



**IPCC WGII
Fourth Assessment Report
Climate Change Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability**
Expert Review of First Order Draft

Specific Comments

Chapter 10

December 5, 2005

Discussion of expert review comments and record keeping

IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT:

- AUTHORS BEGIN WORK ON THE COMMENTS IMMEDIATELY. SUBSTANTIVE COMMENTS NEED TO BE SEPARATED FROM NON-SUBSTANTIVE, AND THE TWO SHOULD BE TREATED DIFFERENTLY
- CONTACT IS MADE BETWEEN AUTHORS AND THEIR REVIEW EDITORS IN DECEMBER

Substantive comments

- The chapter writing team should discuss all substantive expert review comments, by email and/or at Merida.
- Substantive comments require full and proper consideration. The *Principles Governing IPCC Work* state that:
 - genuine controversies should be reflected adequately in the text of the Report and
 - it is the role of the Review Editors to advise the lead authors on how to handle contentious/controversial issues
- You must record the outcome of these discussions in this document, under the column 'Notes of the Writing Team'.

Non-substantive comments

- For non-substantive comments, a very brief entry should be made in the column 'Notes of the Writing Team'. The following terms are acceptable:
 - Addressed
 - Not applicable
 - Text removed
 - A tick to denote a comment has been addressed (somewhere on the document this should be stated)

General

- The record can be kept electronically, or with pen-and-paper.
- The document becomes part of the traceable account of the Working Group II Fourth Assessment. When completed to the satisfaction of the Review Editors, a copy should be returned to the TSU by the **28th February 2006**.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-0	A	0				<p>Co-chair and TSU comments</p> <p>There are 8 Contributing Authors, which is a low number for such a large continent. Regional imbalances are beginning to emerge. If we count CLAs+LAs+CAs, then we have 6 authors from China, 5 from Japan, but only 1 from India and none from Indonesia. It will look better in the final chapter if there is some contribution from currently-absent important countries such as Malaysia and Indonesia, and other contributors from India to balance the very large contingents from China and Japan.</p> <p>Headings: these are broadly followed. However, 10.3 should become 'Assumptions about future trends' rather than the present 'Future trends in climate and socioeconomic indicators' which implies a certainty which is not justified. 10.7 should become 'Conclusions: implications for sustainable development' which is different from 'Sustainable development challenges'.</p> <p>Length and balance: this chapter is hugely over-length, and needs shortening by 19 text pages. At the same time, there are only 18 pages on Future Impacts, out of a total of 60 pages. The recommendation is that Impacts should take up around half the chapter, whereas here Section 4 is less than one third. There is a lot of material in this chapter on climate science, much of which needs to be removed, and much of the material is sector-specific rather than location-specific, and so is unsuitable for a regional chapter. The authors need to concentrate on the new findings since the TAR for Asia.</p> <p>The Executive Summary is a suitable length, but doesn't contain the needed material. What is needed is a clear statement of (i) what is <u>new since the TAR</u> and (ii) what are the key, headline, findings from the chapter. The reader wants to access the key, headline, statements</p>	<p>Comments are considered appropriately in SOD.</p>

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter- Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						<p>in the Executive Summary, set out on not more than one page. Bullet points may help with this. It would be better to discard the present Executive Summary and start again.</p> <p>The Tables in Section 4 are useful, but could be expanded and made even more useful. There are two useful examples of tables in the FODs, and it would be great if the Asia chapter could produce something similar. First, Chapter 4 Table 4.5 shows impacts under different temperature increases. Second, Chapter 11 Table 11.11 looks at impacts (they call it risks, but in fact they are impacts) under different SRES scenarios at different points in time. Can Chapter 10 explore the feasibility of similar tables for Asia or even some regions of Asia? We want to include such tables in the SPM and Technical Summary, because we think this is what the policymakers want, but need the underlying evidence from the chapters.</p> <p>This chapter has rather few figures, and only one (permafrost) on impacts. It would be good if more figures, especially summarizing/synthesising figures, could be added. There are a few good examples in the FODs, such as <u>Chapter 4 Figures 4.9 and 4.10</u>. Fig. 4.9 is a map of the location of major impacts. Figure 4.10 is a sectoral burning embers diagram, but surely the concept could be applied at the regional scale. We want to include such material in the SPM and TS, but need the underlying evidence from the chapters.</p> <p>Chapter 10 seems to have a rather small literature to assess, which is leading to very general statements and a lack of specificity. The authors need to tap into the literature which is written globally, but which has regional references. A good example would be Patz et al., 2005, Nature 438, 310-317 '<u>Impact of regional climate change on human health</u>' which has quantitative projections for 2030 for two regions of Asia. Only by doing this will the authors come up with the quantitative statements that policymakers are looking for, and which we seek for the SPM and TS. Other examples include the articles by</p>	

