these are broadly followed. However, 10.3 should become 'Assumptions about future trends' rather than the present 'Future trends in climate and socioeconomic indicators' which implies a certainty which is not justified. 10.7 should become 'Conclusions: implications	10.3 is now 'Future projections of climate and socioeconomic indicators' 10.7 is now 'Implications for sustainable development'	Approved outline adopted

	for sustainable development' which is different from 'Sustainable development challenges'.		
10.F3	Length and balance: this chapter is hugely over-length, and needs shortening by 19 text pages. At the same time, there are only 18 pages on Future Impacts, out of a total of 60 pages. The recommendation is that Impacts should take up around half the chapter, whereas here Section 4 is less than one third. There is a lot of material in this chapter on climate science, much of which needs to be removed, and much of the material is sector-specific rather than location-specific, and so is unsuitable for a regional chapter. The authors need to concentrate on the new findings since the TAR for Asia.	The chapter is still ~25% over length Future impacts is now 14.5 pages long – so still only about a third of the overall chapter	FGD sufficiently shortened
10.F4	The Executive Summary is a suitable length, but doesn't contain the needed material. What is needed is a clear statement of (i) what is <u>new since the TAR</u> and (ii) what are the key, headline, findings from the chapter. The reader wants to access the key, headline, statements in the Executive Summary, set out on not more than one page. Bullet points may help with this. It would be better to discard the present Executive Summary and start again.	The ES is still over 1 page in length. Statements are bulleted now but what is new since the TAR has not been specifically stated. ES is rather boring, has three statements on climate which could immediately be removed, and fails to concentrate on topics relevant specifically to Asia – i.e., impacts on highly-intensive agriculture, very rapid urban growth, intensive industrialization.	ES improved in substance
10.F5	The Tables in Section 4 are useful, but could be expanded and made even more useful. There are two useful examples of tables in the FODs, and it would be great if the Asia chapter could produce something similar. First, Chapter 4 Table 4.5 shows impacts under different temperature increases. Second, Chapter 11 Table 11.11 looks at impacts (they call it risks, but in fact they are impacts) under different SRES scenarios at different points in time. Can Chapter 10 explore the feasibility of similar tables for Asia or even some regions of Asia? We want to include such tables in the SPM and Technical Summary, because we think this is what the policymakers want, but need the underlying evidence from the chapters.	Chapter 10 has not produced summary tables of risk/impacts against time or temperature change	Improved existing Table
10.F6	This chapter has rather few figures, and only one (permafrost) on impacts. It would be good if more figures, especially summarizing/synthesising figures, could be added. There are a few good examples in the FODs, such as Chapter 4 Figures 4.9 and 4.10. Fig. 4.9 is a map of the location of major impacts. Figure 4.10 is a sectoral burning embers diagram, but surely the concept could be applied at the regional scale. We want to include such material in the	Two impacts figures – one on permafrost and one on glacial retreat (these were both present in FOD so no increase in the SOD) There is no summary map of major impacts	A few figures added

	SPM and TS, but need the underlying evidence from the chapters.		
10.F7	Chapter 10 seems to have a rather small literature to assess, which is leading to very general statements and a lack of specificity. The authors need to tap into the literature which is written globally, but which has regional references. A good example would be Patz et al., 2005, Nature 438, 310-317 'Impact of regional climate change on human health' which has quantitative projections for 2030 for two regions of Asia. Only by doing this will the authors come up with the quantitative statements that policymakers are looking for, and which we seek for the SPM and TS. Other examples include the articles by Arnell on water resources, Nicholls on coastal flooding and van Liesholt et al on malaria in the GEC Special Issue (14, 1) in 2004 - we can send you a copy. Also Arnell et al 2002 in Climatic Change, 53, 413-446.	Patz included and Nicholls Arnell and van Liesholt not included	Suggested references added except for Liesholt
	Chapter 10 SOD comments by Co-Chairs and TSU		Author response
10.S1	LENGTH:	49 pages (9 over length – target = 40)	
10.S2	ARE PAO HEADINGS PRESENT?	Yes, some slight deviation. 'Assumptions about future trends' has become 'Future projections of climate and socioeconomic indicators'. 'Adaptation: practices, options and constraints' has become 'Adaptation: sector specific practices, options and constraints'	TSU proposed PAO headings – more or less followed
10.S3	HAVE MOST GENERAL COMMENTS OF ERs FROM ZOD AND FOD BEEN COVERED? [square brackets and highlighted text gives indication of SOD response to ZOD and FOD reviews]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of what's new since TAR [this is still not clearly stated in the SOD] • Superfluous text [still evident] • All negative, no positive [vast majority of the impacts sections focus on negative aspects] • Too long [still over length] • Many generic descriptions [this is still the case e.g., p27 ln17-29: these statements could apply anywhere. More specifics are required – what kinds of pests? Which crops most susceptible...?] • Repetition and overlap between sections [still the case e.g., future water temperatures discussed in impacts of observed climate trends] 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Section on what's new since TAR improved • Text edited to minimize superfluous, repetitive and overlapping texts, reduce length to specifications • More specific details added

		<p>etc in section 10.2.4.4; future pressure on land also discussed in 10.2.5 which should be in 10.3/10.4]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of supporting literature in many sections [still the case – see SOD general comments] 	
10.S4	ARE REFERENCES BROADLY COMPLETE?	Broadly, missing references and references not cited in the text are specified in the Excel spreadsheet	More or less yes
10.S5	IS THERE LINE-OF-SIGHT TEXT → ES AND TEXT+ES → TS+SPM?	yes	More or less
10.S6	<u>Very hard-going chapter. Lots of superfluous text – some suggestions where to shorten have been made in the Excel spreadsheet e.g. Too much detail about SRES and experiment design for example in sections 10.3.4 (ln49 p22 – ln7 p23) and 10. 3.1 (6-16), respectively.</u>		Revisions made hopefully addressed much of the unnecessary statements
10.S7	Needs language editing		Edited much of the chapter
10.S8	Quite a few pre-TAR references. <u>Around 15% of the references are pre-2000 which seems excessive</u>		New references added some old ones deleted
10.S9	<u>Quite a few sections with very few or no references at all e.g., p46-51 there are only 3 references and no references in section 10.5.7</u>		New references added
10.S10	<u>Livestock should be moved to section 10.4.1.2 'Farming and cropping systems'</u>		Done as suggested.
10.S11	<u>Page numbering on the contents page is incorrect</u>		Corrected
10.S12	<u>Authors haven't properly paid attention to the review comments, and so the chapter has not advanced sufficiently from the FOD (and ZOD).</u>		Hopefully addressed this time
10.S13	In such a large continent, and with such few pages, the authors really need to emphasise the issues and characteristics of particular relevance to Asia, and how these inter-relate with climate change. These would include, for example, <u>rapid and often unregulated urban growth, rural-urban migration, rapid industrialization and export growth, irrigated agriculture and multiple cropping.</u>		Revised as suggested
10.S14	<p><u>IN SUMMARY OUR RECOMMENDATIONS ARE:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Chapter needs shortening (25% over length) – much reduction is possible e.g., sections 10.3.4 and 10.3.1. <u>There is repetition also – see 10.S3 bullet 6</u> • Need to clearly state what's new or reaffirmed since TAR • <u>Literature on impacts under SRES should be assessed</u> • <u>Literature on impacts under stabilization should be assessed</u> • <u>PAO headings are broadly present but not exact e.g. 10.3 and 10.7; and need to exactly correspond to PAO (as other chapters do) so that the reader can cross over easily from one chapter to another</u> • <u>Future impacts section needs expanding by around 5 pages (but overall length of the chapter needs reducing by 9)</u> • <u>Risks/impacts against time and T change should be summarised in a table</u> • <u>Still tends to focus on negative impacts</u> • <u>There are sections with no/very few references e.g. 10.5.7</u> • <u>There are a large number of old references (pre-TAR) included in the chapter</u> • <u>Greater emphasis on issues particular to Asia</u> 		Hopefully all were addressed in the FGD

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-1	A	0				<p>This chapter is of variable quality, with some excellent sections and a few that require more work. In some cases, the authors have in effect generated new material for the report and this is not really appropriate as the review should be based on a synthesis of existing material. The chapter is weak on the human dimension and I have provided illustrative publications from my own area as an example of the kind of work that should be covered. I do not claim that these are the definitive nor the only relevant references.</p> <p>The chapter is weak on the role of institutions, in the most general sense of formal and informal ways of doing things. See for example Kelly, P. M., Hoang Minh Hien and Tran Viet Lien (2001) Responding to El Niño and La Niña: averting tropical cyclone impacts. In: Living with Environmental Change: Social Vulnerability, Adaptation and Resilience in Vietnam, ed. W. N. Adger, P. M. Kelly and Nguyen Huu Ninh, 154-181. Routledge, London. But there are other examples. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)</p>	Addressed in the FGD
E-10-2	A	0				<p>This chapter has improved and reads better now. There are more references although some additional ones and updating is still required. Surprisingly, there are no references for subsection 10.7 - and additional repair work need to be done to this subsection.</p> <p>(Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)</p>	New references added
E-10-3	A	0				<p>many grammar and editing errors, I didn't list them out. Advice English reviewing (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)</p>	Editing made
E-10-4	A	0				<p>Forest, especially taiga, is missing.</p> <p>(Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)</p>	Included in the FGD
E-10-5	A	0				<p>Comments on Asian population</p> <p>* Asian population was differently stated in Chapter 10 depending on references or the year of citation. For example,</p> <p>In Page 6, Lines 25-26: in 2002 is reported to be about 3,902 million</p> <p>In Page 17, Line 50: from 1.44 billion to 3.69 billion, during 1950-2000.</p> <p>In Page 35, Lines 27-29: Total population to be 3,307 million</p> <p>(UN-HABITAT, 2004)</p> <p>Therefore, in this report, we need to state Asian population using more recent information, if possible.</p> <p>* Table 10.1 in Pages 7-8</p> <p>We need information on Taiwan regardless political issue.</p> <p>* Table 10.2 in Page 9:</p> <p>Northwest China (fourth row) is not in Central Asia. Delete or move to China section in East Asia</p>	Appropriate corrections made.