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						<p>Arnell on water resources, Nicholls on coastal flooding and van Liesholt et al on malaria in the GEC Special Issue (14, 1) in 2004 - we can send you a copy. Also Arnell et al 2002 in Climatic Change, 53, 413-446.</p> <p>(Jean Palutikof)</p>	
10-1	A	0				<p>Grammar throughout entire chapter needs considerable editing.</p> <p>Text filled with superlatives that are unnecessary, see 'dangerous' superlative page 4 line 49.</p> <p>Chapter does not provide overall view that impacts of climate change on biophysical environment are likely to be far less than impacts of human activities on directly on environment through e.g., land degradation, habitat destruction, etc. Chapter mainly focusses on negative impacts of climate change. The absence of any description of positive effects creates an impression of bias and doubt about the selective assessment.</p> <p>Some references seem to be from 'grey' literature, e.g., environmental news service, 2002. Other literature seems to be secondary and probably not containing the original fact or finding, e.g., ADB 1994.</p> <p>The chapter could include statements about what has advanced since the TAR-what has been learned since 2001 in the region?</p> <p>(Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)</p>	To avoid grey literatures prior to 1995 and collect a copy of all grey literatures cited for TSU.
10-2	A	0				<p>There are several places where the entire paragraphs could be deleted as they do not give any specific information but statements of facts commonly known. Also, there is much duplication between the sections on Impacts and Adaptation.</p> <p>There is a general tendency to emphasise the fact that climate change would affect agriculture and water resources adversely, whereas the projections of precipitation indicate the contrary.</p> <p>(Janaka Dr Ratnasiri, Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS))</p>	No specific paragraph suggested for deletion – no irrelevant duplication detected.
10-3	A	0				<p>(1). Length of the chapter is 60 pages which is twice of the given length of 30 pages. (2) The sections on impacts and adaptations do not match well with the sections on climate change. The six subregions is not well expressed in the sections of impacts and adaptations. (3) The parts on impacts and adaptation are even needed to be strengthened (4) From the chapter, It is difficult to get a general idea on the climate change and its impact in Asia. Some aspects or regions are not mentioned in the text. Some examples are less representative. Expressions in many subsections</p>	Page length will be appropriately reduced.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						are too general which could be used to other parts of the world. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
10-4	A	0				Very well documented and comprehensive. Case studies, especially the one related to <u>Mega deltas in Asia</u> is indicative of how these particular areas are vulnerable. However, in these cases <u>no recommendation is proposed</u> and so adaptation can only be implemented with difficulty. (Savitri Garivait, The Joint Graduate School of Energy and Environment (JGSEE))	Literature survey was attempted to find out recommendations for adaptation.
10-5	A	0				The First Order Draft has been significantly improved in terms of content and clarity of the represented material and data. The majority of previous comments has been appropriately addressed. The quality of information provided in the report notably increased. The document is well balanced and organised in terms of content and length. It is proposed to <u>more clearly distinct the latest findings since the IPCC Third Assessment Report</u> . This will make the Forth Assessment Report more sound from scientific and practical point of view. While making distinctions, it is important to highlight that the present work builds on the IPCC Third Assessment Report, thus the consistency of scientific research is maintained. It is proposed to develop a summary table that will include a list of regional effects of climate change on various sectors. This will improve the information capacity of the chapter. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	A more clear distinction between TAR and AR4 findings was attempted.
10-6	A	0				in the content of 10.4, please discuss more on Hydrometeorological disasters (Thanawat Jarupongsakul, Chulalongkorn University)	Noted.
10-7	A	0				Overall this chapter has dealt well with the material reviewed. However, many relevant studies have not been reported in the chapter and are listed below. Geng, Quanzhen, Sugi, Masato (Ulka Kelkar, TERI (The Energy and Resources Institute))	Attempts was made to add more new materials. Most of literature cited are new ones.
10-8	A	0				The Chapter 10 (Asia) of the FOD is well-framed compare to the ZOD structure. In the Chapter 10, there are detailed descriptions on Agriculture and Food security, Hydrology and water resources, Coastal and low-lying areas, Natural ecosystems and biodiversity, Human health of Asia. Also, those topics were well described in Chapters 3-8. We need a caution of duplication. Therefore, in this review process for FOD, I tried to <u>emphasize regional characteristics in Chapter 10, and to exclude the general statement of those themes</u> . Comments on figures and tables. Cite the page where the item is placed (not where it is mentioned in the text). Please be as specific as possible, e.g. by giving the relevant table-row and table column	Attempts was made to be more region specific.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	
10-9	A	0				In the previous chapters (6,7) existence of mega cities in Asia (6.4.2.4) or urban areas of developing countries (7.4.2.3). However, <u>description of urban area in this chapter is very little</u> (10.4.6.2) (Hideyuki Kobayashi, Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport)	Attempts was made to add more on urbanization aspects of mega cities of Asia e.g. heat island etc.
10-10	A	0				Overall I found this chapter difficult to read. Arguments and reasoning is poor. Examples are given but these often only partially fit subheadings or claim that has been made. <u>No "critical" assessment is made of evidence.</u> In a few places it appears if an "impacts story" is being written regardless of evidence to the contrary. Not enough attention has been given to literature that challenges conventional wisdom. Huge parts are generic. Authors have difficulty considering differences between temperate vs. tropic, continental vs. archipelagic parts of ASia with latter in both cases largely forgotten. As a result broader claims about "Asia" often seem empty and dubious. Chapter might be better if stuck to central theme. It would be half the current length. (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Noted with regrets.
10-11	A	0				Contents of impacts of observed and future climate Change, adaptation and vulnerabilities in the Asia are too few, <u>Should supplement.</u> Impacts of climate change should express also by <u>degrees of confidence.</u> References should quote mainly from English papers. The papers of Russian , Chinese , Japanese should reduce . <u>Literatures of quotation from one scientist should not cite too many in general.</u> (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Attempts was made to improve the contents of the chapter in suggested areas.
10-12	A	0				Chapter 10 of the Arctic Climate Impact Assessment Scientific Report focuses on principles of biodiversity conservation in a circumpolar Arctic context, which is one of the regions of rapid climate change. Aspects of this chapter, and principle of biodiversity conservation, are then found in the paper commissioned by the Council of Europe, Conserving European Biodiversity in the Context of Climate Change (M Usher, 2005). This concern over the interaction between biodiversity and climate change was continued in the recommendations of the European Platform for Biodiversity Research Strategy, which were then introduced to a meeting of EU Nature Ministers in October 2005. These recommendations are entitled Recommendations on Climate Change and Biodiversity Conservation: Knowledge Needed to Support Development of Integrated Adaptation Strategies (see www.epbrs.org). It is suggested all this information and principles on links between biodiversity and climate change be considered and integrated in this chapter. Vulnerable coastal ecosystems that can also be used as indicators of and adaptation	Noted.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						to climate change (Magdalena Ariadne Kim Muir, Arctic Institute of North America (AINA), and EUCC-Coastal Union)	
10-13	A	0				General comments: (1) much of the material is <u>not specific or relevant to Asia</u> . A policy is required - how much repetition there should be between chapters of different continents? (2) there is lot of repetition and overlap between 10.3 trends, 10.4 impacts and 10.5 adaptations. (3) The section on gaps in knowledge can be much improved by identifying the Asia-specific gaps. (4) In many places there is no literature support. Altogether the chapter can be much shortened using stringent editing. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	As proposed, stringent editing is attempted.
10-14	A	0				All in all a well structured chapter with good coverage of the different topics. I have some minor comments and suggestions. 1. Section 10.4.2 needs much work in terms of language and sentence structure. 2. Section 10.4.3.3 this section fits more into section 10.4.4 3. Section 10.4.4 is weak and provides poor coverage of the topic. 4. In section 10.4.4.2 there is no mention of endangered species (where are there more species threatened by global change, which types of species etc, sources of threat.). Some of these issues are raised elsewhere in the text. 5. Sections 10.4.6.2 Except for one sentence on Japan, the section is not specific to Asia. Instead, it provides a general discussion of the topic, which may be covered in one of the preceding chapters of the book. 6. Sections 10.5.2.1, 10.5.2.2, 10.5.2.3 are not specific to Asia, i.e. no specific regional details. Possibly they are already covered in preceding chapters. 7. Section 10.5.4 – a section on protected areas (nature reserves etc.) should be added. How much area is designated as protected in different countries (at least selected few from best to worst situation). 8. I think a section on boundary shifts would strengthen the chapter. It should be added and should include the end of section 10.4.4.2, 10.4.4.3, the topic of glacier retreat, change of timber line, expansion of deserts etc. (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	These comments are appropriately considered in revision.
10-15	A	0				Good executive summary. Number of references varies greatly from one section to another. Suggest adding two or three maps of all of Asia showing current and projected temperature and precipitation changes from several climate models. Several references mentioned in the comments could be added to the list of	Thanks. Comment is considered depending on available space.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						References, if the comments are accepted. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	
10-16	A	0				The Chapter is well written and presented. About 81% of the literature cited is from the post TAR year which makes it interesting with added information. The tables are very useful, appropriately placed and are effective in listing the assessments. It however seems quite lengthy, far exceeding the prescribed page limits. There is some repetition among the various sections which leaves scope for reduction through careful editing – I am sure that the review editors will take care of this. Climatic impacts of aerosols, particularly over Asia, have been actively researched in the recent years and some published results have implied significant changes in monsoons rains, radiation and surface temperatures with negative impacts on agriculture. Absence of a critical assessment of these results leaves a major gap in the chapter. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	Newer work are referred to in revised text.
10-17	A	0				This chapter provides a useful summary with confidence limits attached to the statements. I wish this format can be used for all chapters. For a regional chapter, it is an excellent idea to subdivide the region into subregions that correspond with those in the SRES emission scenarios to obtain a better idea of regional characterization with scenarios. Overall, this chapter is strong in sections 10.3, 10.4, and 10.5 but have to be revised as updated literature becomes available. Three major points need to be considered: 1) Although tsunamis are not related to climate change, the recent Indian Ocean tsunami shows clearly that they can impact on the coping capacity of the coastal communities and countries. Just imagine the impact of another tsunami of similar magnitude in the Indian Ocean within the next hundred years even before the countries are threatened by a SLR! Thus, it is necessary to consider and integrate the tsunami threat appropriately in section 10.2.5 (Other stressors), section 10.4.3.2 (Inundation of coastal lowland), table 10.9 (updated to include recent Indian Ocean tsunami), section 10.5.3.2 (ICZM to include mitigation and adaptation to tsunamis), and section 10.5.6.1 (Disaster and migration management). 2) Section 10.7 (Sustainable development challenges) is rather weak and has not been developed clearly to show how this is related to climate change, despite what has been discussed in section 10.5 (Adaptation). There are no references in this crucial section! 3) Much of the discussion in the chapter has not been specific to the time lines of 2020s, 2050s, and 2080s. The subregions are developing at different rates. China is developing rapidly (and India to some extent) and these have implications for	Section 10.7 is revised slightly.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						Section 10.7. China, Japan, and India have recently endorsed the Gleneagles Plan for Action and this warrants added discussion on adaptation and sustainable development. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	
10-18	A	0				"While the chapter cites references mostly published after the year 1999, the chapter does not clearly show to readers about the new progress in climate change VIA research since the TAR. The chapter mainly presents the impact assessment in Asia and has very little coverage of climate change vulnerability and adaptation. " (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Newer progress is better highlighted in revised text .
10-19	A	0				In the references, some Chinese authors' name were not correctly cited. They were mistakenly used by given names, instead of the last name. Please modify the Changjiang River into "the Yangtze River" to make this name more consistent in the text. About the climate change in drought in China, please refer to the following articles:1. Wang Zhiwei, Zhai Panmao, and Zhang Hongtao. Variation of drought over northern China during 1950-2000. J. Geographical Sciences, 2003,13 (4):480-487. 2. Zou, X.K., P. M. Zhai and Q. Zhang, Variations in droughts over China: 1951-2003, Geophys .Res. Lett., 32, L04707, doi:10.1029/2004GL021853, 2005. (Panmao Zhai, China Meteorological Administration)	Chinese CLA and LA consider these suggestions in revision of the text..
10-20	A	1	0			No authors from Thailand, Cambodia, Lao PDR, Malaysia, Brunei, Burma, Pakistan, Bangladesh, Nepal and more importantly not much attention given to issues that would be of interest to most of these countries. (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	At this moment there is no appropriate CA, but continue to find CAs.
10-21	A	1	12	1	16	Do IPCC reports follow to the international rules to describe the name of Vietnamese? We do not understand which part is family name. (Toshiaki Ichinose, National Institute for Environmental Studies)	LA of Vietnam considers this.
10-22	A	1	32	1	32	change 'trends and variability' to 'trends, variability and extreme climatic events' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Proposed changes made.
10-23	A	1	33	1	33	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Proposed changes made.
10-24	A	1	37	1	37	change 'trends' to 'projection' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Proposed changes made.
10-25	A	1	47	2	5	10.5.4, should be "Natural ecosystems and biodiversity" (Masatoshi Yoshino, United Nations University)	Proposed changes made.
10-26	A	3	1		2	What follows after the first sentence is not strictly related to the "distinct and significant warming trend". Some re-ordering required in the first paragraph.	No Action

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	
10-27	A	3	1	4	15	"Section 10.1 <u>Executive Summary Comment</u> : this section fails to mention vulnerability and adaptation" (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Rewrite Executive summary (#10-27 - #10-52)
10-28	A	3	3	4	15	Expert Review: On the Executive summary and 10.3.4 socioeconomic scenarios; Expert Reviewer informs the description on population and economic growth would be inserted in the executive summary. 1) Since global warming and anthropogenic fuel burning should strongly link with population and economic growth, it is noteworthy to promote family planning for maintaining the sustainable communities in Asia. (Mitsuru ANDO, Toyama University of International Studies)	
10-29	A	3	3	3	14	Expert Review: On the Executive summary and 10.3.1 Future climate change scenarios; Expert Reviewer strongly suggests that "oil crisis" is the most important factor for future emission scenarios. 1) Instability of world oil supply in future evaluated by Colin J. Campbell and Matthew R. Simmons shows that IPCC Emission Scenarios (2000) should be revised using Peak Oil Scenarios. 2) The following sentence would be inserted in the text. "There are some Peak Oil Scenarios are available, therefore projected scenarios on CO2 emission and surface air temperature should be revised in near future." (Mitsuru ANDO, Toyama University of International Studies)	
10-30	A	3	3	3	5	Confusing-first sentence refers to temperature, while second sentence jumps to precipitation. Grammar problems. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Appropriate changes made.
10-31	A	3	6			There are various studies which deny increased weather extremes. What is the causal relationship (underlying mechanism) between warming of whatever origin, and weather extremes? (Hans H.J. Labohm, Netherlands Institute of International Relations 'Clingendael')	
10-32	A	3	6		9	Check cf. table 10.3 (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	
10-33	A	3	7	3	8	According to china's observation data from 681stations, the dust storm in China has decreasing trend during the second half of the 20th century, not as "increasing trend" in the First-Order Draft. Please see details in two articles-----"Blowing-sand and sandstorm in china in recent 45 years" (Published in Quaternary Science, 2001,21(1):9-17), and "Typical severe dust storms in northern China during 1954-2002" (published in Chinese Science Bulletin, 2003, 48(21): 2366-2370) (Zijiang Zhou, National Meteorological Information Centre of CMA)	Check by Wu

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-34	A	3	17			"high confidence" relative to what? technological changes? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Confidence level is defined elsewhere
10-35	A	3	18			More severe droughts is not due to, or even less number of wet days; it is more the prolonged period of dry days (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Check
10-36	A	3	22	3	22	It is proposed to indicate "the most conservative climate change projections" in terms of medium temperature increase. (Klaus Radunsky, Umweltbundesamt GmbH)	Rejected
10-37	A	3	26			"vulnerable" why? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Check
10-38	A	3	26			"anticipated" is redundant. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Corrections done.
10-39	A	3	38	3	39	Not only coastal inundation, but also it is important to emphasize major causes, i.e salt water intrusion, pollution, and prolonged dry spells have potential damage to aquaculture industry of Asia (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Consider when modify text
10-40	A	3	38		39	would it not just move inland? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	
10-41	A	3	41	3	43	Malaria is also a prevalent disease and it seems to increase the malaria outbreak due to an increased temperature (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	
10-42	A	3	41	3	50	Cancer in living creatures (Human, animals and plants) is an affect of climate change that could be mentioned in the report. (Mohammad Rahimi, I. R. of Iran Meteorological Organization)	
10-43	A	3	42			this is true without climate change (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	
10-44	A	3	43			how much change is predicted here (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	
10-45	A	3	48	3	48	a more correct term would be 'extirpated'. (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	
10-46	A	3	49	3	50	Wetlands has very broad definition. Perhaps, it would be more precise to mention directly the types of ecosystems under threats. These include coral reefs, mangroves, lagoon, peat swamp forests, and flood plain lakes (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	
10-47	A	4	4		6	Maybe a way of relieving stresses (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-48	A	4	5	4	10	Adaptive and coping strategy needs an integrated efforts and policies. It is important to reduce anthropogenic pressures with several mechanisms that would increase public awareness on the problems. Society also needs incentives to take preventive actions. In many cases, policies that have been formulated just focus on how to suppress or control the problems. And, incentives for preventive undertakings are commonly forgotten. Also, in line with prevention strategy, an early warning should be developed (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	
10-49	A	4	5			What is cultural integrity in this context? (Hans H.J. Labohm, Netherlands Institute of International Relations 'Clingendael')	
10-50	A	4	12		13	why should they worry about this (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	
10-51	A	4	13			cannot introduce the term without explanation (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	
10-52	A	4	20	4	20	remove 'the' (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Done
10-53	A	4	22		23	Sentence can be edited to read "The TAR (IPCC 2001) re-iterated..." (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	OK – done.
10-54	A	4	28	4	29	Poorly worded-confusing (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	No changes proposed. The sentence is clear.
10-55	A	4	28		29	where is the data for this? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Refer to TAR Asia chapter.
10-56	A	4	30	4	30	TAR reported should be changed to TAR predicted or forecasted (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	IPCC Assessment Reports do not predict or forecast – they only report.
10-57	A	4	31			surely this is inland? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Yes – it is average for the land regions.
10-58	A	4	35			with what confidence? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Refer to TAR Asia Chapter.
10-59	A	4	36		40	what about in tropical Asia? Review the TAR findings for otherwise risk findings for all parts will be inappropriately spread (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Only the significant findings reported here. Findings for all regions need not be reproduced here.
10-60	A	4	39	4	39	Insert 'periodic' before 'severe' (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Ok – done.
10-61	A	4	49	4	49	remove 'dangerous' superlative (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Ok – done.
10-62	A	4	49	4	51	In other paragraphs permafrost degradation is seen to have benefits-contradiction. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	No specific para or sentence suggested. No action taken.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-63	A	5	0			In session 10.2, it is better to summarize the regional characteristics of Asia before the subregions are given. For example: Regional climate is obviously different; There is the highest frequencies and intensions of extreme weather events and other disaster in the world, such as cyclones, typhoon, storm surge, heat wave, heavy rainfall, flood, drought, earthquake and volcano burst etc. ; various and complicated natural ecosystems and biodiversity-Forests, woodlands, grasslands, rangelands and deserts are vital to Asia's ecology.; Most permafrost occurs mainly in North Asia, northern East Asia, the Tibet Plateau and the surrounding mountains.; Asia is the most populous of the continents; Agriculture is the main industry. Asia has most developing countries including some poorest countries in the world; Asia is close to broad oceans+K65 with far-flung and flexural coastline, and thus influence intensively by oceanic environment; the world's largest and highest plateau:the Tibetan Plateau.Each characteristic could be desribered in detail. And the simillar description in the bellow text could be deleted. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	10.2 is summary of TAR, but consider the comments in revision
10-64	A	5	5	5	6	This sentence seems to be redundant. It has been mentioned on page 3 from line 50 (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	10.2 is summary of TAR
10-65	A	5	6	5	6	Mangroves are highly dynamic ecosystems, which recede and accrete relatively fast, compared to other ecosystems in absence of human activity-lots of literature on this topic. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	10.2 is summary of TAR
10-66	A	5	13	5	14	Land use planning and the enforcement of this policy is one of important factor that limit adaptive and coping strategies of society to deal with climate change. This is not explained in the text (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	10.2 is summary of TAR
10-67	A	5	14			why only large populations? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	10.2 is summary of TAR
10-68	A	5	18			ambiguous. Be more specific (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	10.2 is summary of TAR
10-69	A	5	21			why optimal? Seems to contradict first sentence of para (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	10.2 is summary of TAR
10-70	A	5	22		25	complex sentence - no message (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	10.2 is summary of TAR
10-71	A	5	27	5	32	"section 10.1.2 Comment: this paragraph does not directly related to WGII, delete the paragraph" (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	10.2 is summary of TAR

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-72	A	5	40			This section refers little to how sensitivities and vulnerabilities have changed from the TAR to the FAR. I think the two documents should be linked. What do we know now that is different? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Noted
10-73	A	5	40	6	33	Section 10.2: The part "regional characteristics" has been talked in TAR. In term of the subregion partition (Fig 10.1),it is differ to the TAR (Fig11.1) definition,and in context, most of the conclusions are sorted by countries, not by subregions.Therefore,first, give the references or convictable reasons why change to new subregion definition; second, add the nations and other coverage layers into Fig 10.1 for most of the conclusions relevant to nations (just same as fig 11.1 in TAR). (Xiong Wei, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences)	Changes made
10-74	A	5	42	7	12	"section10.2.1 comment: this section may has already in TAR, do we still need it here?" (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Changes made
10-75	A	5	49	5	51	delete the lines (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-76	A	5	50			It is preferable to use the Tibetan name for Mt. Everest, i.e., Mt. Qomolangma (previously spelled as Jolmo Lungma). In addition, its height is 8844.43m, according to the most recent measurement as announced by China on 9 October. (Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)	Rejected
10-77	A	5	50			a new study using satellite technology has set Mount Qomolangma's height at 8844.43 meters. Please change Mt.Everest, the highest peak in the world (8,848 m) into Mount Qomolangma, the highest peak in the world (8844.43 m). (Bangzhong Wang, China Meteorological Administration)	Rejected
10-78	A	6	1	6	1	delete 'Philippines, and Japan also are part of Asia.' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Done
10-79	A	6	1	6	4	attach 'Asia is ... Maul, 2005)' to the end of Line 47 of Page 5 (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Deleted
10-80	A	6	1	6	1	In the sentence beginning with "Asia is the most populous.." add % of world population living in Asia. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	Deleted
10-81	A	6	7		9	The arctic area and West Asia(The grey area in the Fig 10.1) have not been included in six subregions of the Asian continent. This should give an explain. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	NA
10-82	A	6	8			North Asia, East Asia and South Asia are used in the text, whereas the same	Figure 10.1 is cited from IPCC recommended

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						geographical areas are referred to as Northern Asia, Eastern Asia and Southern Asia in the legend of Figure 10.1. These need to be standardized. In addition, in conformity with other abbreviations, it is better to use SEAS as the abbreviation for Southeast Asia in Figure 10.1. (Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)	subdivision of the world, so keep it as it is.
10-83	A	6	12			Fig.10.1(b) It might be better if we could have area of each Region. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-84	A	6	12			Fig.10.1 (a) If you could accept my proposal to change the name 'CAS', it would be 'WCA'. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-85	A	6	32			the word "relief" is not a proper word used here (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	"Relief" retained
10-86	A	6	32			Fig 10.1It is better to draw the six subregions on a formal Asian district map. Given a comprehensive Asian map with boundaries of main countries, mega cities, main rivers and famous mountain ranges and the distribution of main maritime space, it would be very helpful to understand regional characteristics in Asian. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Too much work
10-87	A	6	32			Figure 10.1 the inset giving subregions and their lat/lon boundaries is not legible. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	Map is from IPCC material, so keep it as it is, but revised in printing.
10-88	A	6	36	6	36	minus 50 seems to cold for a mean monthly temperature for the Boreal zone as a whole? Check this. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	For example, a mean monthly temperature of Oymyakon in Siberia (N65 – E140) is -45.9 oC (1971-2000), Chronological Scientific Tables (2006)
10-89	A	6	36			mean January temperature, delete monthly (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Rejected
10-90	A	6	40			covering? Or contain? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Ok used "hold"
10-91	A	6	41			does this have special meaning? What about groundwater? Why no discussion? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	There is no literature on groundwater so keep it as it is.
10-92	A	6	43			The current spelling for Tien Shan is Tian Shan. Cross reference needs to be stated. Likewise for Table 10.4 on P.13. (Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)	Done
10-93	A	7	5	7	6	Again, the meaning of tropical forests are very broad. I suggest to mention directly the types of ecosystems under threats. Precise and clear targets are needed for policy makers to response to this climate change. In addition to "physical ecosystems", south east asia also is home for diverse ethnic groups. This social variability makes the undertakings not simple	We used tropical rainforest