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						* Table 10.4 in Page 13: In first column, delete 'Asia' from 'Asia/China', 'Asia/Kazakstan', and 'Asia/Mongolia'. (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	
E-10-6	A	0				(1). Length of the chapter is 51 pases which is longer than the given length of 30 pages. (2) the format of numbers used in the text should be unified. the format of years used in the text should be unified. Is 1900-96 a formal expression? (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made.
E-10-7	A	3	0			Executive summary - weak on human dimension (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	ES revised with more of human dimension
E-10-8	A	3	1	4	16	Expert Review: On the Executive summary; Fourth Assessment Report of Chapter 10 is properly reviewed, still the following description would insert the text. 1) Since the high population growth and economical development in Asia should enhance anthropogenic fuel burning and global warming, it will be necessary to reduce over crowding population in various communities of industrialized countries, developing countries and countries with economies in transition in Asia for risk reduction strategy. (Mitsuru Ando, Toyama University of International Studies)	Incorporated in the FGD
E-10-9	A	3	1	4	16	Expert Review: On the Executive summary and 10.8 Key uncertainties, research gaps and priorities; Expert Reviewer suggests that "oil crisis" is the most important factor for future social development and emission scenarios. 1) Instability of world oil supply in future evaluated by Colin J. Campbell and ASPO shows that IPCC Emission Scenarios (2000) should be revised using Peak Oil Scenarios. 2) The following sentence would insert the text. "There are some Peak Oil Scenarios are available, therefore projected scenarios on CO2 emission and surface air temperature should be revised in near future." (Mitsuru Ando, Toyama University of International Studies)	The issue barely addressed in FGD due to lack of references
E-10-10	A	3	3			spell out TAR (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken.
E-10-11	A	3	5	3	8	Adding: The rainfall increased in some other parts of Asia. (Zong-Ci Zhao, National Climate Center)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-12	A	3	9	3	12	this paragraph should not be refered to 10.2.2, it is not be talked about in 10.2.2, I think should be refered to 10.2.3 (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)	Appropriate editing undertaken.
E-10-13	A	3	9		23	Words such as "prominent" (line 9), "significant" (line 18) and "substantial" (line 23) may also convey different values to readers, especially in the light of being	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						used near each other. Perhaps the TSU would look into how we want to use these and similar words more carefully in this and other chapters. For example, the increases in the intensity and/or frequency of many weather events may be described as "substantial" elsewhere. Currently, these are not subject to guidance notes for authors. In chapter 16 (small islands), page 12, lines 11-13, extreme events are still doubted. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	
E-10-14	A	3	9		12	Edit "...intensity and/or frequency of extreme weather events on a regional scale throughout the 1990s and beyond. These include: heat waves.... And severe dust storms [10.2.2]" (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-15	A	3	10	3	10	Insert "Typhoons" after "tropical cyclones" (Susumu Nakamaru, Sun Management Institute)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-16	A	3	12	3	12	Please replace [10.2.2] with [10.2.3], as the contents of this part , from line 9 to line 12 are described in [10.2.3] (Susumu Nakamaru, Sun Management Institute)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-17	A	3	13			remove the word "potential" (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-18	A	3	16	3	17	the sentence "observed changes in terrestrial and marine ecosystems have become more pronounce" is unclear, which observed changes? (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)	Will be looked into carefully.
E-10-19	A	3	18			replace "Continueing emissions" with "Continued emission". Replace "would" with "will". (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-20	A	3	23			replace "countries of Asia" with "Asian countries" (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-21	A	3	23		26	please reword this sentence as it doesn't make sense. Perhaps replace 'apart from' (In 25, with a comma (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-22	A	3	24		25	re[place "...thermal stress and more svere droughts and flood apart..." with "thermal stress, severe droughts, and floods; apart..." (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-23	A	3	27	3	27	...at least between 4 to 10%' is not a very useful statement. What is the upper limit? (Andrew Challinor, University of Reading)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-24	A	3	27		28	Move "by the end of this century projection" to begining of the sentence and flip like so "Under the most conservative climate change projection, by the end of this century the net ceral"	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	
E-10-25	A	3	29	3	35	I am very suspect the first sentence has high confidence. From the context, we can see the precipitation projection is low level confidence, the water availability assessment was based on this projection, it's not very rationable to conclude this assessment has high confidence. (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-26	A	3	36	3	41	10.4.3 don't talk about the fisheries industry, where does this conclusion come from? (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-27	A	3	37		40	The sentence is ambiguous. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-28	A	3	37			remove "today" (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-29	A	3	38			add "is" after "North Indian Oceans" (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-30	A	4	10			change "are" to "is" (refers to development). (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-31	A	4	14			One would have thought that an integrated approach in climate proofing would be better than sector specific climate proofing. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-32	A	5	4	5	24	Some observed facts should have the agreements with the IPCC WG1 Chapter 11. (Zong-Ci Zhao, National Climate Center)	Aren't they here? Not all are needed here to avoid duplication.
E-10-33	A	5	6			spell out TAR (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-34	A	5	6			and ln 15: ref to IPCC(2001). Which chapter are you referring to? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-35	A	5	36		37	Forest dieback, increased fire risk, landslide, disease and flooding are all impacts (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-36	A	5	37			Landslides. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	What of it?
E-10-37	A	5	39			Sea-level rise (and elsewhere in the chapter). (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	What of it?
E-10-38	A	6	8	6	18	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-39	A	6	11			Sentence beginning 'Further analysis ...' change 'observed historical and current state of climatological state' to '...the observed historical and current climatological state'.	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	
E-10-40	A	6	11			change "analysis" to "analyses" (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-41	A	6	12			change "has" to "have" (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-42	A	6	16			change "...Asia, examines.." to "... Asia. This chapter examines...". (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-43	A	6	17			add comma after "sectors" and hyphen in "sector-specific" (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-44	A	6	21			T10.2 Tibetan Plateau - Ma (2004) not in ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Reference corrected
E-10-45	A	6	21			T10.2 Nepal - Shrestha (2004) not in ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Referecne corrected
E-10-46	A	6	21			T10.2 Mongolia - Natragodorj et al (2005) is Natsagdor et al (2005) in ref list. Are these the same reference? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Reference corrected.
E-10-47	A	6	23			Section 10.2.1. Boundaries between the real Asia and the model givren Asia given by IPCC WGI are different. It should piont out the differnce in boundaries between the real Asia and the model used Asia given by IPCC WGI. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Corrected
E-10-48	A	6	29			IPCC WG1 - which assessment? TAR or AR4? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-49	A	7	0			table 10.1. (1) It is better to add a row of subregions and to list the countries according to the subregion it belonged to. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-50	A	7	2			move "in winter" to after "climatic zone is" (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken.
E-10-51	A	7	4	7	6	from "one of the" to " freshwater resources" could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-52	A	7	6			change "hold" to "holding" (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-53	A	7	7	7	9	From "Although the relief" to " Dead Sea(-395m)" could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-54	A	7	7			"countried that are predominantely arid and semi-arid." (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-55	A	7	8	7	9	If Central Asia refers to the area in Fig 10.1, the Dead Sea is already beyond the Central Asia.	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
E-10-56	A	7	10	7	14	Check the range and the discription on the charactaristic of of Tibetan Plateau. Notic the differrencebetween "Tibetan plateau" as one of the sub-region and its real geographical regime. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-57	A	7	11			1/4 of the land? Which land - the east region of the Tibetan Plateau or the whole of the TP? Please clarify (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-58	A	7	17	7	21	Only population and argiculture in South Asia are discribed, It does not match with the other sub-regions. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-59	A	7	24	7	27	In this paragraph, From " the total population" in line 24 to "fish and seafood" could be changed to " the main information" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-60	A	7	29	8		Table 10.1. Some cleaning up - remove hyphens infront of the names of countries; cubic metres for water sources; explain the "x". (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-61	A	7				Table 10.1 - the population and GDP should be obtainable for Israel. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-62	A	7				T10.1 - what is RWR? 9th column from left (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-63	A	8	3	8	3	change 'trends, variability and extreme events' to 'trends and variability' (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-64	A	8	5	8	10	This paragraph could be shortned into "Increasing trends in surface air temperature, which is more pronounced in winter than in summer, has been obsrved across the six sub regions of Asia, of which North Asia is the most pronounced. The icrease in some parts of Asia during recent decades ranged between less than 1 to 3C per century." (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Paragraph condensed
E-10-65	A	8	5	8	10	It is true that most regions of Asia show temperature increases overall but it would be worth noting that looking for annual trends overlooks the fact that there can be opposing trends in different seasons. Certainly, our work (Fowler and Archer, in press in J Climate) shows that in northern Pakistan (Karakoram and Hindu Kush region, Central Asia in your regional definition) about half the station records show cooling of mean annual temperature since the 1960s, with accelerated cooling since the mid-1970s. Interestingly, over the longer term records there has been a slight warming over the century - 0.07degC per decade. This hides seasonal effects, with	Section revised

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						mean summer cooling and winter warming, with an acceleration of winter warming since 1960. Additionally, one of the most interesting results is the increase in daily temperature range since the 1960s, in contrast to most of the rest of the globe, and in contradiction to GCM simulations. This is statistically significant in all seasons and annually. If you want more information then the paper will be out very soon in J Climate. It might also be worth including as an example for Central Asia in Table 10.2 as I know that very little work has been done in this region of the world. (Hayley Fowler, Newcastle University)	
E-10-66	A	8	5	12	40	Some observed facts should have the agreements with the IPCC WG1 Chapter 11. (Zong-Ci Zhao, National Climate Center)	Done as suggested
E-10-67	A	8	7	8	7	a sentence is suggested to inserted after ".per centry". "For China,since the 1980s, the temperature rise is most significant in areas north of 35°N and winter is most prominent in seasonal rise of termperture(Sha et al., 2002). (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Reference corrected
E-10-68	A	8	12	8	13	the first sentence of the paragraph could be deleted. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-69	A	8	13	8	13	"across all Aisa" instead of "all acorss Aisa" (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-70	A	8	13	9	4	The 43-year (1961-2003) analysis of annual total rainfall received in the Philippines made at the national meteorological service following the methodologies in the Manton, et al, 2001 study (in which I am a co-author) and using the homogenous data from a network of long-term,high-quality weather stations indicate the following: '-Weak increases (statistically not significant) in number of rainy days, extreme intensity and annual total rainfall along the eastern coast of the country; while '-Weak decreases (statistically not significant) in annual total rainfall along the western coasts of the country. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-71	A	9	0	10		table 10.2 full the blank cells (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-72	A	9	3		3	"Arabian Peninsula" is beyond the six sub-region (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Sub-regionalization revised
E-10-73	A	9	7	10	1	Table 10.2. Precipitation decrease or increase in Indonesia should be more clearly indicated in terms of seasonality and rainfall pattern, since Indonesia has two seasons with different rainfall variabilities and also two main rainfall pattern areas i.e. monsoonal pattern areas (mostly in south) and equatorial pattern areas (mostly	Much of these details are subject matter of WG I.

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						in north). The reference should be added (see suggestion by Hulme et al. (1999a,b) as stated on page 19 line 37-39). (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	
E-10-74	A	9	7			Table 10.2--Chinese parts, adding references: Wang et al., 2005; Zhao et al., 2005; Wang Shao-Wu, Wu Rongsheng, Yang Xiuqun, et al., 2005, Climate Change in China, Assessments of Climate and Environment Changes in China (I): Climate and Environment Change in China and their Projection, Dahe Qin et al., eds., China Science Press, Beijing, China, 63-103 (in Chinese); Zong-Ci Zhao, Ding Yihui, Luo Yong, and Wang Shao-Wu, 2005, Recent studies on attributions of climate change in China, Acta Meteorologica Sinica, 19 (4), 389-400; (Zong-Ci Zhao, National Climate Center)	Most of the suggested references added
E-10-75	A	9	7			table 10.2, column 3 and row 7: the sentence "more pronounced in winter than summer" should be replaced with the following: 0.027°C rise in annual mean per year, 0.021°C rise in summer mean per year and 0.059°C rise in winter mean per year. (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Much of these details are subject matter of WG I. The sentence referred to is technically correct here.
E-10-76	A	9	7			Page 9, table 10.2, column 5 and row 7: the reference "Huang et al., 2005" should be added to the reference list. Mei Huang, Gongbing Peng, L.M. Leslie, Xuemei Shao and Wanying Sha, 2005. Seasonal and Regional Temperature Changes in China over the 50 Year Period 1951 – 2000. Meteorology and Atmospheric Physics 89, 105–115 . (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Has been added.
E-10-77	A	9	7			In Table 10.2 I do not understand next to the Petersen et al 2002 reference - what do you mean by: 1-2degC rise per century, but "no change during 1900-96"? (Hayley Fowler, Newcastle University)	Has been revised, 1-2 deg C removed.
E-10-78	A	9	7			For the Karakoram and Hindu Kush region Archer and Fowler (2004) found that there has been an increase in winter precipitation and increase in summer precipitation since 1961. Annually, there is evidence of increases in precipitation since 1961, with increases of over 10% per decade in the northern part of the region. In winter, the increases are larger, with statistically significant increases of over 15% per decade since 1961. There is evidence that winter rainfall in the region is linked to the NAO and that the increasing strength of the NAO in recent years has caused the increase in winter rainfall in the region. (Hayley Fowler, Newcastle University)	As of this revision the reference has not come out of press.
E-10-79	A	9				T10.2: NW China - temperature - 0.7degC increase from 1961-86 to 1987-2000. What does this mean? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Statement clarified as 0.7 deg C rise in average temperature from 1961-86 to 1987-2000

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-80	A	9				T10.2 is incomplete. The time periods need to be specified for each region and for each element - what period are changes in rainfall identified for NW China etc? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Table improved
E-10-81	A	10	0			The results of the most recent analysis of trends of rainfall data from 1961-2003 do not support the statement "Increase in annual rain beginning in 1980s and in number of rainy days in 1990s. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	The current entry in the table is only for a specific watershed in
E-10-82	A	10	0			table 10.2. Check the temperature increasing rate in Sri Lanka. 2C increase per year is too high (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Table entries corrected
E-10-83	A	10	0			Should an additional information for other countries in the Southeast Asia region (for example is desired, there is a published paper entitled Impacts of present and future climate variability on agriculture and forestry in the humid and sub-humid tropics by Zhao, Y., C. Yang, S. Wang and L.V. Tibig in Climatic Change (2005)b: 73-116 copyright Springer 2005. Suggested text in table is: Malaysia Waming trends in the last 50 years increases in some areas and decreases in others on Table 10.3 - Heat Waves '-Entry for Southeast Asia is the main finding of the Manton, et al, 2001 study. Can the results of Tran Vict Lien; 2002, Tran Vict Lien, 2005 and Cruz et al, 2005 be added to extend the period beyond 1998 since these are more recent works? Table 10.3 - Intense Rains and Floods '-Entry for Southeast Asia might mislead readers to conclude that increased rains caused landslides and floods only in 1990 and 2004. Long-term observation records for the whole country show that severe landslides could not be attributed to extreme rains alone. These are triggered by heavy rainfall (especially when tropical cyclone occurrences coincide with the intensification of the southwest monsoon) aggravated by degraded environment and by the geological characteristics of some areas (Amadore 2005a, PAGASA, 2001). '-Amadore 2005a cites seven catastrophic extreme events which had caused landslides and flashfloods resultting to numerous deaths and substantial damages to properties (and these were one each in 1999 and 2000, two in 2001 and one each in 2003 and 2004) in addition to the 1972 flood considered the greatest flood event in the Philippines in the 20th century. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services	Malaysian entries were added but reference is still incomplete. Existing statement applies to recent references Statement revised