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	
10-94	A	7	5	7	5	Not much rainforest left-SE Asia is characterized by high and constant rainfall, heavily leached soils and evergreen vegetation. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Ok
10-95	A	7	5			Add new sentence: "In fact, monsoon is driven by the seasonal heating of the Tibetan Plateau." (Janaka Dr Ratnasiri, Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS))	Rejected
10-96	A	7	6			Add "and has the world's two largest archipelagic nations". (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Common knowledge
10-97	A	8	0			table 10.1. (1) It is better to add a row of subregions and to list the countries according to the subregion it belonged to. (2) The unit expression used in the table should be unified. (3) The words " per person" in the fourth K94 from the right should be omitted. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	No Rejected Ok done
10-98	A	8	0	8		Missing information marked by x in table 10.1 can be found in appropriate sources, in most cases. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	NWill do if we find references
10-99	A	8	0	8		why the missing data in the table? This information should be available. (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	Unfortunately missing data is still missing.
10-100	A	8	0			"Table 10.1 comment: no need such information here and delete the table" (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Rejected table is vital
10-101	A	8	1	8		What is the meaning of RWR in a table? (Toshiaki Ichinose, National Institute for Environmental Studies)	Footnote in the table is inserted
10-102	A	8	1			Table 10.1.(a) In caption, the references 'FAO 2004a and b' should be included. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	OK done
10-103	A	8	1			Table 10.1(d) In bottom of Table, you should have remark on X, RWR, *, etc. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Done
10-104	A	8	1			Table 10.1(c) In first row in fourth column, '103' should be changed '1000'. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Done
10-105	A	8	1			Table 10.1(b) In first row in first column, '/Region' should be removed. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Done
10-106	A	8	1	8	1	Table 10.1 Row 5. Statistics about Bhutan are incorrect. Population is still less than 1million and therefore other percapita data. The world bank has more realistic figures, Please see	Population of Bhutan is 896000 in 2004 from World Bank Table indicated in the comment.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						http://devdata.worldbank.org/external/CPProfile.asp?SelectedCountry=BTN&CCODE=BTN&CNAME=Bhutan&PTYPE=CP (Thinley Namgyel, National Environment Commission)	
10-107	A	8	1			A column titled "Sub Region" could be add to the table 10.1. " ... in summer and minimum temperature more than maximum temperature. (Mohammad Rahimi, I. R. of Iran Meteorological Organization)	Rejected
10-108	A	9	0			Table 10.2: Recent work in: Fowler, H.J. and Archer, D.R. Conflicting signals of climatic change in the Upper Indus Basin. Journal of Climate, Accepted subject to minor revisions, should be included in Table, looks at northern Pakistan. Temperature data for seven instrumental records in the Karakoram and Hindu Kush Mountains of the Upper Indus Basin (UIB) have been analysed for seasonal and annual trends over the period 1961-2000 and compared with neighbouring mountain regions and the Indian sub-continent. Strong contrasts are found between the behaviour of winter and summer temperatures and between maximum and minimum temperatures. Winter mean and maximum temperature show significant increases whilst mean and minimum summer temperatures show consistent decline. Increase in diurnal temperature range (DTR) is consistently observed in all seasons and the annual data set, a pattern shared by much of the Indian sub-continent but in direct contrast to both GCM projections and the narrowing of DTR seen worldwide. This divergence commenced around the middle of the 20th century and is thought to result from changes in large-scale circulation patterns and feedback processes associated with the Indian monsoon. The observed downward trend in summer temperature and runoff is consistent with the observed thickening and expansion of Karakoram glaciers, in contrast to widespread decay and retreat in the Eastern Himalaya. This suggests that the Western Himalaya is showing a different response to global warming than other parts of the globe. See paper for details for table. Also see results from: Archer, D.R. and Fowler, H.J. 2004. Spatial and temporal variations in precipitation in the Upper Indus Basin, global teleconnections and hydrological implications. Hydrology and Earth System Sciences, 8(1), 47-61. for observed changes in precipitation in northern Pakistan - i.e. summer and winter increases over the last 40 years. (Hayley Fowler, Newcastle University)	Consider in revising the text.
10-109	A	9	0			References for Section 10.2: (1) Gadgil S, Vinaychandran P N, and Francis P A. 2003. Droughts of the Indian summer monsoon: Role of clouds over the Indian Ocean. CURRENT SCIENCE, VOL. 85, NO. 12, 25 DECEMBER 2003 (2) Gadgil S, Srinivasan J, Nanjundiah R S, Krishna Kumar K, Munot A and Rupa Kumar K. 2002. On forecasting the Indian summer monsoon: the intriguing season of 2002.	Consider in revising the text.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						CURRENT SCIENCE, VOL. 83, NO. 4, 25 AUGUST 2002. (3) K. Zickfeld, B. Knopf, V. Petoukhov, H. J. Schellnhuber. 2005. Is the Indian summer monsoon stable against global change? GEOPHYSICAL RESEARCH LETTERS, VOL. 32, L15707, doi:10.1029/2005GL022771, 2005 (4) Borgaonkar H.P. and Pant G.B., Long term climate variability over monsoon Asia as revealed by some proxy sources, Mausam, 52, 2001, 9-22. (Ulka Kelkar, TERI (The Energy and Resources Institute))	
10-110	A	9	1	9	9	the topic of "10.2.3.5 Intensity and frequency of frost" could be add. (Mohammad Rahimi, I. R. of Iran Meteorological Organization)	Rejected
10-111	A	9	2	12	6	I suggest combining of sub-subsections 10.2.2 and 10.2.3 (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-112	A	9	2	9	2	change the title to 'Observed climate trends, variability and extreme climatic events' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-113	A	9	2	11		"from section 10.2.2 to section 10.2.3 comment: the two sections present too much information which may already presented in WGI report. A very brief summary will be enough." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Consider the comment in revision of the text.
10-114	A	9	4	9	4	is' should be 'are'. Many grammar problems throughout chapter. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Done
10-115	A	9	4			The duration of "past and present" is ambiguous. A definite duration should be given. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Retained
10-116	A	9	4		16	what kind of quality control was done in above sets. Were only studies sharing trends cited ie - is this table an artifact of selection bias? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Useful information, so keep this table with references.
10-117	A	9	6	9	7	To be balanced, the observed increases should be expressed as a range. Only focussing on the maximum is bias. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Ok done
10-118	A	9	7			It is preferable to replace "recent decades" with "periods ranging from a few decades to over a century". (Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)	No
10-119	A	9	8	9	8	Section 10.2.2: Propose to include reference in the end of the first paragraph of section 10.2.2. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	Done
10-120	A	9	10	9	10	"High' should be qualified relative to some reference period or location. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-121	A	9	13	9	15	The results of a study done using 1961-2003 daily rainfall data at the Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA) (the National Meteorological Service of the Philippines) presented in April 2005 in the Climate Forum show that there are increasing trends in annual rainfall mostly along the eastern coasts of the Philippines but mostly decreasing trends along its western coasts. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Done
10-122	A	9	14	9	14	Changjiang Valley should be replaced by Yangtze River, as it normally called in China. it should be consistent with the same name throughout the Report, as it occurred with Changjiang Valley, Yangtze Valley and Yangtze River. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Done
10-123	A	9	14			Geographical names needs to be standardized. For example, characteristics related to Changjiang River, the largest river in China, is referred to as Changjiang here in Line 14 and as Yangtze in Table 10.2, and elsewhere as Yangtse. (The three names are used alternatively in many other places throughout Chapter 10, including references.) One way to address this problem is to indicate, when the river name first appears, that the three names refer to the same river. Another example is the two names for another important river in China, namely, Yellow River and Hunaghe. (Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)	Done
10-124	A	9	18	10	18	Table 10.2. and 10.3. I am sure the table will not be printed in separated pages. Also, some references are still missing (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Of Course
10-125	A	9	18			"Table 10.2" under Sri Lanka -change in temperature "minimum and maximum temperatures have been increasing during tthe last centurary. 0.016 C increase per year during 1961-90 period over the entire country. 2.0 C increase per century over the central highlands." under the references "Basnayake, B.R.S.B. et al 2002" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	Done
10-126	A	9	18			table 10.2. (1) It is quite difficult to make comparesion between subregions from the data or result cited in the table 10.2 covered differrent time length,and between the warming rate and the difference of stages. (2) Some blank cells in the table should be filled in. (3) in the fourth row, the duration 1900-96 in the third and fouth columns should be checked again. It might not be right. (4) In the fifth row, the duration of the temperature change should be given and the warming rate should be checked. (5)The word "Yangtze" in sixth row of the table and "Changjiang" in the	Consider the comments in revision of the text.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						text should be unified. (6) In the eighth row and tenth row, the duration of the temperature change should be given. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
10-127	A	9	18	9	18	Table 10.2: Propose to include reference in last column of the fourth row of Table 10.2. Otherwise delete row from the table. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	Ok
10-128	A	9	18			Tables 10.2.(b) In first column, delete lines under one Region. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Done
10-129	A	9	18			Tables 10.2. (a) Fill the blank information. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	OK
10-130	A	9	18			change period not consistently reported - very hard to interpret (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	We depend on our references
10-131	A	9	18	9	18	In the 4th row and 4th column of Tab 10.2, 22%-33% increase in northwest China, it is not accountable to us for such a high and obvious increase, that means it is not reliable figure to be present, considering the methodology used for data processing and interpretation, although it is officially published. It is impressed of decrease in total annual amount of precipitation in general, and thus we encourage to cite the official report from China National Meteorological Bureau. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Check the references
10-132	A	9	18	9	18	Table 10.2: Please correct the text " Japan Meteorological Agency, 2002" to "Japan Meteorological Agency, 2005" in the cell (Japan, References) (Masao Mikami, Meteorological Research Institute, JMA)	Done
10-133	A	9	18	9	18	Table 10.2: Please add the following text in the cell (Japan, Change in Precipitation); "No significant trend in 20th century, although the fluctuations have gradually becomes larger." (Masao Mikami, Meteorological Research Institute, JMA)	Done
10-134	A	9	18	10		Table 10.2 Temperature records from Bangladesh, Sri Lanka and Indonesia are probably available. It may be useful to check with the meteorological offices in the U.K and the Netherlands, as well as in the countries themselves. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Include Sri Lanka, still finding Bangladesh and Indonesia.
10-135	A	9	18			In Table 10.2 wherein the key climate trends are summarized, the temperature trends are listed for varying time scales ranging from per year to century. It will be more understandable, particularly to general readers, if these numbers could be reduced to a single uniform time scale without loss of accuracy. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	SThis table is created based on various literatures, so it is difficult to make suggested table. Keep it as it is.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-136	A	9	18	10		<p>Table 10.2 includes some characteristics for observed past and present climate trends and variability for SE Asia and the Philippines. The cited literature for change in temperature in SE Asia, Manton et al, 2001 study was not on rate of increases but only on trends of extreme climate events</p> <p>In Table 10.2, for the Philippines, rate of increase in annual mean temperatures and also trends in the extreme temperature events could also be included and as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - climatological statistics (1971-2000) indicate an increase of 0.14 deg C in the archipelago during this 30-year period (PAGASA, 2005) - Moreover for rainfall, the PAGASA study using GIS-based rainfall data do not show the same results (see comment for No.2) - Increase in variability of onset of rainy season such as a three-week delay in the onset being seen in the 1990-2000 period (PAGASA, 2001) <p>(Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))</p>	Done
10-137	A	9				Table 10.2, Nepal box should be mentioned. (Masatoshi Yoshino, United Nations University)	Done
10-138	A	9				Table 10.2, Japan box: "No clear trend, locally variable" (Masatoshi Yoshino, United Nations University)	Done
10-139	A	10	3	10	3	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-140	A	10	3		16	what kind of quality control was applied to inclusion of this data. Do results reflect selection bias - papers showing no trend not being cited> what trends are significant? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	This table compiles information of various literatures which deal with detected impacts. So keep it as it is.
10-141	A	10	5	10	5	New' relative to what? TAR? No 's' on evidence. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Change the text.
10-142	A	10	9	12	6	deleting the titles of sub-sub-subsections 10.2.3.1 through 10.2.3.4 (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-143	A	10	9	10	9	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-144	A	10	10	10	10	Significantly longer' relative to what? Previous decade, century? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Keep it as it is.
10-145	A	10	10	10	16	attach 'Significantly longer ... Cruz et al., 2005).' to the end of Line 7 of Page 10 (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-146	A	10	10	10	16	Cited literature for Southeast Asia findings, Manton et al, 2001 study was on trends of extreme maximum and minimum temperature series, not on the duration of heat	Ok deleted

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						waves. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	
10-147	A	10	12	10	13	" <u>Most part of China</u> " It is not ture. In China, there is no significant increase trend for heatwave, but for frequency warm days and warm nights. There also exsits a significant decrease trend in number of the frost days. (Panmao Zhai, China Meteorological Administration)	Delete the text.
10-148	A	10	13	10	13	change two '&' to 'and' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Done
10-149	A	10	14	10	14	change '&' to 'and' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Done
10-150	A	10	18			what length time series is required to make a "reasonable" assessment of change (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	N ???
10-151	A	10	18	11		Table 10.3 Information about the Central Asian Republics may be available under the former USSR. For information on Pakistan, suggest contacting Dr. Arshad M. Khan at <gcisc@comsats.net.pk>. For information on Bangladesh, please contact Dr. Q.K. Ahmad at <bup@citech-bd.com>. For information on areas affected by about 20 different floods since 1954, please see "Flood in Bangladesh" by Prof. Maniruzaman Miah, book published by Gathidara Press, Dhaka. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Try to access researchers.
10-152	A	10	18			In Table 10.3, the column on South Asia – the catastrophic heavy rainfall event at Mumbai, India – the date and rainfall amounts mentioned are incorrect, the dates are 26-27 July 2005 (records are for 08:30 AM on 26th July to 08:30 AM on 27th July 2005, with the actual heavy rain spell occurring from 02:30 PM onwards) and the rainfall amount as per Regional Met. Office, India Meteorological Department, Mumbai records during this period was 944 mm. Pl. also check the loss of lives and economic losses. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	Done
10-153	A	10	18			Table 10.3 gives summary of observed changes in extreme events and severe climate anomalies for SE Asia. For heat waves, cited literature, Manton et al, 2001 gives the trends for the number of hot days and warm nights and of cool days and cold nights during 1961-1998. In this study, the SE countries were the Philippines, Thailand, Malaysia, Myanmar and Vietnam. Updates of the study till 2003 (presented during the 5th APN Workshop on Climate Extremes in Australia in 2004) show the same trends in the South Pacific and SE Asia. For intense rains and floods, SE Asia, entry could be improved by including results of updates of Manton study (for the Phil.) presented at the 5th APN Workshop on	Done

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						Climate Extremes and the PAGASA Climate Forum in April 2005, which are: '- There are weak increases in the intensity of daily rainfall in most parts of the Philippines. '- Also, that documented landslides mostly triggered by heavy rains in the Philippines had increased from a five-year average of 6.6 per year in 1990-1994 to 13.8 per year during 1995-2001 (PAGASA, 2001) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	
10-154	A	10	18	11	0	The problem about China's dust storms in the Table 10.3 is as same as above. (Zijiang Zhou, National Meteorological Information Centre of CMA)	Try to find literatures on dust storm.
10-155	A	10	19	11	1	table 10.3 It is quite difficult to get a clear image on the extreme events from the table 10.3 for the cited information is unable to compare (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	???
10-156	A	10	19	10	19	Table 10.3: Propose to include reference in the third row of Table 10.3. Otherwise delete row from the table. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	Ok
10-157	A	10	19			table "key features" very heterogenous (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Ok we replaced with "Trend"
10-158	A	10	19			China - "recent years" - too vague (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	replaced with recent decades
10-159	A	10	19	10	19	Table 10.3: Please change the text in the cell (Japan, Key Features) in the Cyclone/Typhoons sub-Sheet as "Number of tropical storms including typhoons has two peaks in the middle of 1960's and the beginning of 1990's. After the end of 1990's it was often lower than the average. There is no clear trend of number of typhoons that go north to the vicinity of Japan except 2004 when the number was the most and 1999 when the number was the least." (Masao Mikami, Meteorological Research Institute, JMA)	Done
10-160	A	10	19	10	19	Table 10.3: Please add the reference in the cell (Japan, Key Features) in the Cyclone/Typhoons sub-Sheet: " Japan Meteorological Agency, 2005". (Masao Mikami, Meteorological Research Institute, JMA)	Done
10-161	A	10	34			there is no rationale given for why this subset of topics (subheadings) were pulled out of a hat nor their relevance to climate impacts (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	These are what's available
10-162	A	10	39		46	Is there also counter-evidence? What do historical trends reviewed earlier suggest? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	? No lines 39-46 in Page 10.
10-163	A	10				Table 10.2, SE Asia precipitation box: some results should be referred. (Masatoshi Yoshino, United Nations University)	OK

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-164	A	10				Table 10.2, Indonesia temperature box: same to above. (Masatoshi Yoshino, United Nations University)	OK
10-165	A	11	0			Table 10.3 Droughts-Southeast Asia: ENSO droughts exacerbate forest fires, which are caused by people, not drought. Text implies ENSO droughts are getting worse, but has this been shown? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Not find literatures which show all the fires were caused by people. Try to find some literatures on forest fires.
10-166	A	11	0			"Table 10.3" under Intense Rains and floods - South Asia "Sri Lanka has been experiencing heavy precipitation events in the recent past. In 17th May 2003, Sever foolds were experienced in Sabaragamuwa and Southern provinces, which triggerd by the extreamly heavy rainfalls, about 730 mm in southern parts of the island. "under the references "Department of Meteorology-Sri Lanka, 2003" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	Done
10-167	A	11	0			"Table 10.3" under droughts - South Asia "Most of the drought conditions, in Sri Lanka, are associated with the El Nino events, 1982/83, 1997/98 etc. During these periods warm and dry conditions are prevailed through out the country" under the references "Basnayake, B.R.S.B. et al 2005" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	Done
10-168	A	11	0			Same table indicates some statistics for cyclones/typhoons. It should be corrected as"An average of 20 tropical cyclones cross the Philippine Area of Responsibility (PAR) with only 8 to 9 crossing the country per year (PAGASA 2001). There is interdecadal to multi-decadal variations in the intensity and frequency of tropical cyclones in the PAR with several typhoon extremes observed from 1990 to 2004 (Amadore, 2005) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Done
10-169	A	11	1			How do you compensate for improved "coverage" of monitoring stations and observations? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	???
10-170	A	11	3	11	16	When assessing increasing rainfall intensity, must also consider impacts due to environmental degradation, in additions to climate change. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Agree
10-171	A	11	3		18	It is suggest that session 10.2.3.2 and session 10.2.3.3 merged into one session and named by "Floods and droughts related to intense uneven precipitation". (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Rejected
10-172	A	11	3	11	3	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	
10-173	A	11	9	11	13	Manton et al, 2001 study specifically stated that the frequency of extreme rainfall	Revise the text considering the comment.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						<p>events has declined at the majority of stations in the study (Southeast Asia and South Pacific) and that there has been a weak decline in the average intensity of the highest four events each year over much of Southeast Asia.</p> <p>Updating has been done continuously for the study area until 2004 and results had been more or less consistent.</p> <p>Moreover, using the same methodology, long term records of daily rainfall in the Philippines were examined and similar results were seen. There are weak increases in intensities of daily rainfall events.</p> <p>(Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))</p>	
10-174	A	11	14			severe flooding may itself be product of land use choices rather than climate change (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	I think it's understood
10-175	A	11	14	11	16	<p>Flooding, landslides and mud flows are not limited to low lying areas only. Mountain valleys in the Himalayas are also prone to flash floods with intense and sustained periods of rainfall in the monsoons as is reported in the local and international media.</p> <p>(Thinley Namgyel, National Environment Commission)</p>	Yes Try to find references
10-176	A	11	18	11	18	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-177	A	11	18	11		<p>Table 10.3. Row 2 on page 11. Intense Rains and Floods in South Asia, where it says, "Serious and recurrent floods in Bangladesh, Nepal and Northeastern states of India during 2002, 2003 and 2004;". Serious flash floods also occur quite frequently in Bhutan with loss of life and property during the same periods. These are documented in local newspaper stories- See www.kuenselonline.com.</p> <p>(Thinley Namgyel, National Environment Commission)</p>	OK
10-178	A	11	18			<p>In Table 10.3, replace Shangxi with Shanxi.</p> <p>(Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)</p>	Done
10-179	A	11		11		<p>Table 10.3 (continued): Propose to include reference in the second row of Table 10.3 on page 11. Otherwise delete row from the table.</p> <p>(Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)</p>	OK
10-180	A	11				<p>Russia - between 1972-81 - so what?</p> <p>(Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)</p>	Ok addressed
10-181	A	11				<p>Japan - recent years - too ambiguous; also no citations</p> <p>(Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)</p>	Ok revised
10-182	A	11				<p>Table 10.3, Cyclones/Typhoons: Japan box:Japan Met. Agency, 2005.</p> <p>(Masatoshi Yoshino, United Nations University)</p>	Done
10-183	A	12	1	12	2	Indonesia also suffers from ENSO (See Quinn 1978 for example)	Reference too old