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	
E-10-84	A	10	0			Reference: PAGASA 2005; Research and development in support to the GIS-based Climate Information System of PAGASA. A technical report submitted to the Department of Science and Technology (DOST) with funding support from DOST Grant-in-Aid. CAB T.P. No. 2005-1 (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Suggestions incorporated
E-10-85	A	10	0			Entry for the Philippines under "Change in precipitation" (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Suggestions incorporated
E-10-86	A	10	0			-During the 1980s and the 1990s there had been four strong warm events (1982-83, 1986-87, 1991-92 and 1997-98), effectively causing severe negative anomalies of rainfall in the Philippines (Amadore, 2005a, PAGASA, 2001) '-Also that, there is a time lag of ENSO impacts in the country and during the years following El Niño events, tropical cyclone occurrences in the Philippine Area of Responsibility would markedly decrease which result to less rainfall received in the country (Amadore, et al, 2002; PAGASA, 2001). Cited reference here is Amadore, L.A., A.M. Jose and L.V. Tibig, 2002; Application of climate information in the socio-economic sectors of the Philippines. WMO Bulletin, vol. 51, No. 4, 2002 '-Moreover, PAGASA 2001, Vol. 1, does not give any trend in onset of rainy season in the country. An updated analysis (extended to 2006) shows the same results. Variability of onset of rainy season in the Philippines is strongly affected by the occurrence of ENSO and the performance of the southwest monsoon. The Philippines has four climate types, with one type characterised by distinct dry and wet season. It is for the areas in the country with this climate type that PAGASA declares the onset of rainy season. The other climate types are characterised by rainfall more or less evenly distributed, with no dry season with very pronounced maximum rainfall from November from January, and with seasons not very pronounced. Suggested text is "Weak increases in number of rainy days and annual rainfall along the eastern coast but weak decreases in annual rainfall along the western coast." '-Cited reference, PAGASA 2001 is entitled Documentation and Analysis on Impacts of and Response to Extreme Climate Events and has six volumes: '-Vol. 1 : Climate, Climatology and Agrometeorology Branch T.P. No. 2001-2, 55 pp.	Suggestions incorporated

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						'-Vol. 2 : Health, CAB T.P. No. 2001-3, 40 pp '-Vol. 3 : Disaster Management, CAB T.P. No. 2001-4, 25 pp. '-Vol. 4 : Water Resources, CAB T.P. No. 2001-5, 91 pp. '-Vol. 5 : Environment, CAB T.P. No. 2001-6, 21 pp. '-Vol. 6 : Agriculture, CAB T.P. No. 2001-7, 30 pp. All these studies were funded by the Asian Disaster Preparedness Center in Bangkok, Thailand. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	
E-10-87	A	10	3			section 10.3. In this section, individual extreme event in recent years, instead of statistical trend, are used to reflect the change of extreme events. It might not represent the climatic trend. Especially the floods and droughts in south Asia and Southeast Asia; Typhoon in Cambodia and Vietnam; (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Not clear??
E-10-88	A	10	5			I thought that Mark New et al had submitted a paper from a workshop in Asia summarising changes in observed extremes - I think this is due to be published in JGR? This needs to be included here. (Hayley Fowler, Newcastle University)	Need the full reference and the paper.
E-10-89	A	10	9	11	1	Table 10.3. Key trend of intense rains and floods in Southeast Asia. There is no report on the situation in Indonesia regarding increased flood occurrence and susceptibility. Suggested source of data is the Ministry of Public Works (www.pu.go.id). (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Not clear what should we do??
E-10-90	A	10	9	11	1	Table 10.3. Key trend of droughts in South Asia and Southeast Asia. The cause of droughts in the sub-regions is mainly rainfall variability. However, those subregions do not only experience rainfall anomalies related to ENSO, but also Indian Ocean Dipole Mode Event (IOD or DME). Several studies on the later event suggest that severe drought in 1997/1998, particularly in western part of SE Asia could also associated with positive IOD/DME. Some references on these: (1) Murtugudde, R., J.P. McCreary, and A.C. Busalacchi. 2000. Oceanic processes associated with anomalous events in the Indian Ocean with relevance to 1997-1998. J. Geophys. Res., 105: 3295-3305. (2) Rao, S.A., S.K. Behera, Y. Masumoto, T. Yamagata. 2002. Subsurface Interannual Variability Associated with The Indian Ocean Dipole. CLIVAR Exchanges, 23:1-4. (3) Saji. N.H., B.N. Goswani, P.N. Vinayachandran, T. Yamagata. 1999. A Dipole Mode in the Tropical Indian Ocean. Nature, 401: 360-363 (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Not clear what should we do??

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-91	A	11	0			<p>Table 10.3 - Cyclones and Droughts</p> <p>The second part of statement "number of severe cyclones increased from 2.8 per year in 1970-89 to 4.2 per year in 1990-2003" is not from PAGASA, 2001. In fact PAGASA, 2001 states that there is a 20-year year periodicity of the Typhoon Extreme Index on TEI (defined as activity of typhoon extremes). There is below average TEI from 1948 to 1967, above the average TEI from 1968 to 1987 and below average TEI from 1988.</p> <p>'-Additional references are Amadore 2005a and Amadore 2005b (Amadore, L.A., 2005; Economic and Social Impacts of Tropical Cyclones and the Warning Systems - the Philippine Situation. WMO Tropical Cyclones Program Sub-project No. 25, 44 pp.).</p> <p>Suggested text is to drop the second part starting with the word "number" and instead add "with an increase of 4.2 in the frequency of cyclones entering PAR during the period 1990-2003". Reference is Anglo, 2005; Decadal changes in ENSO-related anomalies in tropical cyclone tracks in the Philippine Area of Responsibility, Proceedings of the First National Meteorological-Hydrological Convention, PAGASA, Quezon City, Philippines, 12-13 December 2005. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))</p>	<p>Entry revised</p> <p>Suggestion taken and new reference cited</p>
E-10-92	A	11	3	12	2	<p>How are "severe heat waves" defined? Heat waves are a function of average maximum temperature in a given place. For example, a maximum temperature of 35 degrees Celsius is considered normal in most areas in April/May in the Philippines, but may not be in some parts of Asia. One needs sustained daily occurrence of above threshold values to define a severe heat wave. The increasing trends of both maximum and minimum temperatures could not be defined as heat waves. The Manton, et al 2001 study defined the hot days and the warm nights as frequency of days with maximum / minimum temperature above the 1961-1990 mean 99th percentile.</p> <p>(Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))</p>	4AR Chapter is not a research paper (merely a review) that describes the technical details and definitions of how heat waves are derived.
E-10-93	A	11	6			<p>Batima et al (2005). Should this be a, b, or c. ALSO p38 ln40 and p39 ln9 (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)</p>	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-94	A	11	9			<p>Table 10.3--Chinese parts: adding references: Wang et al., 2006; Wang Xiaoling, Wang Yongmei, Ren Fumin et al., 2006, Interdecadal variations in frequencies of typhoon affecting China during 1951-2004, Advances in Climate Change Research, 2 (3), 135-138 (in Chinese); (Zong-Ci Zhao, National Climate Center)</p>	Some of the suggested references added

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-95	A	11				please explain ENSO abbreviation before use (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	
E-10-96	A	11				10.2.3: Heatwaves section is very short. More information needed to balance with the other extremes (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	New references added
E-10-97	A	12	6		18	add reference - Alper et al. 2002. The paradoxical increase of Mediterranean extreme daily rainfall in spite of decrease in total values. Geog. Res. Lett. 29(11), 31:1-4. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Failed to access the suggested reference
E-10-98	A	12	8	12	10	The rainfall case in Tokyo should be deleted if not sure it is really related to the global warming. It might be strongly influenced by local scale factors of urbanization. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	reference does not say so
E-10-99	A	12	13	12	13	"Changjiang River", "Changjiang River basin", "Changjiang basin" used in the text should be unified. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-100	A	12	16	12	18	This would contradict entry for Southeast Asia in Table 10.3 on Key Trend. Suggested text for Southeast Asia Key Trend is "The frequency of extreme rainfall events have declined in most stations and that there has been a weak decline in average intensity of 4 highest events each year although in some parts of Vietnam, the increased occurrence of extreme rains has caused flash floods and in the Philippines, continuous heavy rains in some areas caused by tropical cyclone occurrences and/or monsoons have led to landslides and floods." (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Suggestion taken.
E-10-101	A	12	16	12	18	The statement regarding declined extreme rainfall events is converse with Key Trends in Table 10.3 which indicates increased extreme events in Southeast Asia. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Statements revised.
E-10-102	A	12	18	12	30	-The Manton et al 2001 study included only three and five stations for Vietnam and the Philippines, respectively. The reason for this was that the criteria for station selection was rather stringent. Extending the analysis to include more observation stations which meet the criteria of a long and continuous homogeneous records and the period of analysis from 1998 to 2003, give the same results for rainfall trends. There are, however, single years during which tropical cyclones would come in succession to batter certain areas already rendered vulnerable as a result of a number of causes, both human and natural (i.e., natural faults and major fractures, etc.)	The statement was revised.

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	
E-10-103	A	12	22	12	30	As my comment on Table 10.3. that the cause of extreme events in Southe Asia and western part of Southeast Asia are not only related to ENSO, but also IOD/DME. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Failed to address this as not our priority but of WGI
E-10-104	A	12	26	12	29	-Manton et al, 2001 should not be cited here, this study is only on analysis of extreme climate events. Indices used were only on total annual rainfall, number of rainy days and frequency and intensity of top four rain events. No consideration was made on whether dry days were consecutive and persistent (definition of drought?). (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	The said reference deleted in the section
E-10-105	A	12	29		30	the last sentence could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-106	A	12	32			10.2.3.4: Should draw on WGI assessment on El Nino (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-107	A	12	35			change "have" to "has" (refers to frequency) (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-108	A	12	37	12	40	More recent references here are Amadore 2005a and Amadore 2005b. It is noted that Amadore 2005a is already listed in References as Amadore, 2005. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Further details on the reference is needed.
E-10-109	A	12	37	12	39	"Tibetan plateau" could not be listed with the Countries. It has been included in the countries, such as China, India, even Iran if it refers to one of the six sub-region (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-110	A	12	39			I don't undetrstand what build up of high risk areas means. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-111	A	12	47	12	48	Reference to Ruusian agriculture should be supported by reference to literature (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-112	A	12	47	13	8	No report on soil erossion risks in mountainous or hilly areas in Southeast Asia due to higher rainfall intensity. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	No reference available.
E-10-113	A	12	47			Vague sentence. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-114	A	12	47		48	This sentence is ambiguous. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-	A	12	51	12	51	"Qianhai" should be "Qinghai"	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
115						(Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
E-10-116	A	13	0			talbe 10.4 (1) two rows of "European North of Russia" may be deleted. (2) In column "Country", the 3 "Asia "may be deleted.(3) 0.1 to 0.3C increase in China is obviously lower than 0.8C rising in the text (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-117	A	13	1	13	5	A study at the International Rice Research Institute on the effects of observed climate change on rice crops (a 0.35°C- and 1.13°C- increase in annual maximum and minimum temperature during the 1973-2003 period) and yield shows decreased yields from increased nighttime temperature associated with global warming by at least 10% for each 1°C increase in growing-season minimum temperature. (Reference is Peng, S., J. Huang, J.E.Sheehy, R.E. Laza, R.M. Visperas, X.Zhong, G.S. Centeno, G.S. Khush and K.G. Cassman, 2004, Rice yields decline with higher night temperature from global warming, Proc. Nat'l Acad. Sci. (PNAS), Vol. 101, No. 27, 9971-9975 (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Suggested reference and material incorporated into the revised text.
E-10-118	A	13	2	13	5	this sentence is unclear, what's is mean (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-119	A	13	3			add 's' to decade and change 'attributed' to 'probbaly due' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-120	A	13	4			remove 'the' after comma. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-121	A	13	10			Section 10.2.4.2 - Much of this information related to permafrost has already been provided in WG1 Ch 4 (including information in table 10.4) or in the Polar region chapter. Consideration should be given to reducing repetition. (Sharon Smith, Natural Resources Canada)	Text revised
E-10-122	A	13	10			10.2.4.2: I'm surprised that there is no reference here to the major Asian rivers (Ganges, Mekong etc) (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	New references on this matter added
E-10-123	A	13	12	13	16	This paragraph could be deleted. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-124	A	13	12	14	33	No specific report on Southeast Asia sub-region regarding hydrology nad water resources. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	New references on this matter added
E-10-125	A	13	22			Gender sensitive. "Human-made". Again the TSU should standardize on this. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-126	A	13	30	14	5	the first two sentences may be moved to the end of the paragraph. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-127	A	13	31	14	1	melting due to engineering works is not climate change (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-128	A	13				T10.4: Pavlov (1994) reference is very old. Are there no updates available for NW Siberia and N Russia (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	New references added
E-10-129	A	14	5			since the 1980s' or just 'since 1980'. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Since the 1980s
E-10-130	A	14	7		22	melting glaciers. Half the references are pre-TAR. Any updates? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	New references added
E-10-131	A	14	7			add 's' to 'contribute' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-132	A	14	8	14	8	"wasting glaciers", is that means melting glaciers water? (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-133	A	14	10	14	12	this sentence is unclear. (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-134	A	14	10	14	12	From "There are over " to "Tajikistan rivers" may be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-135	A	14	11			split sentence after 'Republic' as such '...of the Republic. These provide...' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-136	A	14	12		13	The sentence is ambiguous. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-137	A	14	12			Should be Meshcherskaya and Blazkevich (1990) (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-138	A	14	12		13	Observations suggest that between 1908 - 1986 the Zerafshan glacier has receded by > 1km.' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Line updated as suggested.
E-10-139	A	14	13	14	13	delete "since 1908" (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-140	A	14	15	14	15	"Tibeatan plateau" here is not equal to the sub-region of "Tieatan Plateau". Same problem exists in other parts of the text. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-141	A	14	18			add 's' to 'outburst' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-	A	14	19			"A recent study....". The definite and indefinite articles are missing in many places	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
142						in the chapter. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	
E-10-143	A	14	20	14	22	There is also evidence that this is exacerbated by the cooling of summer temperatures in the main ablation season since 1961 - see Fowler and Archer (in press in J Climate). Ken Hewitt (2005) also provides evidence and explanation of the expansion of glaciers in the Karakoram region in recent years. There has been a recent reduction in summer flow in the River Indus and this can be explained by regression relations with reductions in summer temperature (see Fowler and Archer in press) - these are significant changes - for a 1degC cooling of mean temperature you get a 14% reduction in flow. (Hayley Fowler, Newcastle University)	References reviewed
E-10-144	A	14	20	14	22	Surely you also need to cite Barnett et al's recent Nature paper in here too? (2005) (Hayley Fowler, Newcastle University)	Failed to include the reference suggested
E-10-145	A	14	25			betrunking - what's this? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-146	A	14	25			betrunking - I am not familiar with this word. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-147	A	14	28			Siddiqi (2005) not in ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Reference corrected
E-10-148	A	14	37	14	37	Does "Boreal Asia" equal to the sun-region "North Asia" ? (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-149	A	14	39	14	46	From " The monsoonal Asia coast" to "logging and human settlement" may be deleted. They do not relate to the climate change or sea level rise according to the statement (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-150	A	14	48			Sin (2000) not in ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	References corrected
E-10-151	A	15	1			missing reference - ALSO p24 ln48 (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	References corrected
E-10-152	A	15	1			add reference (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	References corrected
E-10-153	A	15	8	15	15	From " Coral reefs" to "Southeast Asia is estimated to be US\$2.4 billion" may be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-154	A	15	9			Clark (1996) not in ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	References corrected
E-10-	A	15	10	15	22	Talaue-McManus, L. 2001 study cites a number of figures regarding Southeast	Reference cited

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
155						Asia's reef area. In her paper, SE Asia contains 25% of the world's chartered reefs and that the World Resources Institute's risk assessment of corals indicated that 86% of all reefs in the region are at medium or higher anthropogenic threat. Reference is Talaue-McManus, L., 2001; Global Change in the Coastal Zone: The Case of Southeast Asia, in Challenges of a Changing Earth (Steffan, W., Jager, J., Carson, D.J. and Bradshaw, C (eds.); Proceedings of the Global Change, Open Science Conference, Amsterdam, the Netherlands. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	
E-10-156	A	15	14			Burke et al (2002) not in ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	References corrected
E-10-157	A	15	17	15	22	From "Significant bleaching of Coral" to the end of the paragraph may be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-158	A	15	20	15	22	If Arceo et al 2001 is cited, why isn't the paper listed in References? (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Reference cited
E-10-159	A	15	22			Arceo et al (2000) not in ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	References corrected
E-10-160	A	15	24	15	35	these two paragraphs use same references and talk about one topic "mangroves", why not make them into one pragraphy and delete cross-references. (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-161	A	15	24	15	35	It is important to add report on Indonesia regarding coastal zone since Indonesia has the longest coastline in Southeast Asia and most coastal areas in Indonesia are facing degradaton or destruction. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-162	A	15	24	15	35	Duplicated paragraphs (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-163	A	15	26	15	28	From "repors on destruction of mangroves" to the end of the paragraph may be deleted. It is duplicate with next paragraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-164	A	15	26			Zafar (2005) not in ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	References corrected
E-10-165	A	15	28			Tablez et al (2003) not in ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	References corrected
E-10-166	A	15	30	15	35	This parageraph may be merged with last paragraph into one (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-	A	15	30	15	33	attach 'Approximately ... (Zafar, 2005)' to the end of Line 28	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
167						(Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	
E-10-168	A	15	30		33	One reference to (Zafar, 2005) would be sufficient at the end of the three sentences. Compare page 18 (lines 36, 38, 45) when references are required. Zafar is not listed in the references. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-169	A	15	33	15	35	delete 'There are Tables et al., 2003).'	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-170	A	15	46	16	2	Excessive dryness in the western part of Southeast Asia is not only associated with ENSO but also IOD/DME. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-171	A	16	8		10	The sentence “Many desert organisms in... under hotter conditions ” should give the reference. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-172	A	16	12	16	12	Terrestrial carbon fluxes is also an important part of climate change impacts on natrual ecosystem. Here, a paragraph about climate change driven terrestrial carbon carbon is suggested to inserted. "in the past two decades the growth rate of China's terrestrial NPP(Net Primary Productivity) was higher than the global average level, but NEP(Net Ecosystem Productivity) did not increased because of the warming-induced high increases in HR(Heterogrophic Respiration). Terrestrial ecosystem carbon uptake mainly occurred in boreal and temperate forests at northern middle and high latitudes, but there has no much these forests left in China, and the NEP of these remaining forests, such as in Da Xingan and Xiao Hingan Mountains and Changbai Mountains, decreased in the period 1981-1998 due to warming and decreased precipitation(Cao et al., 2003a;2003b)". (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Miss to check out this comment
E-10-173	A	16	23		29	From "In central arid Asia" to the end of the paragraph could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-174	A	16	31	16	44	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-175	A	16	31		44	The examples are all from Japan. Some examples from other areas in East Asia cited in the FOD should be included. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	New references added to to balance citations regionally
E-10-176	A	16	33	16	34	The sentence “The flowering date... now than 50 years ago ” should be deleted. It could not belong to biodiversity. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-177	A	16	36	16	37	Please add reference to the sentence "while distribution of southern broad-leavedin Japan has expanded"	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Nobuyuki Tanaka, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute (FFPRI))	
E-10-178	A	16	36			"while the distribution...." (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-179	A	16	40	16	44	Please add reference to the sentence "Flowering of Fjapanese ...in daily temperature." (Nobuyuki Tanaka, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute (FFPRI))	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-180	A	16	40	16	44	from " Flowering of Jappnese Apricot" to the end of the parapgraph could be deleted. It could not belong to biodiversity. Only the information of flowering being sensitive to daily temperature could reflect climate change too. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-181	A	16	44	16	44	Please add the information of a reference. ...changes in daily temperature (Nasu et al., 2005). Nasu A., Y. Shimizu and K. Omasa, 2005: Statistical analysis of the relationship between changes in plant phenology and daily mean air temperature in Japan under climate change. Journal of Agricultural Meteorology, 60(6), 1227-1229. (Kenji Omasa, The University of Tokyo)	Miss to check out this reference
E-10-182	A	16	51			BBC News not appropriate source? (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Deleted
E-10-183	A	17	2		4	Reference should be given for these sentences (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-184	A	17	3		4	this sentence is unclear. (Wei Xiong, Institute of Environment and Sustainable Development in Agriculture)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-185	A	17	4			indecies --> indices (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-186	A	17	16	17	17	There were more than one suburb of Metro Manila (which has 13 cities and municipalities) where there were serious outbreaks of not just malaria, but also of dengue (Ref. PAGASA, 2001, specifically in Volume for Health) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-187	A	17	22		25	should be in future section (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Moved to Future Section
E-10-188	A	17	36	18	26	Expert Review: On the Other stressors; Expert Reviewer suggests that the following description would insert the text. 1) Since the population growth in Asian countries with high population density is one of the main stressors for natural ecosystems, it should prevent the impacts of increasing population on vulnerable natural resources and environment. (Mitsuru Ando, Toyama University of International Studies)	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-189	A	17	36			10.2.5: This seems out of place here as it does not relate to 'Impacts of observed changes etc'. It would be more appropriate, heavily shortened, in 10.4.6 as a preamble to the discussion of the human dimension (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-190	A	17	38	17	40	From "Accutate understanding" to "in altering terrestrial ecosystem" may be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-191	A	17	41	17	41	change 'terrestrial ecosystems' to 'terrestrial and marine ecosystems' (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-192	A	17	50			Provide a suitable reference. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-193	A	18	11	18	14	Delete from "the future increase of" to the end of the paragraph. The future condition should not be appare in this part. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-194	A	18	23	18	26	delete this paragraph. The future condition should not be appare in this part. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-195	A	18	23		26	should be in section 10.3 (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-196	A	18	28	18	50	No reference to support the report regarding development activities. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Appropriate editing undertaken and few references added.
E-10-197	A	18	31		33	Re-phrase. One suggestion: "On the other hand, development contributes substantively in reducing vulnerability to climate change and in exacerbating the adaptive capacity of vulnerable sectors." Words such as "great" and "enhance" are used in a positive sense. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-198	A	18	35	18	41	give the reference to this paragraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-199	A	18	36		37	Provide a suitable reference. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-200	A	18	37	18	38	delet the sentence" The process taking place.....anthropogentic desertification" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-201	A	18	44		45	Provide a suitable reference. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-202	A	18	47	18	48	Middel East and Kuwait are not in the six sub-regions (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-	A	18	49	18	49	Only part of China could not be attributed into "arid countries"	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
203						(Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
E-10-204	A	19	2	19	22	Some observed facts should have the agreements with the IPCC WG1 Chapter 11. (Zong-Ci Zhao, National Climate Center)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-205	A	19	2			T10.3 South Asia - Regional Met Office, India (2003) not in ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Reference list corrected
E-10-206	A	19	6		16	Is this paragraph really needed? It could be deleted or significantly reduced (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-207	A	19	8			Add 'an' - '... sub regions of Asia on an annual...' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-208	A	19	9		16	long and not very clear sentence. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-209	A	19	16			adding references: Zhao et al., 2003; Zong-Ci Zhao, Akimasa Sumi, Chikako Harada and Toru Nozawa, 2003, Projections of extreme temperature over east Asia for the 21st century as simulated by the CCSR/NIES coupled model, Proceedings of International Symposium on Climate Change, eds. by WMO and CMA, WMO/TD No.1172, China Meteorological Press, Beijing, China, 158-164; (Zong-Ci Zhao, National Climate Center)	References were not added
E-10-210	A	19	39	19	40	Meteorologists / climatologists at PAGASA (especially those who provide seasonal climate forecasts for the country) are of a consensus that how would total annual rainfall in the Philippines increase in future as predicted by downscaling if as global temperature increase, the Pacific climate will tend to resemble a more El Niño-like state (Refer to lines 9-10, p. 20)? The main impact of El Niño or even just an unsustained less than 1 degree Celsius-rise in sea surface temperatures in the Niño 3.4 region is a large deficiency in rainfall in most parts of the Philippines. An increase frequency of El Niños would mean deficiencies in rainfall in the Philippines (in agreement with lines 11-15, p.20). Additionally, should the projection that possible increase in cyclone intensity relative to the current threshold temperature is very likely (lines 23-25, p. 21) happen, it would still not result to a general increase in annual rainfall (as stated in lines 39-40, p. 19) as the effect of tropical cyclones in the Philippines in terms of rainfall is dependent on times of the year these occur. The months of June to December are considered the typhoon season, notably September, October and November during which these systems generally move west to west-northwest and areas mostly affected are the northern part of the country (Amadore, 2005b). Suggested text if this statement will still be in this section is "A study indicates a projected increase in the total annual rainfall in the Philippines based on downscaled GCM (names of particular GCMs used) results (Cruz, et al, 2005).	Suggested revised statement accepted