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	
10-184	A	12	1	12	3	Add after (Webster et al, 1998) "and in the Philippines (PAGASA, 2001) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Done
10-185	A	12	3	12	4	Not sure if Intensity of droughts is measured in terms of extent and cost? Usually magnitude and duration. References in this section seem a bit weak-grey, or secondary literature? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Some references touch on damage of droughts, so consider this in the text.
10-186	A	12	3	12	6	Manton et al, 2001 is only on assessment of trends of extreme events. Droughts, specifically areal extent and cost of damages are not a part of this study. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Deleted
10-187	A	12	8			It is suggest that the title of the session 10.2.3.4 is changed to "uneven change in intensity and frequency of cyclones/typhoons". (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Rejected
10-188	A	12	8	12	8	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-189	A	12	8	12	15	the section 10.2.3.4 for Intensity and frequency of cyclones/typhoons was not appropriately written. There is no significant trend in the typhoons in the NW Pacific ocean. There are publications published but not referred. Please refer to Ch. 3 of the IPCC AR4 WG1 Report for the mian conclusions about climate change in the tropical cyclones. (Panmao Zhai, China Meteorological Administration)	Add references.
10-190	A	12	13	12	15	It is not correct to attribute the increasing damage solely to the increase of the intensity of the tropical cyclones. The increased level of economy worldwide also contributes to the increased damage. This needs to be stated. In addition, increase of the intensity of the tropical cyclones needs to be substantiated with proper reference(s). (Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)	Modify the text considering the comment.
10-191	A	12	14			does not follow from damages figures because reflects building in high risk locations (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Done
10-192	A	12	16	12	16	... China, Iran, the Tibetan... (GCOS action plan for South and Southwest Asia, 2005) (Mohammad Rahimi, I. R. of Iran Meteorological Organization)	Done
10-193	A	12	18			a lot of this material in this section is not actually about impacts of changes in climate but rather trends in various human activities and resources - needs major	Consider the comment in revising the text.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						rewrite, cutting irrelevant materials and making impact link more explicit (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	
10-194	A	12	18	17	30	"section 10.2.4 comment: this section mainly presents the impacts of climate on key sectors and some major concerns of the region. It should also present the vulnerability and adaptation studies. Please refer to Chapter 17 of AR4 for examples." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Ok Consider in revising the section
10-195	A	12	20	12	45	Would be useful to distinguish between localized climate change due to albedo changes versus general climate change attributed to G-G emissions at larger scale. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	???
10-196	A	12	20			Session 10.2.4.1 the case listed in the session could not give the whole conception about the impacts on agricultue.(1) Both positive and negative impacts should be given.Only negative impacts are collected. In fact, some area get from benifte from the global warming in the past 20 year, for example in Northeast China. (2) The net impact should be viewed from the whole country or regarded at the main crops or the main agricultural area of the country.(3)whether the given cases could respecet the subregion their belonged to, and How about the other regions without any example. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Revise the text considering the comment
10-197	A	12	20	12	45	Section 10.2.4.1: the part "impacts of observed climate change on agriculture and food production" is relative weak, and some of the conclusions are old, not the new findings, e.g. Wigeratne, 1996, Agarwal et al., 2000, etc. New researches finding are needed if there are. (Xiong Wei, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences)	Revise the text considering the comment
10-198	A	12	22			A rather negative view of what is mostly successful expansion and intensification of production system. Need to condider hetergenity across locations; when climate trends are helpful to production systems nobody talks about them and why not? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Revise the text considering the comment
10-199	A	12	22	12	25	In the Philippines, the vulnerability assessments done on rice and corn production show that with no temperature increment, a doubling of CO2 would increase the yield by about 30%; but with current levels of CO2, increasing the temperature would always decrease yields and more so in the dry seasons. One important conclusion in the study is that when the agricultural sector in any part of the country has already been rendered vulnerable by increasing climate vulnerability, including occurrences of extreme events and other non-climatic factors like increasing population, degraded/diminished agricultural areas, lack of irrigation	Good information.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						facilities and others, the projected adverse impacts of climate change will certainly contribute to substantial decreases in crop yields (Amadore, 2005) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	
10-200	A	12	24	12	24	Need reference for this statement. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Try to find ref.
10-201	A	12	27		31	sentences before "in recent years" in line 31, could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	No action
10-202	A	12	27	12	45	attach 'Frequent droughts ... Wijeratne, 1996).' to the end of Line 25 of Page 12 (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	No action
10-203	A	12	27	12	34	this conclusion look a little bit flurried, low temperature is the key stress for agriculture production in boreal Asia or Asian Russian. And it seems that the recent temperature increase will benefit the agricultural production in this area. Furthermore, food security is more urgent in south Asia, East Asia than in boreal Asia, and Russia is still a crop export country, this paragraph pays more attention on marginal agricultural areas rather than main agricultural areas. (Xiong Wei, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences)	Could not find ref., so keep it as it is.
10-204	A	12	32		34	why? This might make it easier if longer growing season (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-205	A	12	32			this may just reflect normal "wishful" thinking (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-206	A	12	35			"increasing intensity" is OK, but "frequency" is ? (Mitsuhiro Nakagawa, Ibaraki University)	Frequency means how often El Nino events occur, so retain it.
10-207	A	12	37			"River Yangtze" should be "Yangtze River". ". The word "Yangtze" and "Changjiang" in the other parts of the text should be unified (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Done
10-208	A	12	37	12	37	Yangtze Valley should be Yangtze River; Qinhai province should be replaced by Qinghai province (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Done
10-209	A	12	37			Replace Qianhai with Qinghai. (Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)	Done
10-210	A	12	38	13	19	Reference: Jin et al., 2001 (What are the impacts of climate change?) (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Deleted
10-211	A	12	39	12	42	A substantial part of the increase in rice and wheat production was due to the introduction of new species (The green revolution). This has not been repeated. Further, the productivity of the soil may have decreased due to the demands on	Consider in revising the text.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						nutrients. These additional factors could be mentioned in the text. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	
10-212	A	12	42			is decreases in cropping areas because of shifts to higher value crops and urbanization a larger factor in this? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	No refs, so keep it as it is.
10-213	A	12	42	12	45	very old conclusion. (Xiong Wei, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences)	Old but very useful information, so retain it.
10-214	A	12	43	12	44	IN Sri Lanka, the part of upland soil erosion do not belong to the impacts of climate change (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Retained because it's a compounding stressor
10-215	A	12	51			Suggest to state as follows:" Beside precipitation, two key processes related to climate warming that have impacted the" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Done
10-216	A	13	1			rivers impacted by this don't exactly match set where irrigation is mots important (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	?
10-217	A	13	4	13	5	In India ,Iran, Pakistan,...(GCOS action plan for South and Southwest Asia, 2005) (Mohammad Rahimi, I. R. of Iran Meteorological Organization)	?
10-218	A	13	5			"northeastern China" should be " Northeast China" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-219	A	13	5	13	7	This sentence appears out of placve. Paragraph deals with permafrost and sentence refers to seasonal frost. (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	No action
10-220	A	13	6	13	6	is 'seasonally frozen ground' being confused with permafrost? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	No action
10-221	A	13	7	13	15	To be objective, the positive aspects to permafrost thawing should also be considered. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	S No reference support positive impacts of permafrost thawing, so retain it as it is.
10-222	A	13	14	13	14	delete '(see Table 10.4 below)' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text.
10-223	A	13	18			Table 10.4 in Page 13: Delete it. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Rejected
10-224	A	13	18	13		Table 10.4 - add the period during which these annual changes in temperature of permafrost took place. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Already in the table
10-225	A	13	19	13		Huijin is a family name of Dutch or a first name of Chinese? (Toshiaki Ichinose, National Institute for Environmental Studies)	Must be Chinese

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-226	A	13	22	13	22	decreased 4 to 5 m' relative to what? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	No action
10-227	A	13	23	13	24	Reference: Wang et al., 2004b (It is an impact of human activities) (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	No action.
10-228	A	13	27			<u>Check the degree of the temperature rise on the Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau. 0.8C does not match with the 0.1-0.3C in the Table 10.4. Which one is right?</u> (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Checking the difference.
10-229	A	13	30	14	3	<u>Receding glaciers and glacial lake outburst floods are also very serious in other parts of the Himalayas. Please see the report on "Glacial Lake Outburst Flood Monitoring and Early Warning System" in Bhutan and Nepal by UNEP and ICIMOD in 2002 available online at: http://www.rrcap.unep.org/issues/glof/. This reports finds glacial retreat of 30m -35m/year and identifies of potentially dangerous glacial lakes. While this report might classified as grey literature, there are not much refereed literature for the Himalayan area. If required, the report has references which support its findings in the two Himalayan Countries.</u> (Thinley Namgyel, National Environment Commission)	Considering the comment, and modify the text.
10-230	A	14	1	14	3	Should the recent observations of glacial melting be compared to studies of historical patterns of movement? There are studies of previous growth and decline. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Try to find literatures.
10-231	A	14	3			Note however that recent work in northern Pakistan suggests that <u>glaciers in this region may be expanding due to increases in winter precipitation over last 40 years</u> (see Archer, D.R. and Fowler, H.J. 2004. <u>Spatial and temporal variations in precipitation in the Upper Indus Basin, global teleconnections and hydrological implications. Hydrology and Earth System Sciences, 8(1), 47-61</u>) and <u>cooling of summer temperatures</u> (Fowler, H.J. and Archer, D.R. <u>Conflicting signals of climatic change in the Upper Indus Basin. Journal of Climate, Accepted subject to minor revisions</u>) causing reductions in summer ablation. This may have an impact on water resources in the region (Fowler, H.J. and Archer, D.R. 2005. <u>Hydro-climatological variability in the Upper Indus Basin and implications for water resources. In: Wagener, T. et al. (Eds.) Regional Hydrological Impacts of Climatic Change – Impact Assessment and Decision Making, IAHS Publication 295, pp. 131-138.</u>) (Hayley Fowler, Newcastle University)	Include the comment into the text.
10-232	A	14	5	14	17	Water shortages during dry season not only disturb crop production, but also the widespread of peat fire, particularly in Indonesia. This is important to mention because forest fire release a large amount of CO ₂ , SO ₂ and other gases that would increase global warming. Many authors have published this theme, such as Page et	CO ₂ release from peat fire is out of our coverage.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						all (2002) published in Nature Vol.420 (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	
10-233	A	14	5	14	17	This paragraph mixed the factors of climate change and the human factors. suggest to expess it in the follows: " Due to changing climate with the growth demands for water use, not only in arid Central Asia but also in many humid countries of South, Southeast Asia, water shortage is becoming more severely, and thus this situation led to overexploitation of water resource and further damage and disturb hydrologic conditions and circulation (e.g....)" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text.
10-234	A	14	5		17	Paragraph should be clear about water shortage related observed changes in climate trends and variability. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Modify the text.
10-235	A	14	6			which ones in SE Asia? Are these reports valid? Justified? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-236	A	14	7	14	10	In the Philippines, the country's freshwater resource provides water to three major users; namely agriculture, domestic use and industry. For instance, because power generation is principally from dams and/or lakes in some of the islands, impacts on power generation in these locations could be substantial and could result to substantial economic losses (PAGASA, 2001; Amadore, 2005) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Noted
10-237	A	14	8	14	8	Use of 'grave' is emotive. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Deleted
10-238	A	14	8			are you sure these are the explanations? Note importance of ENSO especially for Indonesia (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Noted
10-239	A	14	10	14	11	Decrease in surface water due to rise in temperature, should be replaced by decrease in precipitation, as it is key driving factor in comparision with rise temperature. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Done
10-240	A	14	11			betrunking? What is this? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text.
10-241	A	14	12	14	17	I sugest a new measure in Agricultural copping sector: Using deficit irrigation in arid and semi arid regions (Mohammad Rahimi, I. R. of Iran Meteorological Organization)	If we get the reference we will insert this
10-242	A	14	12	14	15	The reasons for the water shortages in <u>India, Pakistan, Nepal and Bangladesh</u> are	Cite the ref.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						discussed in some detail in "Water Needs in South Asia: Closing the Demand-Supply Gap", edited by Toufiq A. Siddiqi and Shirin Tahir-Kheli, published by Global Environment and Energy in the 21st Century, Honolulu, 2005. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	
10-243	A	14	13			although it may be fast the extent of industrilisation in Nepal and Bangladesh is still trivial - argument here is false (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	See # 10-242
10-244	A	14	15		17	delete - not impacts evidence (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-245	A	14	15	14	15	The sentence "In arid Central Asia,where water shortage is a perennial phenomenon;" has no meaning. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Deleted
10-246	A	14	19			Session 10.2.4.3 a large part of the phenomena might not relate to climate change. And it is easy to leed excessive response to climate change. It is necessary to separate the impacts of climate change from the impacts of human activities. Otherwise such a statement might has enlarged the impacts of climate change. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text considering the comment
10-247	A	14	29	14	31	sedimentation is one of important factors that cause the loss of wetlands. Other factors such as land use conversion to aquaculture, logging and human settlements need to be adequately elaborated (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Done
10-248	A	14	33			interaction with dam-building shold be commented upon (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Done
10-249	A	14	40	15	2	The issue of coral reef dynamics is based on literature published not later than 2002. This issue has been intensively dealt with in the TAR, and is under meticulous surveillance ever since; surely there is more recent literature on what happened with Asian coral reefs in during 2001-2003, at least. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	OK
10-250	A	14	45			What? SE Asia? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	?
10-251	A	14	46	14	47	In this para it says "the world's 70 Mangrove species", whereas in p. 15 line `6 there is a mention of "4 species" of mangroves in a certain areas. The reader is not clear whether these number related to species that live in the mangrove ecosystem, or it related to number of species of mangrove trees. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at	4 species are related to Indus delta