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	
E-10-211	A	19	42	19	45	The terms of drier and wetter months are not clear. Which part of Asia will have such condition? Referring to Table 10.5, projected changes in the sub-regions will be different. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Clear and detailed enough
E-10-212	A	19	42		45	which sub-regions is this referring to? Or is it the whole region? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-213	A	19	42		43	What region does this sentence refer to. Why is it in a stand-alone paragraph? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-214	A	20	6	20	15	Similar with comments no.3, 5, and 9 regarding the effects of IOD/DME. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-215	A	20	13	20	14	adding references: Xu et al., 2004; Luo et al., 2005; Xu Ying, Gao Xuejie, Zhao Zong-Ci and Ding Yihui, 2004, 21st century impact of greenhouse effects on the middle and lower reaches of the Yangtze River, Climate Change and Yangtze floods, eds. by T.Jiang, L.King, M.Gemmer and Z.W.Kundzewicz, SP Science Press, Beijing, 73-81; Luo Yong, Zhao Zong-Ci, Xu Ying, gao Xuejie, and Ding Yihui, 2005, Projections of climate change over China for the 21st century, Acta Meteorologica Sinica, 19 (4), 401-406; (Zong-Ci Zhao, National Climate Center)	Most suggested references were not accessible
E-10-216	A	20		21		Section 10.3.2 - could be substantially shortened (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Section was condensed.
E-10-217	A	20				T10.5 - is there a reference for this table? Could also be shortened (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	
E-10-218	A	21	0			delete fig 10.2 (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
E-10-219	A	21	4			what is the current threshold temperature? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	
E-10-220	A	21	8			Additional material: 'Kelly and adger (2000) discussing evidence of future change in cyclone impacts on the coast of Vietnam conclude that, though changes in frequency and intensity can be expected, impacts in any location will be determined by any shift in the characteristic cyclone tracks. Kelly, P. M. and Adger, W. N. (2000) Theory and practice in assessing vulnerability to climate change and facilitating adaptation. Climatic Change, 47, 325-352. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Suggestion included in the text.
E-10-	A	21	10	21	16	give the referrences to this paragraph	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
221						(Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
E-10-222	A	21	11	21	13	does "eastern half of China" equal to the sun-region "eastern China" ? (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-223	A	21	12	21	13	Middel East is not in the six sub-regions (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Included in the FGD
E-10-224	A	21	18	21	25	this part could be moved and merged into second and third paragaphs in page 19 (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-225	A	21	21			change 'enhance by' to 'increase by' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-226	A	21	28			throughout' one word. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-227	A	21	30	21	37	delete this paragraph. Last paragraph has said hot days will increase all of the Asia. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-228	A	21	34			... to be enhanced by...' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-229	A	21	49	21	50	The title of the figure should clearly indicate the sub-region or country in which it is valid. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-230	A	22	0			delete fig 10.3 (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Figure replaced
E-10-231	A	22	1	22	15	The maps should be bigger so it would be clearer. The legend is not clear. It would be better if the legend could be placed outside rainfall countour (map). It should also be indicated clearly which one (left or right figure) is of 2080-2100 period and which one is of 1981-2000 period. The title of the figure should clearly indicate the sub-region or country in which it is valid. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Figure replaced
E-10-232	A	22	18			10.3.3: This general discussion of global sea level rise does not for the most part address the likely experience of Asia. If all that can be said is the reference in line 29 then the point needs to be made that more work is needed urgently. I do however reckon that there are many regional studies that should be cited here. This warrants serious attention. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Revised
E-10-233	A	22	20	22	22	delte from "with over a" to "than ever before" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-234	A	22	20		29	Not specific to Asia. Should probably be in Chapter 6 if not there yet. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	This part was deleted
E-10-	A	22	20		34	could be substantially shortened	Section was condensed

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
235						(Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	
E-10-236	A	22	36	22	42	delte from "For a quadruping" to "21st Century()" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Para was deleted
E-10-237	A	22	36		44	Not specific to Asia. Should probably be in Chapter 6 if not there yet. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Statement deleted
E-10-238	A	22	36		44	As there is little agreement on the pattern of sea-level rise, include latest references. Refer to other relevant chapters too. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Section revised
E-10-239	A	22	42	22	44	move this sentence to last papagraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-240	A	22	47			10.3.4: I don't see the point of including this material here. It should be omitted and, if needed beyond what if already there, a cross reference to the WGI source given in the introduction to 10.3.1. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Section condensed
E-10-241	A	22	49	23	7	This could be deleted. This much detail is not needed about SRES. Should concentrate more on socio-economics (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Section condensed
E-10-242	A	22	49			Please provide the reference for the SRES report (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Reference provided.
E-10-243	A	24	26	24	38	No specific report on Southeast Asia sub-region regarding crop production. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Reference added
E-10-244	A	24	32	24	32	Please add the following sentence about case studies on the rice yields in Japan. Doubled CO2 climates could decrease rice yield even in irrigated lowland in many prefectures in central and southern Japan by 0-40% (Nakagawa et al., 2003) through the occurrence of heat induced floret sterility (Matsui and Omasa, 2002). Nakagawa, H., T. Horie and T. Matsui, 2003: Effects of climate change on rice production and adaptive technologies, In 'Rice Science: Innovations and Impact for Livelihood.' International Rice Research Institute, pp.635-658 Matsui, T. & K. Omasa, 2002: Rice (Oryza sativa L.) cultivars tolerant to high temperature at flowering: Anther characteristics. Annals of Botany, 89, 683-687 (Kenji Omasa, The University of Tokyo)	Suggestion included
E-10-245	A	24	36			please specify what is 'the most conservative climate projections'. SRES? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Revised
E-10-246	A	24	44			Why (including Japan)? (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-247	A	24	44			increases"? do you mean 'deacreases'?' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-248	A	24	48			missing reference (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Reference added.
E-10-249	A	24	50	24	50	Check the words "Changjiang River Valley", "Changjiang River basin", "Changjiang basin" and "Changjiang Valley" in the text. It should be unified. Samillar to the words " Yellow River basin" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-250	A	25	4			28 million hectares in South Asia and East Asia? (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-251	A	25	23			Is Therendash et al (2005) Tserendash et al 2005 in the ref list? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-252	A	25	29	25	35	delete from "In 2002, " to "in commercial fishery acitivity" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-253	A	25	31		32	South Asian and Southeast Asian countries. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-254	A	25	37			Remove s from 'tunas' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-255	A	25	44	25	46	What about the effect of El Nino in terms of colder sea surface temperature in the South and Southeast Asia? (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Too much technical details – subject matter of WG I
E-10-256	A	25	50			What does 'their' refer to? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised
E-10-257	A	26	4	26	9	delete this paragraph,They are only general expression (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Section revised and condensed
E-10-258	A	26	4			add 's' to 'chain', I.e. 'food chains' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-259	A	26	7			change '...layer thickness and predators to climate...' to layer thickness, and predator response (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised according to suggestion
E-10-260	A	26	11	26	16	delete this paragraph,They are only general expression (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Section condensed
E-10-261	A	26	18	26	24	delete this paragraph,They are only general expression (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Section condensed
E-10-262	A	26	28	26	30	delete from "There are " to "in many countries". (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Section condensed
E-10-263	A	26	35	26	38	delete from "for example," to end of the paragraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Section condensed
E-10-	A	26	40	27	3	No reference to support the report regarding future food supply and demand.	Reference provided.

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
264						(Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	
E-10-265	A	27	5			10.4.1.5: The confidence in the predictions of extreme events given here is rather at odds with the previous assessment in 10.3.1. Consistency is needed. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Text revised
E-10-266	A	27	7	27	10	delete 'Many recent ... with ENSO.' (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Done
E-10-267	A	27	12	27	15	Rainfall deficits [as a result of increased frequency and intensity of El Niño-related droughts] resulting to dramatic drops in crop yields and livestock numbers in rainfed production systems are also common in the humid areas in Southeast Asia (i.e. Philippines, Malaysia, etc.), not just in the semi-arid Asia (PAGASA, 2001; Zhao, et al, 2005) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Partly taken on board.
E-10-268	A	27	17	27	22	CO2 enrichment and changes in temperature may also affect ecology, the evolution of weed species over time and the competitiveness of C3 vs C4 weed species (Ziska, L.H., 2003a; Evaluation of the growth response of six invasive species to past, present and future atmospheric carbon dioxide. J. Exp. Bot. 54: 395-404 and Ziska, L.H., 2003b; Rising carbon dioxide: implications for weed-crop protection, p. 615-634. In T.W. Mew et al, (ed) Rice scienceL innovations and impact for livelihood. proceedings of the IRRI Conference, Beijing, China, 16-19 Sept. 2002 - IRRI, Los Baños. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	The suggested material included
E-10-269	A	27	18			... would result in increased pet populations...' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	What is needed here??
E-10-270	A	27	19			add s at the end of 'population' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-271	A	27	25	27	29	delete from "This will have a " to end of the paragraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-272	A	27	34	28	9	No description regarding the future situation in Southeast Asia. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	New references not found
E-10-273	A	27	34			10.4.2.1: the discussion of imapcts here needs to be supported by discussion of potential run off variations etc in 10.2.4.2 (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Suggestion done.
E-10-274	A	27	36			change 'characterized' to 'caused' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised
E-10-	A	27	44	27	47	"the Euphrates and Tigris" are out of the six-sub regions	West Asia now included

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
275						(Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
E-10-276	A	27	49	27	50	Increasing competition for water among agriculture, industry and the rapidly growing urban population will force many rice farmers to use less water and it has been estimated that by 2025, 15-20 million ha of irrigated rice will suffer some degree of water scarcity. (Reference is Tuong, T.P. and B.A.M. Bouman, 2003; Rice production in water scarce environments. In J.W. Kijne et al (ed) Water productivity in agriculture: limits and opportunities for improvement. CABI Publishing, Wallingford, U.K. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Cant find the material
E-10-277	A	28	20			Huang et al 2005 missing from ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Was included
E-10-278	A	28	24	28	25	The statement is specific for Central and East Asia. It is suggested to add with "particularly in Central and East Asia" (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	OK
E-10-279	A	28	28			TNCR (2002). It is TNCRF (2002) in ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Corrected
E-10-280	A	28	29			remove second 'in' ('in a 10 to 15%') (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-281	A	28	30			comma after 'area'; add 'an' before 'increase'; add comma after 'flow' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-282	A	28	31	28	34	add " of China" after "Inner Mongolia", and "Qinghai Province" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Done
E-10-283	A	28	31			comma after 'areas' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Done
E-10-284	A	28	32			comma after 'Mongolia; comma after 'shorten' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Done
E-10-285	A	28	36			change 'be larger' to 'grow' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Done
E-10-286	A	28	37		39	Unclear sentence. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised.
E-10-287	A	28	41	28	44	delete from "The per capita" to "due to consumption" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Text revised
E-10-288	A	29	0	30		unified the usage "one meter" and "1m", "100cm" in the text (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	OK
E-10-289	A	29	1	29	8	Since the occurrence of extreme climatic events will increase (as stated in section 10.3.2.), it is confident to project increased flood and drought risks in the future	OK

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						particularly in Southeast Asia. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	
E-10-290	A	29	3			after 'For example,' add 'the' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised
E-10-291	A	29	4			change 'reduce' to 'decline' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Done
E-10-292	A	29	4			add 'the' before 'Red' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Done
E-10-293	A	29	13			10.4.3.1: Here is the material on regional sea level change that I was expecting in 10.3.3. There needs to be some re-allocation of material so the distinction between the change in the environment and the environmental impact is clear (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Retained in this section
E-10-294	A	29	15	29	29	sea level rise in this paragraph should be compared with that in section 10.3.3. It seems there some difference between the two parts (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Done
E-10-295	A	29	17			White et al., 2005 is not in references. Woodroffe et al. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Deleted
E-10-296	A	29	17			White et al (2005) missing from ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Deleted
E-10-297	A	29	17			replace greenhouse effect with global warming or climate change (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Text revised
E-10-298	A	29	21			'one-time' do you maybe mean by a factor? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised
E-10-299	A	29	31	29	33	delete 'In Asia, erosion ... shoreline retreats.' (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Retained
E-10-300	A	29	37			0.5 mm - is this correct or do you mean 5mm (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Check please
E-10-301	A	29	40			expected to accelerate BY' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Edited
E-10-302	A	29	45		47	delete first two sentences of paragraph. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Deleted
E-10-303	A	29	49			it is not clear what the two numbers refer to, India and Japan? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised
E-10-304	A	30	9	30	23	This paragraph needs serious English editing which can not be done using this spreadsheet. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Para edited.
E-10-	A	30	25	30	31	No reference regarding the statement.	It's a summarizing statement