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						College Park)	
10-252	A	14	48	14	49	delete the sentence, 'The total annual (Burke et al., 2002).'	Retained for perspective of importance of corals in the region
10-253	A	14	50	15	12	In the Philippines, massive bleaching was observed in the aftermath of the 1997-1998 ENSO event. Coral studies during the periods from early June to late November in five areas in the country which included the Tubbataha Reefs, detected significant decreases in live coral cover of up to 46% and dead coral cover of up to 49% in some areas (Arceo, H.O. et al, 2001) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Ok inserted
10-254	A	15	1			Indonesia and the Philippines also took conservation efforts. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Deleted
10-255	A	15	4	15	7	delete the sentence, 'Several studies Ohman et al., 1997).'	Deleted
10-256	A	15	4		33	most of this has nothing to do with climate change (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-257	A	15	4	15	12	<u>quite old and general conclusion, most of the conclusions were hinted or talked in TAR, if there is no new researches, this paragraph can be deleted.</u> (Xiong Wei, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences)	Deleted
10-258	A	15	7	15	12	attach 'Consequently, the ... Westmacott et al., 2000).' to the end of Line 2 of Page 15 (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Deleted
10-259	A	15	7			but corals are not only important habitat for fish production (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-260	A	15	14	15	33	Try to shorten the statement, focusing on effects of saltwater intrusion and reduction of freshwater, rather than anthropogenic activities such as destruction of mangrove, excessive pesticide use and shrimp farming. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Deleted
10-261	A	15	14			I assume that this means total area of mangroves. This should be specified. (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	Deleted
10-262	A	15	20	15	20	Please make some elaboration on the meaning of ecosystem balances (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Deleted
10-263	A	15	20		31	Remove "Zafar, 2005" in lines 21, 22, 29, and 30. The reference at lines 25 and 31 would be sufficient. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Deleted
10-264	A	15	21	15	30	It is recommended to avoid repeated use of the same reference to (Zafar, 2005)	

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						within the text. If the information was taken from the same source, it is possible to refer to it once in the end of the cited text. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	
10-265	A	15	28	15	33	It would be more communicable if you could make a table on mangrove loss (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Deleted
10-266	A	15	35			weak and incomplete - pay more attention to studies of impacts of climate changes (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-267	A	15	37	15	42	This paragraph could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Paragraph Deleted
10-268	A	15	40	15	42	Cancel the statement of the second section, i.e., However, as it is not directly related to climate change (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Paragraph deleted
10-269	A	15	41			or more precisely "replacement of ..." much like elsewhere in the world (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Paragraph deleted
10-270	A	15	43	16	12	There needs to add a section addressing effects of rising temperature and decreasing precipitation leading to reduction and shrink of wetland in many areas of Asia. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Modify the text
10-271	A	15	44	16	12	The paragraph on forest fires in Russia would benefit from referring to recent work by Sukhinin and co-authors on remotely sensed extent of forest fires in Siberia (Remote Sensing of Environment), and their coupling to the Arctic Oscillation (Geophysical Research Letters). (Heiko Balzter, Centre for Ecology and Hydrology)	So far no ref, so no action
10-272	A	15	44			but are they valid? This is an assessment and should synthesize and draw conclusions (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-273	A	15	44	16	4	The first sentence should be more specific about relating forest fires to climate change in this paragraph. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Deleted
10-274	A	15	51	16	4	There are very few instances of fire in natural forests in SE Asia. Most fire is in degraded vegetation and is always human caused. Droughts exacerbate the fires. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Line revised
10-275	A	16	1	16	3	The 1997/98 ENSO event did not cause the forest and brush fires in Indonesia, but made it worse. Changes in land use, slash and burn cultivation, and intentional fires to cover illegal logging were probably the main causes.	OK the line revised

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	
10-276	A	16	3	16	4	Contrary to the Glantz figures, an interagency documentation report in the Philippines in 2001 states that the total forest cover lost to forest fire during the 1997-1998 ENSO was some 52,000 hectares (PAGASA, 2001) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Sentence revised to include both references
10-277	A	16	5			Supplement one paragraph After this paragraph: A study on the forming mechanism of desertification from the aspect of climate changes showed that the climate was a dominating factor for the formation and changes of desertification with time scale of thousand and tens of thousand years. In the modern period, warming and drying tendency of climate was a background element for the increasing desert land area in northern China. However anthropogenic elements have played an increasingly greater role in the forming process of desertification (Chen, et al., 2001). Chen Yiyu, Chen Panqin, Ge Quansheng et al., in : Water issues related to agriculture in western regions of China, P45, China Forestry Publishing House, 2001. (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Ok done the sentence revised
10-278	A	16	10		12	delete - not in impacts (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-279	A	16	10	16	10	10 16 10 16 10 Reference: Zhang et al., 2003 (It is a paper of permafrost.) (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Modify the text.
10-280	A	16	10	16	11	insert the word "species" between "and some" and "may" so that it reads "and some species may not persist", to distinguish between "organisms" in line 15 and "species" in line 16. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Deleted.
10-281	A	16	14			Session 10.2.4.5 It is suggested that this session is merged with session 10.2.4.4 and named "Natural ecosystem and biodiversity" materials used in this session, are not really about biodiversity. Some of them are about ecosystem. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Rejected
10-282	A	16	16	16	39	Figures on biodiversity loss should be included in order to emphasize the importance of the issue. Also, it could be more practical if the link between biodiversity loss and the vulnerability of livelihoods can be briefly explained (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	So far no good references
10-283	A	16	16	16	23	Shorten the section as it is not relate either directly or indirectly to climate change (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese	The text shortened

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						Academy of Forestry)	
10-284	A	16	16	16	23	There are too many causes lumped together. It would be useful to indicate which are the main causes, and which are smaller ones. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	The text shortened
10-285	A	16	18	16	18	10 16 18 16 18 After (.....of freshwater) put in (and climate change) (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	Done
10-286	A	16	22			change "have" with "has" (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Done
10-287	A	16	23			what about introduction of pests, weeds and diseases as a result of human activities - both on land and water (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Done
10-288	A	16	25	16	39	There are some studies about air temperature effects on plant phenology and the impact periods in Japan. Nasu et al. (2005) analyzed 16 phenological events (flowering, leaf unfolding, leaf coloring and leaf fall) for 12 species between 1961 and 2001 over Japan. They indicated that phenological events of the flowering of Japanese apricot (<i>Prunus mume</i>), Japanese cherry (<i>Prunus yedoensis</i> Matsum.), Japanese rhododendron (<i>Rhododendron kaempferi</i>), Japanese wisteria (<i>Wisteria floribunda</i>), and Japanese hydrangea (<i>Hydrangea macrophylla</i> Seringe) and the leaf unfolding of Japanese ginkgo (<i>Ginkgo biloba</i> L.) showed high sensitivity above 0.70 in correlation coefficient to changes in daily air temperature. The length of impact periods before the events were from 44days in leaf unfolding of Japanese ginkgo to 106days in flowering of Japanese hydrangea. Matsumoto et al (2003) showed that length of the growing season of the Japanese ginkgo (<i>Ginkgo biloba</i> L.) has been extended by 12 days between 1953 and 2000. Nasu A., Y. Shimizu and K. Omasa, 2005: Statistical analysis of the relationship between changes in plant phenology and daily mean air temperature in Japan under climate change. <i>Journal of Agricultural Meteorology</i> , 60(6), 1227-1229. Matsumoto K., T. Ohta, M. Irasawa and T. Nakamura, 2003: Climate change and extension of the <i>Ginkgo biloba</i> L. growing season in Japan, <i>Global Change Biology</i> , 9, 1634-1642. (Kenji Omasa, The University of Tokyo)	Still wait input from LA
10-289	A	16	25			Check the Millennium Ecosystem Assessment reports which has more information about biodiversity loss due to climate change. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Still wait input from LA
10-290	A	16	26	16	27	Use of words in this sentence is problematic: "foliage" and "mamalian" are not in	Ok corrected

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						place, probably should be replaced by "plant and mammalian species". Change the structure of this sentence. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	
10-291	A	16	31	16	32	"Chinese Evergreen Oak" is not clear. Add scientific name. (Nobuyuki Tanaka, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute(FFPRI))	Ok <i>Quercus myrsinifolia</i>
10-292	A	16	32	16	35	There should be some reference to temperatures or warmer/colder conditions in the regions mentioned. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	This text lists up detected impacts only
10-293	A	16	35	16	39	Statement concerning wetland should move to the section of natural ecosystem as it does not directly adress biodiversity. While upward movement of timberline can be added as it has been reported with indication of vegetation structure and species composition. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Ok will move the paragraph
10-294	A	16	36	16	39	This para does not relate specifically to "biodiversity"; it is about reduced wetlands - either move to where habitat alteration is described or say something specific on loss of species communities and what they are. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Ok will move the paragraph
10-295	A	16	41	17	30	Increasing extent and frequency of Bird flu occurrence in Asia, which results from climate change, has a great implication to human health, should be addressed in this section. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	No ref., so not included
10-296	A	16	51			to be added: Number of heat stroke patients is increasing in big cities in Japan in July and August. Duration of hours higher than 30 or daily maximum air temperature higher than 32 is the significant indecies. (Masatoshi Yoshino, United Nations University)	Ok done but we need the exact reference
10-297	A	17	1		16	not really impacts of changes in climate (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Ok Modify the text.
10-298	A	17	1		30	Human health is one area is which much literature (sometimes conflicting) is available and further revision should update the references and conclusions reached here. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Modify the text along with references.
10-299	A	17	11	17	13	Many of the biological organisms linked to the spread of infectious diseases are especially influenced by fluctuations in climate variables. Additionally, the	The text already contains the commented information.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						disruption of environmental health services and infrastructure like water supply and public sanitation by extreme climate events can contribute a significant rise in water and food-borne diseases. Reports from the Department of Health (DOH) of the Philippines reveal that several outbreaks of cholera, dengue, malaria and typhoid fever were reported in 1998 (also a La Niña year) in various parts of the country, especially in the Metro Manila area. The DOH also affirmed that the above-average incidence of these diseases had been due to hot climate conditions brought about by the El Niño and the fairly high humidity brought about by the onset of the rainy season (Relox, 1998; PAGASA, 2001; Amadore, 2005) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	
10-300	A	17	18	17	21	The relation of this cholera case to climate change is not clear or explicit, unless lines 29-30 are brought upfront. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Done
10-301	A	17	25	17	29	same comment as above (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	?
10-302	A	17	29		30	delete - speculation about future rather than observed or inferred impacts (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Sentence moved to top of paragraph
10-303	A	17	33			already a lot of discussion about other stressors in 10.2.4. Why have a separate section. Recommend delete section and include above where important interaction with climate (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Retain other stressors, and modify the text.
10-304	A	17	35	17	41	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Ok deleted
10-305	A	17	35	17	52	This section is globally valid, and not specific to Asia. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Nonetheless these are critical issues for Asia
10-306	A	17	43			The word 'description' should be changed to 'quantification' because description could connote less than accurate assessments (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Description can mean qualitative or quantitative assessment
10-307	A	17	46	17	48	delete two sentences, 'As described ... land cover change.' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Ok deleted
10-308	A	18	1	18	51	In sub-subsection 10.2.5, I suggest deleting sub-sub-subsections 10.2.5.1 and 10.2.5.2.	