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
305						(Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	
E-10-306	A	30	25	30	31	move this paragraph to the beginning of the sub-section in page 29. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Retained because it's a summarizing statement
E-10-307	A	30	25		31	delete (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Retained see previous comments
E-10-308	A	30	30	30	31	Calcification rate of reef-dominated communities may decrease by as much as 21% by the time CO2 is expected to double. Moreover, mangroves in Southeast Asia have an estimated loss rates of 1 to 4% per year, and at these present rates, the region will lose its mangrove forests by 2030 (Talaue-McManus 2001) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Reference cited.
E-10-309	A	30	35	30	36	delete from "Most types of" to "river sediment flux" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Sentence deleted
E-10-310	A	30	35			delete first sentence of this paragraph. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Deleted
E-10-311	A	30	38		39	change '...reservoirs construction on the rivers.' to '... reservoir-construction up-river.' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Done
E-10-312	A	30	39	30	39	What range does "In the Tibetan Plateau and adjoining regions" represent for? (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Not clear??
E-10-313	A	30	44			delete first sentence of paragraph (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Deleted
E-10-314	A	30	46			delete the word 'such' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Deleted
E-10-315	A	30	47			populationS (plural) (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-316	A	31	3	31	4	delete the sentence from "Global warming and" to "salinity ect." (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Deleted
E-10-317	A	31	8			'estuarine' ??? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Edited
E-10-318	A	31	11		38	Shouldn't the coral-reefs material be in the next section? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	It can but it can also be in the current section
E-10-319	A	31	29		30	'Breaching' is this correct? Or do you mean Bleaching? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK edited
E-10-320	A	31	35	31	38	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Retained
E-10-	A	31	35			8-10mm/a. What is 'a'?	Edited

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
321						(David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	
E-10-322	A	31	37			storminess. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Edited
E-10-323	A	32	5	32	40	No specific description regarding the projected forest condition in Southeast Asia, particularly in Indonesia (as it has the largest forest area in Southeast Asia). Studies by CIFOR, ICRAF and other forest research institution could provide detailed information. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Did not find any references
E-10-324	A	32	7	32	7	Please add reference to the sentence "Up to 50% ... to climate change" (Nobuyuki Tanaka, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute (FFPRI))	References added
E-10-325	A	32	7	32	7	delete the first sentence from "Up to 50%" to "due to climate change." (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Retained with references added
E-10-326	A	32	7			change "Asia regions's" to "Asia's" (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-327	A	32	11			change 'a large population of many other species' to 'many population of other species' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-328	A	32	12	32	12	The word "will" is too stronge (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	OK edited
E-10-329	A	32	12			change 'exterminated' to 'extirpated' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-330	A	32	16	32	16	a sentence is suggested to inserted after "... (Liu et al., 1998)". "It was suggested that future vulnerability of forest in China mainly distribute in the southwest China, south China, central China, and the northeast China, based on a synthesis index method(Li et al., 1996). (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Can't find the reference to validate the suggested insertion
E-10-331	A	32	16			what do you mean by 'Areal coverage'? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Area covered
E-10-332	A	32	17			instead f 'reduce by' use 'decline' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-333	A	32	18			place comma befor and after 'beech tree (Fargus crenata)' and write 'the' before 'beech' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-334	A	32	20	32	23	add " reference for Indonesia's forests (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Sentecede deleted reference can't be found

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-335	A	32	24	32	28	<p>Please replace “Lines 24-28, Hajima et al. (2005)...with soil nitrogen effect.” by the following sentences.</p> <p>There is a possibility that NPP estimated without soil nitrogen effects was overestimated about 20% in 2050 to about 30% in 2080 under A2 and B2 scenarios in comparison with that estimated with insufficient soil nitrogen in Japan (Hajima et al. 2005). In the elevated atmospheric CO2 experiment, inadequate available nitrogen constrained biomass of Japanese white birch seedlings (Kitao et al. 2005). The response of plant biomass accumulation to elevated atmospheric CO2 is influenced by variability in availability of soil nitrogen and deposition of atmospheric nitrogen (Oren et al., 2001; Reich et al., 2006).</p> <p>Hajima T., Y. Shimizu, Y. Fujita and K. Omasa, 2005: Estimation of net primary production in Japan under nitrogen-limited scenario using BGGC model. Journal of Agricultural Meteorology 60(6), 1223-1225.</p> <p>Kitao M., T. Koike, H. Tobita and Y. Maruyama, 2005: Elevated CO2 and limited nitrogen nutrition can restrict excitation energy dissipation in photosystem II of Japanese white birch (<i>Betula platyphylla</i> var. <i>japonica</i>) leaves. Physiologia Plantarum 125, 64-73.</p> <p>Oren R, Ellsworth DS, Johnsen KH, Phillips N, Ewers BE, Maier C, Schafer KVR, McCarthy H, Hendrey G, McNulty SG and Katul GG, 2001: Soil fertility limits carbon sequestration by forest ecosystems in a CO2-enriched atmosphere, NATURE 411, 469-472.</p> <p>Reich PB, Hobbie SE, Lee T, Ellsworth DS, West JB, Tilman D, Knops JMH, Naeem S and Trost J, 2006: Nitrogen limitation constrains sustainability of ecosystem response to CO2, NATURE 440, 922-925.</p> <p>(Kenji Omasa, The University of Tokyo)</p>	Text revised
E-10-336	A	32	25			<p>indicate' not 'indicated' (cited literature are referred to in present tense). (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)</p>	Text was revised
E-10-337	A	32	26			<p>change 'because of neglect of soil nitrogen effects' to 'because soil nitrogen effects were not considered'. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)</p>	Text revised
E-10-338	A	32	26			<p>"Concretey"? I doubt if anything can be concrete in modelling. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)</p>	Text revised
E-10-339	A	32	30		31	<p>Re-phrase to make the sentence clear. Suggestion: "Annually 12,000-38,000 wild fires burn 0.5-3 million hectares of forests in North Asia." (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)</p>	Text revised and moved
E-10-340	A	32	30			<p>chane 'the area' to 'an area' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)</p>	OK

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-341	A	32	33	32	40	delete from "Higher temperaure" to end of the paragraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	OK
E-10-342	A	32	33			duration of wild fire season is growing by 30%' should be 'the wild fire season is expected to extend by 30%' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised
E-10-343	A	32	33			add full stop after citation. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised
E-10-344	A	32	34		36	Delete from 'If pset population...' to probability of forest' then start a new sentence with 'Fire will also increase' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised
E-10-345	A	32	34			change 'growth' to 'increased presence' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised
E-10-346	A	32	36			Delete sentence beginning with submergence (it adds no new knowledge) (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text revised
E-10-347	A	32	36			Change 'extinction' to 'extirpation and add 'probability' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text deleted
E-10-348	A	32	37		39	Provide a suitable reference. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Text deleted
E-10-349	A	32	39		40	Delete sentence beginning with The loss of (it adds no new knowledge) (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Text deleted
E-10-350	A	32	42			This section has nothing about endangered species. A MAJOR PROBLEM IN SECTION 10.4.4. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Materials on wildlife added though nothing on endangered species
E-10-351	A	32	44	32	46	delete from "Higher temperaure" to "with water scarcity" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	OK
E-10-352	A	32	45			add 's' after 'pasture' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-353	A	32	51	32	51	"a marginal decrease in pasture productivity" is not clear. (Nobuyuki Tanaka, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute (FFPRI))	Edited
E-10-354	A	33	1	33	5	delete from "Tranditional land use" to end of the paragraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Revised and retained
E-10-355	A	33	9	33	9	does the word "ice-edge" is "preglacial"? (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Revised
E-10-356	A	33	10	33	12	In Northeast China, the boundary of farming-pastoral transitional zone moves east-westward.It does not move north-southward. In North China, It moves north-southward (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Reference say it is so

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-357	A	33	15		16	delete sentence (it add nothing new). (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK
E-10-358	A	33	18	33	18	The title should be permafrost or permafrost terrain (Sharon Smith, Natural Resources Canada)	We stuck with original
E-10-359	A	33	18		43	Out of context. Relevance of this subsection to 'Natural ecosystems and biodiversity'? How will the thaw affect the ecosystem and diversity? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing undertaken
E-10-360	A	33	20	33	30	Reference is only made to rock and it is assumed that use of terms such as perennial frozen rock is more related to authors not writing in their own language. Many of the issues discussed in this paragraph and the following one are related to frozen soils and the discussion clearly needs to indicate that there are also concerns with changes to the thermal regime of frozen soils. (Sharon Smith, Natural Resources Canada)	Soils added
E-10-361	A	33	32	33	34	delete from "The most significant impacts" to "in the upper few meters" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Deleted
E-10-362	A	33	40	33	43	delete From "For a rise," to end of the paragraph. It does not belong to permafrost (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Text moved to appropriate section
E-10-363	A	33	48	33	50	delete 'Health outcomes ... meteorological "exposure".' (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Section revised
E-10-364	A	33	48	34	27	delete this paragraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Section revised
E-10-365	A	34	19			Figure 10.5 - Further explanation of the legend is required. Does category "permafrost likely to thaw" mean that there will be complete disappearance of permafrost in this region or that it may still exist in 2100 but with some thawing (i.e. reduction in thickness. As mentioned in previous comment, it must be clarified if complete disappearance is projected by 2100 or that under equilibrium conditions (which may occur later) permafrost is expected to disappear from this region. (Sharon Smith, Natural Resources Canada)	Figure improved
E-10-366	A	34	19			Figure 10.5 - A reference for this figure is required. Some further information regarding this figure is required especially since it is also shown in the TS (this should be reconsidered given a similar detailed treatment of permafrost is not given for other regions in the TS). It is not clear if the projected permafrost distribution is based on a transient simulation or represents equilibrium conditions. Many simulations only project the equilibrium permafrost distribution so that the distribution projected may occur sometime beyond the change in air temperature, i.e. after 2100. This needs to be clarified. (Sharon Smith, Natural Resources Canada)	Figure improved.

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-367	A	34	30	34	30	change 'Southeast Asian' to 'Southeast and South Asian' (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-368	A	34	33			transmission season for what? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Section revised
E-10-369	A	34	38	34	41	delete from "there is already " to end of the paragraph. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-370	A	34	43		44	References to be cited properly. Cite by agency or editors and not by titles. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-371	A	34	48			Matuschenko et al (2004) missing from ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	References corrected
E-10-372	A	35	7			add 's' after 'vector' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-373	A	35	17	35	20	delete from "For preventive action," to end of the paragph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-374	A	35	17			Cardiovascular disease as a water-borne disease? (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-375	A	35	23			10.4.6: This section needs strengthening. The structure is weak and it neglects critical references. The structure would be improved if 10.4.6.4 was moved to first place in the section as this provides a context then for the more specific discussions of migration etc. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-376	A	35	25			10.4.6.1: relevant article: Adger, W. N., Kelly, P. M., Winkels, A., Luong Quang Huy and Locke, C. (2002) Migration, remittances, livelihood trajectories and social resilience. <i>Ambio</i> , 31(5), 358-366. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Missed to review this reference
E-10-377	A	35	35		36	As this chapter is on Asia, the push factors behind migrations in Asia should assessed carefully. For example, in the last two decades 100 million Chinese moved from inland to the coastal zone because of economic factors. And in the coming decades, economic factors will be important in China and India. In Africa, one can expect droughts and famines to be the major drivers of migrations. In the Middle East, the wars are to be blamed. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Section revised
E-10-378	A	36	9			Zhou et al (2005) missing from ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Reference list revised
E-10-379	A	36	10	36	16	delete the sentence from "Existing stresses" to "and local ecosystems" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-	A	37	3	37	18	reference should be given for this paragraph	Appropriate editing made

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
380						(Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
E-10-381	A	37	22	37	33	For the Philippines alone, impact of tropical cyclones on the Philippine economy had increased to as much as 35 times from 1975 to 2002 (Amadore 2005b) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Was not incorporated but could be in the final version
E-10-382	A	37	22	37	33	delete this paragraph. It is about the current condition (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-383	A	37	22		25	Not specific to Asia. Should probably be in Chapter 7 if not there yet. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-384	A	37	23		24	references for reinsurance companies? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Reference provided
E-10-385	A	37	30		33	what does the IFRCRCS report tell us? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Statement revised
E-10-386	A	37	47			10.4.6.4: Suggest closing paragraph to lead in to more specific discussion, with this section placed first in Section 10.4.6 - "Study of social vulnerability provides a complementary approach to the study of climate impacts based on model projections and biophysical simulations. Adger et al. (2001) illustrate the approach through theoretical discussion and case studies based in Vietnam. The following sections detail specific examples of the human dimension of general relevance within Asia." Adger, W. N., Kelly, P. M. and Nguyen Huu Ninh (eds.) (2001) Living with Environmental Change: Social Vulnerability, Adaptation and Resilience in Vietnam. Routledge, London, 314pp. (There are other references that could be cited alongside this work) (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Suggestion incorporated in the FGD
E-10-387	A	37	49	37	51	Poverty should be mentioned as a confounding factor for vulnerability. (Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)	Done
E-10-388	A	37	49	38	6	Should be in chapter 7 section 7.4.3? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-389	A	37	49	38	8	delete this paragraph. It is only general concept. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-390	A	37	49	38	8	can delete this paragraph. Background information with old references (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-391	A	38	25			10.5: This material needs to be checked against Chapter 17. There are relevant references in 17 that should be included here. As it stands this section is selective and rather simplistic, sidestepping the complexities involved in identifying robust adaptive options. In places, there is no support from the literature cited for the statements that are made (e.g. 10.5.2.2, 10.5.2.3, 10.5.7). I suggest the authors	Revised as suggested

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						review Chapter 17, precis the main conclusions drawn there and cite evidence from Asia in support (or not) rather than trying to recreate discussion of this complex area. This is a major weakness of the chapter. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	
E-10-392	A	38	27	38	37	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-393	A	38	27	38	37	delete the paragraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-394	A	38	29			adopted --> adapted (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-395	A	38	43		44	doesn't make sense (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-396	A	39	0			tabale 10.8 give the special region for "Use of more drought-tolerant crop varieties" and "use of salt-tolerate crop varieties". "Pasture" should be "pasture". Check "Breeding fish to high water temperature" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-397	A	39	1	39	3	Table 10.8. Adaptation measures by farm management. Altered application of nutrients/fertilizer and insecticide/pesticide should be clearer in terms of chemical or biological ones. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Appropriate editing made
E-10-398	A	39	2	39	3	Table 10.8: Agricultural cropping: introduction of green manuring crops would also help in in soil quality, and moisutue retention capacity of land. Moreover, this would help in realizing the dream of diversifying income base by increasing the livestock herd. In addition, in South Asia, owing to injudicious use of production inputs in general, improving technical efficiency of input use would help in decreasing stressin future demand for production inputs. Moreover, altering the quantity and frequency of irrigations would help in minimizing the adverse impact of future temperature changes on crop production. (Muhammad Mudasser, Global Change Impact Studies Centre (GCISC))	Appropriate editing made
E-10-399	A	39	2	39	3	Table 10.8: Livestock Production: point 6 about native grassland species. This points does not seem valid as changing climate is increasingly making local species unsuitable. This is why a northward shift in cropping pattern is argued. If native species can withstand the climate change so successfully then threat of climate change is in itself appeased significantly. Hence, we even need to improve local varietes genetically to withstand the evident threat of adverse climate change. (Muhammad Mudasser, Global Change Impact Studies Centre (GCISC))	Appropriate editing made
E-10-	A	39	5			What is maintenance time for grasslands? And what does settled mean in this	Appropriate editing made

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
400						context? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	
E-10-401	A	39	7			close brackes and add full-stop after '2004a' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-402	A	39	7			add comma and the word 'such' after 'Measures' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-403	A	39				Table 10.8, first row: Tolerance to heat stress, and the matching of crop response to mean temperature changes, is also likely to be very important. See Challinor, A. J., T . R. Wheeler, P. Q. Craufurd, C. A. T. Ferro and D. B. Stephenson (2006). Adaptation of crops to climate change through genotypic responses to mean and extreme temperatures. Agric. Ecosys. Env. (accepted) (Andrew Challinor, University of Reading)	Cannot access the suggested reference
E-10-404	A	39				T10.8 - fishery - please clarify 'breeding fish to high water temperature'. Should it be something like 'breeding fish tolerant to high water temperature?' (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Revised as suggested
E-10-405	A	40	2			taken up' you mean 'considered'? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Yes.
E-10-406	A	40	3		4	small communities in East Asia, South Asia, and Southeast Asia. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	What of it??
E-10-407	A	40	6	40	7	The use of seasonal forecast information could also be very effective, particularly as this is the time scale which is relevant to subsistence farmers. See Washington, R., M. Harrison, D. Conway, E. Black, A. Challinor, D. Grimes, R. Jones, A. Morse, G. Kay, M. Todd (2006). African climate change: taking the shorter route. Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society. In press; and Challinor, A. J., J. M. Slingo, T. R. Wheeler and F. J. Doblas-Reyes (2005). Probabilistic hindcasts of crop yield over western India. Tellus 57A 498-512. (Andrew Challinor, University of Reading)	Can be included in the final version
E-10-408	A	40	6	40	7	delete this paragraph. It is not specialized for agriculture. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-409	A	40	6	40	7	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-410	A	40	6		7	relevance to this section? Recommend delete. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institure, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-411	A	40	6		7	can you provide any examples of such adaptation measures which are currently in place or planned for the future? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Section revised according to suggestion
E-10-	A	40	10	41	14	section 10.5.2. The three sub-sections are overlap in contents. Re-organize the	Appropriate editing made

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
412						section. Delete the parts that is not specialized for Asia. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
E-10-413	A	40	12	41	14	The 3 subsections (10.5.2.1, 10.5.2.2, 10.5.2.3) can be joined and streamlined to save space (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-414	A	40	14		17	how do these measures prevent water scarcity? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Section revised
E-10-415	A	40	20		35	Confusion between measures to avoid water scarcity, and measures to deal with water scarcity. Redo accordingly. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Section revised
E-10-416	A	40	37	40	47	No reference to support the statement. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Unfortunately was able to find only one reference
E-10-417	A	40	49	41	14	No reference to support the statement. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Unfortunately was able to find only one reference
E-10-418	A	40				10.5.2.2 - there are no references in this section (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Unfortunately was able to find only one reference
E-10-419	A	41	28	41	36	delete the paragraph. Or at least delete from " ICZM concept" in line 31 to "the past few years" in line 35. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Unfortunately was able to find only one reference
E-10-420	A	41	35		36	concepts and principles (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	What about ??
E-10-421	A	41	39			Section 10.5.4 is a very limited address of the issue (it addresses only forests). What sort of planning is needed to protect natural systems and biodiversity in Asia given the specific problems. For example, ther has been much discussion onf the effect of sea rise on mangroves. What can or should be done to mitigate this? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Section revised
E-10-422	A	41	47		48	why must deforestation and degradation control programs be accompanied by measures to increase agricultural productivity and sustainability? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	There are areas where expansion of agriculture is the main cause of deforestation
E-10-423	A	41	47		51	No references (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Few references added.
E-10-424	A	41				10.5.2.3 - there are no references in this section (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Few references added.
E-10-425	A	42	5		14	No references (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Few references added.
E-10-426	A	42	5		16	belongs in section 10.4.5 (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Section moved to appropriate section

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-427	A	42	25	42	27	delete the paragraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-428	A	42	25			warning/warning' ??? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-429	A	42	26			change 'the' to 'a' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-430	A	42	26		27	Avoid being prescriptive. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-431	A	42	30			10.5.6: Somewhere here there needs to be discussion of adaptive capacity. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-432	A	42	32		34	See comment for p. 35, lines 35-36. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	OK
E-10-433	A	42	44	43	1	This is the only regional chapter that does not take up substantially the issues related to tourism, apart from p 42 line 44 sq which relate exclusively to the ski industry. It seems a paradox since Asia is the region where the greatest outburst in tourism is expected. If there is no research available it should at least be mentioned this is a lack... (Jean-Paul Ceron, CRIDEAU (Université de Limoges-CNRS-INRA))	OK
E-10-434	A	42	44	43	1	The ski industry is not a good example to show the human dimensions. It is not an important component of the tourism industry in Asia. Perhaps one should look at more evident examples, such as the poor coastal villages on Asian coasts or the squatter colonies in the large cities. What would be the climate impacts on these communities? (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	OK
E-10-435	A	43	4			Zhou et al (2004) missing from ref list (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Reference list corrected
E-10-436	A	43	24	43	42	One major constraint in most of the Southeast Asian countries is the integration/mainstreaming of climate change issues and concerns into national development plans. (from National self-assessments under UNDP projects) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Addressed
E-10-437	A	43	30		31	At the same time inequality to access resource...' change to 'At the same time inequality in accessing resources' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Addressed
E-10-438	A	43	31			change 'seriously' to 'serious' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Addressed
E-10-	A	43	35	43	36	These impacts *cannot* be assessed with precision. Also, 'lore' is not the	Addressed

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
439						appropriate word here. (Andrew Challinor, University of Reading)	
E-10-440	A	43	36			"Precise" is definitely not required. I doubt about accuracy too. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-441	A	43	41		42	Since policy makers are reading this chapter, cite the types (or examples) of hindering policies. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-442	A	43	45			10.6: These case studies should be shortened and placed in a box (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Section shortened
E-10-443	A	43	49	43	50	delete from "In Asia" to "to the ocean" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-444	A	43				10.5.7 - No references (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	References added
E-10-445	A	44	3			total' what? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Population
E-10-446	A	44	9	44	13	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-447	A	44	9		13	Break this paragraph into two sentences. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-448	A	44	11			add 'n' after 'a' before 'element' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-449	A	44	12		13	Li et al (2004). Which one? A or b? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Corrected
E-10-450	A	44	15	44	23	delete the paragraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-451	A	44	15		16	This sentence is ambiguous. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-452	A	44	16	44	16	change 'delta is' to 'delta located in the boreal zone is' (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-453	A	44	20		23	Sanvanville et al (2005) is this Sanlaville and Prieur (2005) (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Corrected
E-10-454	A	44	25		37	This paragraph needs re-writing. Sentences are too long and complex and there are too many English errors to correct (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-455	A	44	26	44	26	delete 'located in the boreal zone and' (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-	A	44	28	44	28	Words "originating from Tibetan Plateau".is exact.For exmample, the Zhujing	Appropriate editing made

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
456						River does not start from Tibetan Plateau. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
E-10-457	A	44	41			add comma before and after 'in turn' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK done
E-10-458	A	44	45			what are production goals? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Economic goals
E-10-459	A	45	0			Table 10.9. (1) The last column. Satt-Arab is not in the six-sub regions. (2) row 5, column 9,10, 11, The unit has been given at the first column. (3) Row 8 population. Notes the number within the brackets in column 3 to 8. (4) row 9. Give the unit of the row. (5) Row 12 Check the unit of the row. m, or mm/a.(6) row 15. The types of natural hazards listed in the row is not complete. (7) last row. Give the unit of the data in columns 3,4,5. (8) give the referencs of the data in the table (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Table revised
E-10-460	A	45				T10.9 - XX defined but not mentioned in the table (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Table revised
E-10-461	A	46	4			change '17% of the mountain area as compared...' to ' 17% of the Himalayan mountain area. This, compared...' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-462	A	46	11	46	11	"the region" refers to where? the Indo-Gangetic plains? (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	South Asia
E-10-463	A	46	13		20	Table 10.10. Provide examples of rates of retreat of glaciers outside Asia (e.g. Alpine, Arctic) to show that Himalayan glaciers are indeed receding faster. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Revised the section
E-10-464	A	46	15		16	Delete sentence beginning with "the' and ending with 'rate' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-465	A	46	16			What does 'its' refer to? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Glaciers
E-10-466	A	46	17			100,000? You just said it will disappear. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Missed to clarify this one
E-10-467	A	46	22			remove 'the' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-468	A	46	22			I am not sure that this is true for the very large Karakoram glaciers in the western Himalaya. Hewitt (2005) suggests from measurements that these are expanding - and this would certainly be explained by climatic change in precipitation and temperature trends seen in the Karakoram region (Fowler and Archer, J Climate in press; Archer and Fowler, 2004) You need to quote Barnett et al.'s 2005 Nature paper here - this seems very similar to what they said.	Was unable to get hold of the suggested references will consider in the final version

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Hayley Fowler, Newcastle University)	
E-10-469	A	46	30			two-and-a-half fold per year' does not agree with next sentence and figure. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	It's actually hard to tell because the values given are averages over periods
E-10-470	A	46	35		36	Re-phrase. Most of the rivers in northern India originate from glaciers and about 70-80% of their water come from snow and glacial melts and the rest from monsoonal rains. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Appropriate editing made
E-10-471	A	46		51		only 3 references in the last 6 pages (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	More references added
E-10-472	A	46				only one reference in this whole section (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	More references added
E-10-473	A	47	34	49	33	The lack of references lends little weight to the arguments in this section and the issues are too general and not subregional specific. Some elaboration is required to show priority and urgency of issues. See further comments below. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	More references added
E-10-474	A	47	34			10.7: This section duplicates Chapter 18 without presenting a particularly Asian perspective. It is totally unreferenced and hence inappropriate for this review process in that the authors should be synthesising published material. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Section revised to include some Asian flavor
E-10-475	A	47	36	47	42	delete from "sustainable development represents" to " in terms of environmental quality". (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	More references added
E-10-476	A	47	36		45	could delete these lines and start the section from 'Some of the key issues...' (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Section revised
E-10-477	A	47	44			change 'strongly support to solve the environmental issues' to 'strongly support solving environmental issues' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Section revised
E-10-478	A	47	45	48	2	Perhaps a couple of statements on the priority and urgency in the subregions of key issues and challenges would be helpful, e.g. bullet points #2 and #3 would apply to the whole of Asia, bullet points #1 and #5 are not equally applicable to Asia. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	OK
E-10-479	A	47	45	48	2	delete from "some of the key issues" in line 45 to line 2 in page 48. There are repeated in the bellow. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	OK
E-10-480	A	47		49		no references in section 10.7 (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	References added.
E-10-	A	47				F10.6 caption should be spaceboRne	OK

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
481						(Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	
E-10-482	A	48	11	48	11	The first sentence is not true. Instead of writing majority of population it would be better to write "A significant proportion". Moreover, we should try to use some statistics instead of such a very general statement. (Muhammad Mudasser, Global Change Impact Studies Centre (GCISC))	Appropriate editing made
E-10-483	A	48	11	48	18	Some quantitative characteristics of poverty and its dynamics would be useful. (Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)	OK considered
E-10-484	A	48	11			Provide a suitable reference. Also, expand a little to be more specific to subregions. For example, Japan and South Korea are clearly not in this category. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	OK done
E-10-485	A	48	11			change 'Majority of the Asian population are living' to 'The majority of Asia's population live...' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK done
E-10-486	A	48	23	48	31	Dynamics of GDP per capita over the last 50 years would be a good illustration to this section. (Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)	Section revised
E-10-487	A	48	23			Provide a suitable reference. Also, expand a little to be more specific to subregions. In this instance, rapid growth rates in China and India with their large population are the main concerns. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	OK done
E-10-488	A	48	27			change 'changed' to 'changing' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK done
E-10-489	A	48	28			change 'on' to 'in' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK done
E-10-490	A	48	34	49	2	Subsection 10.7.3. See comments for subsection 10.7.5. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Ok done
E-10-491	A	48	34			Section 10.7.3 ICT and socioeconomic growth. Comment: I completely agree with the authors in their estimation of ICT role for achievement of the purposes put by the Assessment Report. I realize as one of the main tasks of the expert - to not increase, and to reduce volume of the preparing Document. Nevertheless, I would like to submit a number of facts reflecting the positive tendency of rough development ICT in Tajikistan. The given data are taken from "Environmental Assessment, Tajikistani ICT Market Overview on March-April 2006", made by NGO "Public Fund Civil Initiative on Policy of Internet" (http://www.cipi.tj/). On the data of this organization, the quantity of Internet Service Providers in Tajikistan has grown with 4 in 2001 up to 12 in 2006 year. At the same time the number of GSM and CDMA Services	What do we do here??

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						<p>Providers grows. "The mobile phone services market is growing faster than any other new technologies market. There are 5 mobile companies currently implementing two formats GSM and CDMA in Tajikistan. All of them are joint-venture companies. Due to the geographical location of country none of them can currently cover the whole country by this service." The estimated number of Internet and Mobile phone users grows from, suitably, 2000 and 1500 in 2001 year to 80000 and 400000 in 2005 year. It is impressing growth. "Number of Internet cafes is growing constantly. From one hand this is a good indicator of Internet service market growth, but from another hand this shows that most of the people cannot afford purchasing computer for their own needs."</p> <p>Unfortunately, "... communication technologies implementations mainly are concentrated in urban area of the country, while rural area, where the most of population lives does not have access even to traditional telephony service. Besides this supplying electricity partly in the winter time creates additional obstacles in making use of the existing infrastructure."</p> <p>Despite of its rough growth ICT still remains inaccessible for majority of the population. It once again specifies necessity of struggle with poverty as one of primary factors of steady development and reduction of vulnerability to the global climate change. It is completely fairly underlined in other parts of the revised Assessment Report.</p> <p>(Shavkat Azimov, The Physical-Technical Institute of Tajik Academy of Sciences)</p>	
E-10-492	A	48	36	48	43	delete from "information and " to "of the marginalized sections" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	OK done
E-10-493	A	48	47			Prescriptive in "need to.." (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Revised.
E-10-494	A	49	25		33	Subsection 10.7.5. Both subsections 10.7.3 and 10.7.5 discuss the uses of resources. In Asia, there is still a very strong traditional ecological knowledge (TEK) and this factor should be examined and inoporated into the discussion on sustainable development. There are many examples - see the Millennium Ecosystem Assessment reports. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	OK done
E-10-495	A	49	28		33	The first sentence says what must be done and the second sentence says the challenge for most of Asia. This does not add up to the argument. More explanation is required. "Most of Asia" need to be elaborated given the diversity. Given present growth rates, China and India are going to consume more resources than Japan alone in future. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	Section revised.

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
E-10-496	A	49	36			T10.8 - improvement of agriculture infrastructure - suggested rewording of bullet 2 --> 'improve and extend the use of irrigation systems' (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	OK done
E-10-497	A	49	38			10.8.1: This is a rather selective view of uncertainties and bears no relation to specifically Asian issues. Again, it is unreferenced. What are the specific issues to do with model projections of Asian climate? Of impact model development? What uncertainties are there is assessing the human dimension? What of alternate approaches to vulnerability assessment that reduce the effects of modelling uncertainties, such as threshold analysis? (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	Section revised.
E-10-498	A	50	6			forcing' ??? (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	Yes
E-10-499	A	50	13	50	17	The relative contribution of these various sources of uncertainty can be measured. See Challinor, A., T. Wheeler, J. Slingo, and D. Hemming (2005). Quantification of physical and biological uncertainty in the simulation of the yield of a tropical crop using present day and doubled CO2 climates. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B 360 (1463) 1983-1989. (Andrew Challinor, University of Reading)	Reference cited
E-10-500	A	50	13	50	17	delete the pragraph (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Section revised
E-10-501	A	50	13			add 's' after 'source' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK done
E-10-502	A	50	30		37	Provide some suitable references and revise this paragraph in line with other relevant chapters. (Poh Poh Wong , National University of Singapore)	OK done
E-10-503	A	50	39	50	40	Table 10.11. It is suggested to add explanation under the table regarding L/M/H (low/moderate/high?) and the magnitude of -1, -2, +1, and +2 . (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	OK done
E-10-504	A	50	39	50	39	Please add remarks on the letters such as "+1/H" in Table 10.11 (Nobuyuki Tanaka, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute (FFPRI))	OK done
E-10-505	A	50	39			Explain the letters and numbers in the table, I.e. H=high and what the numbers are. (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK done
E-10-506	A	50	42			which ice sheet? (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Unclearified wil do in the final draft if reallyu needed
E-10-507	A	50				T10.11 - what do -/+,1,2,H,M,L mean? Please clarify in caption (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	OKvdone
E-10-	A	51	11	51	18	While this list of unknowns is accurate, it gives undue emphasis to emissions issues	Section revised.

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
508						that are not a central concern of this chapter. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	
E-10-509	A	51	13	51	14	This refers to agricultural sources of methane, I presume? A fully coupled crop-climate model is one way to address this research gap. See Challinor, A. J., T. R. Wheeler, T. M. Osborne and J. M. Slingo (2006). Assessing the vulnerability of crop productivity to climate change thresholds using an integrated crop-climate model. In: Avoiding Dangerous Climate Change. Schellnhuber, J., W. Cramer, N. Nakicenovic, G. Yohe and T. M. L. Wigley (Eds). Cambridge University Press. Pgs 187-194; and Slingo, J. M., A. J. Challinor, B. J. Hoskins and T. R. Wheeler (2005). Food crops in a changing climate. Phil. Trans. R. Soc. B 360 (1463) 1983-1989. (Andrew Challinor, University of Reading)	OK reference cited
E-10-510	A	51	13			Add full stop after 'addressed and change 'which' with 'These'. Place colon after 'include' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK done
E-10-511	A	51	26	51	42	Some mention of the need to address the human dimension, social vulnerability, is required here. (Philip Michael Kelly, University of East Anglia)	OK done
E-10-512	A	51	26	51	43	It is suggested that research on science and policy linkages related to climate change could be one of the priorities since the results of scientific studies would be less beneficial if they could not be used for policy making. It is also suggested to include cross-cutting issues of climate change impacts in research priorities. (Erna Sri Adiningsih, National Institute of Aeronautics and Space (LAPAN))	Added to priorities
E-10-513	A	51	32	51	33	Maintenance of already existing systematic observation facilities and support for data rescue activities should be included. Firstly, it has become increasingly difficult to maintain observation facilities if left solely to national meteorological services (NMS). Secondly, there are countries where historical weather records are archived in non-NMS databanks as in the case of Indonesia and the Philippines (Page, C.M., N. Nicholls, N. Plummer, B. Trewin, M. Manton, L. Alexander, L. Chambers, Y. Choi, D.A. Collins, A. Gosai, P. Della-Marta, M.R. Haylock, K. Inape, V. Laurent, L.M. Maitepierre, E. Makmar, H. Nakamigawa, N. Ouprasitwong, S. McGree, J. Palahad, M.J. Salinger, L. Tibig, T.D. Tran, K. Vediapan and P. Zhai; 2004; Data rescue in the Southeast Asia and South Pacific Region. BAMS, October 2004, 1483-1489 (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA)/Department of Science and Technology (DOST))	Ok added
E-10-	A	51	34	51	35	Add: heat waves	OK done

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
514						(Andrew Challinor, University of Reading)	
E-10-515	A	51	44	51		The importance of quantifying uncertainty has already been mentioned in the chapter. It is probably also worth a bullet point here. (Andrew Challinor, University of Reading)	OK done
E-10-516	A	51	46			change 'in respect of' to 'in respect to' (David Saltz, Desert Research Institute, Ben Gurion University)	OK done
E-10-517	A	52	0			There are 2 Li et al (200) - please differentiate and adjust text accordingly. (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Ok done
E-10-518	A	52	0			Amadore (2005); Batima et al (2004); FAO (2005); Gomboluudev (2002); Khomyakov (2001); Liu and Chen (2000); Milliman et al (1995); Nicholls and Goodbred (2004) not cited in text (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Reference list corrected
E-10-519	A	52	1	70	21	Reference: For Peak Oil Scenerio: 1) Campbell, C. J., 2005: Oil Crisis, Multi Science Pub Co Ltd. (Mitsuru Ando, Toyama University of International Studies)	Reference list corrected
E-10-520	A	52	43			There are loads of typos in Reference "Archer and Fowler, 2004", should be "Archer, D.R. and Fowler, H.J. 2004. Spatial and temporal variations in precipitation in the Upper Indus Basin, global teleconnections and hydrological implications. Hydrology and Earth System Sciences, 8(1), 47-61." (Hayley Fowler, Newcastle University)	Reference list corrected
E-10-521	A	53	48	53	48	adding two references here. Cao M.K, Tao Bo, Kerang Li, Xuemei Shao Interannual variation in china's terrestrial ecosystem carbon fluxes as a response to climate change in 1981-1998, Acta Botanica Sinica , 2003, 45(5):552-560 [Asia , ecosystem]. Cao M.K, Stephen D. Prieence, Kerang Li, Tao Bo, Xuemei Shao et al., Contribution of atmospheric CO2 increase and climate to terrestrial carbon uptake in China. Global Change Biology 2003, 9:536-546 [Asia , ecosystem]. (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Reference list corrected
E-10-522	A	61	33	61	33	adding a refrence here: Li K., Chen Y.F., Analysis of vulnerability of forest in China responded to global climate change. Acta Geographica Sinica, 1996, 51 Supplement, 41-49 [Asia,Vulnerability]. (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Reference list corrected
E-10-523	A	65	46	65	46	adding a reference here: Sha W. J, Shao X.M, Huang M. Climate warming and its impacts on natural regional boundaries in China in the 1980s, Science in China, D Series, 1099-1113 [Asia , temperature]. (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Reference list corrected
E-10-	A	70	5	70	5	insert 'Zhang, C.I., J.B. Lee, Y.I. Seo, S.C. Yoon, and S. Kim, 2004: Variations in	Reference list corrected

IPCC WGII AR4 SOD *EXPERT* Review Comments

Chapter- Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
524						the abundance of fisheries resources and ecosystem structure in the Japan/East Sea. Prog. In Oceanogr. 61, 245-265 (Suam Kim, Pukyong Natiponal University)	
E-10-525	A					Tao et al (2005) - there are two of these - please differentiate and adjust text accordingly (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Reference list corrected
E-10-526	A					section 10.4.2.1 - could include the Arnell (2002) paper on water availability (Clair Hanson, IPCC TSU)	Reference list corrected