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	
10-309	A	18	1	18	52	delete this page (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Make 10.2.5 more concise
10-310	A	18	1			may be much less of a problem for most countries in Asia than rapid fertility declines that threaten economic development where it is still needed (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Ok Revise statement
10-311	A	18	1	18		Section 10.2.5.1 is too wordy and long. It has population data up to year 2000. More updated data are available but are not provided. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	OK Make the section more concise
10-312	A	18	1	18	52	"section 10.2.5.1 comment: Too much description on population growth. Placing this section and section 10.2.5.2 in section 10.3 on Page 19 socio-economic scenarios would be more appropriate." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Noted.
10-313	A	18	3			It should be mentioned that recently population growth rate has been significantly reduced mainly due to high economic growth in East and Southeast Asia compared to an anticipated growth rate. (Mitsuhiro Nakagawa, Ibaraki University)	Specific to East and Southeast Asia, so not incorporated
10-314	A	18	3			Reference required. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Find and incorporate reference
10-315	A	18	12	18	13	I think flood plains are changing mainly due to increasing land use, which affects the hydrological cycle... (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Ok idea considered
10-316	A	18	12	18	16	This paragraph is about the future increase of population. It should be moved to the session 10.4.6 (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	No we need it here
10-317	A	18	13			Clarify "changes in hydrological cycle" - can be dam construction, climate factor, or others? (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Ok done
10-318	A	18	18		19	evidence? False. Most upland farming allows regeneration of forests in contrast to intensified lowland systems (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Well some allow regeneration but some don't for various reasons
10-319	A	18	22			this study's conclusions are contradicted by many others (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text.
10-320	A	18	24	18	28	This paragraph is about the future food demand. It should be moved to the session 10.4.6	Retained in this section

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
10-321	A	18	30			many may be helpful to adaptation - greater capacities from more resources (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Ok
10-322	A	18	30			Section 10.2.5.2 has no references. Especially worrying is the information on deforestation and afforestation that are not quantified, and not based on cited literature. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	References will be provided for this section
10-323	A	18	32			"much of the greenhouse gases emitted" : in the past context, yes. However, other possibilities are suggested in e.g. p.41, p.48 of this chapter. (Hideyuki Kobayashi, Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport)	???
10-324	A	18	32		51	what do these paras have to do with the heading? No logical links are made (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-325	A	18	32	18	35	It would be useful to specify what sort of development is being discussed, I.e. economic development, land development, industrial development, etc. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Ok will define development
10-326	A	18	37	18	37	development' should be changed to 'expansion'? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Ok done
10-327	A	18	37		43	Couple of key references would be useful - an opportunity to incorporate key Russian references (TSU has emphasized the necessity to bring in more non-English language references). (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Ok references will be provided
10-328	A	18	39	18	39	Need reference here. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Yes it will be
10-329	A	18	40	18	40	desertification is anthropogenic only, by definition. This issue was also commented in the zero order draft. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Jafari to respond.
10-330	A	18	45		51	per capita? Over what period? Copld this be seen as a highly positive statistic indicating successful expansion of agriculture and societies? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	?
10-331	A	18	45	18	46	Is it still higher in Asia than in South America? (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	We don't know
10-332	A	18	45		51	Reference(s) required, especially for line 47. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Finding references
10-333	A	18	46	18	47	You need to include the source of the rate forest loss (30 900 Km2) (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Finding references

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-334	A	18	47	18	48	The underlying causes of deforestation are also the conversion of forests into estate crop plantations (i.e oil palm), and mining (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Modify the text
10-335	A	18	48			what evidence that fuelwood gathering causes "deforestation"? Logging? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Finding references
10-336	A	18	48	18	51	The same thing happen in China as Kuwait does, i.e., forest cover is steadily increasing due to large scale tree planting (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Ok inserted
10-337	A	18	51			It should be mentioned that China implemented a new environmentally protective policy converting inferior cultivating land to forest or grassland with a subsidy in 2000. (Mitsuhiro Nakagawa, Ibaraki University)	Ok we need reference for this
10-338	A	19	0			it would be appropriate to include 2 or 3 paragraphs about performace of different models in describing current climate in the various subregions. Some do not do very well at all or do so only in some types of locations, like a long way from coasts. This could help reader interpret table 10.5 (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Subject matter of WG I - Regional scenarios Chapter – Ignored.
10-339	A	19	2			Section 10.3 Title change: 'Future projection' might be better than 'Future trends'. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Accepted
10-340	A	19	2	19	2	change 'trends' to 'projection' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Accepted
10-341	A	19	6	19	16	Should there be a reference to how and why scenarios have changed since the TAR? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Not relevant for WG II – have been dealt in WG I.
10-342	A	19	6	21	25	This section needs some discussion of the Asian Brown Cloud study http://www.rrcap.unep.org/abc/impactstudy/ (Ulka Kelkar, TERI (The Energy and Resources Institute))	Not relevant for WG II –aerosol forcing implications have been dealt in WG I.
10-343	A	19	6	21	25	Additional references: (1) Rupa Kumar K. and Ashrit R.G., Regional aspects of global climate change simulations: validation and assessment of climate response over Indian monsoon region to transient increase of greenhouse gases and sulfate aerosols, <i>Mausam</i> , 52, 2001, 229-244. (2) Kang I.S., Jin K., Lau K.M., Shukla J., Krishnamurthy V., Schubert S.D., Wailser D.E., Stern W.F., Satyan V., Kitoh A., Meehl G.A., Kanamitsu M., Gadin V.Ya., Sumi A., Wu G., Liu Y. and Kim J.K., Intercomparison of atmospheric GCM simulated anomalies associated with the 1997-98 El Nino, <i>Journal of Climate</i> , 15, 2002, 2791-2805. (3) Kang I.S., Jin K., Wang B., Lau K.M., Shukla J., Krishnamurthy V., Schubert S.D., Wailser D.E.,	References 2 to 5 are pertinent to WG I Regional Chapter. Reference 1 is included in revised FOD.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						Stern W.F., Kitoh A., Meehl G.A., Kanamitsu M., Gadin V.Ya., Satyan V., Park C.K. and Liu Y., Intercomparison of the climatological variations of Asian summer monsoon precipitation simulated by 10 GCMs, <i>Climate Dynamics</i> , 19, 2002, 383-395. (4) Krishnan R. and Sugi M., Pacific decadal oscillation and variability of the Indian summer monsoon rainfall, <i>Climate Dynamics</i> , 2003, 21, 233-242. (5) Devara P.C.S., Raj P. E., Pandithurai G., Maheskumar R.S. and Dani K.K., Climate change and monsoon activity using long-term lidar aerosol observational profiles, <i>Vayu Mandal</i> , 31, 2004, 8-13 (Ulka Kelkar, TERI (The Energy and Resources Institute))	
10-344	A	19	11	19	11	Define SRES (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Done
10-345	A	19	13			"section 10.3.1 comment: while WGII of AR4 suggests to use time slices: 2030s, 2050s and 2080s, this chapter uses 2020s, 2050s and 2080s instead. It might be difficult to change given the existing research results." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	The time slices used in scenarios for WG II are 2010-2039, 2040-2069 and 2070-2099 (Tim's document); thus the use of 2020s, 2050s and 2080s is correct.
10-346	A	20	0	21		Some of the projection results in the text are not match with that in the Table 10.5, It should give some explanation (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	The text contains additional information on projections inferred from e.g., RCM studies and hence may not be identical (minor deviation or more details) – the Table however contains the consistent scenario derived for WG II and perhaps applied for all regional chapters.
10-347	A	20	2	20	2	Table 10.5: To improve value of Table 10.5, it is recommended to include an additional column or provide supplementary text on page 21 to explain present regional temperature and precipitation values. This will make projection results more clear and informative. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	Should be in WG I regional Chapter and not here.
10-348	A	20	2	20	2	Table 10.5: It is recommended to provide a legend to Table 10.5 to explain what the abbreviations of seasons mean. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	Yes – legend inserted.
10-349	A	20	2			should indicate figures are means from 5 models. Perhaps could indicate in bold where 90% confidence mean does not include XXXXX (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Yes – stated in the legend.
10-350	A	21	1	21	25	How do the upper limits of some of the temperature projections compare with results of paleoclimate studies for the region? Do they exceed limits recorded for previous historical periods? Perspective needed.	Not in WG II – subject matter to be covered in WG I.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	
10-351	A	21	1	21	25	How about the situation in other regions that have not mentioned in the text? What is the principle for selection which region is given detailed discription? (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	These have been included in the text depending upon availability of regional scenarios.
10-352	A	21	1	21	1	Propose to explain what NH means. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	NH - Northern hemisphere – appropriately corrected in revision.
10-353	A	21	4	21	4	Propose to explain what DTR means. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	DTR – Diurnal temperature range – appropriately inserted.
10-354	A	21	12		18	Given first sentence, subsequent ones do not make sense (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	First sentence has now gone as the last sentence of the para.
10-355	A	21	14			the Plateau refered to which plateau? (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Tibetan – corrections made in revision.
10-356	A	21	25	21		at the end of the paragraph of Future climate change scenaros " Statistical downscaling approach of pattern-scaling method for several GCM outputs were used for Sri Lanka to obtain temperature rise projections over Sri Lanka, which yielded values in the range 1.0 - 3.0 C by 2100 for different emission scenarios (Basnayake et. al, 2004). The rainfall (monthly, seasonal and annual) is projected to increase under the A1FI, A2 and B1 storylines with HadCM3 and CSIRO GCMs. The aerial extent, where the highest rainfalls are confined, is also projected to increase with the increase of rainfall . Rainfall change is higher during the southwest monsoon season (May to September) than that of the northeast monsoon season from December to February (Basnayake et. al, 2004)" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	The said publication is not available to authors. The reviewer must provide a copy of the said publication for us to appreciate the findings and report it here.
10-357	A	21	30	22	23	References for Section 10.3.2: Geng Q and Sugi M. 2003. Possible Change of Extratropical Cyclone Activity due to Enhanced Greenhouse Gases and Sulfate Aerosols—Study with a High-Resolution AGCM. Journal of Climate 16 (13): 2262 - 2274 (Ulka Kelkar, TERI (The Energy and Resources Institute))	The extra-tropical cyclones have not been discussed in section 10.3.2.
10-358	A	21	30	21	31	ENSO events significantly influence the interannual and intraseasonal sea level pressure variability in the Philippines. Additionally, extreme climatic events such as floods and droughts in the country were found to be associated with ENSO episodes (Jose et al, 2000) (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Yes – Philippines is part of SE Asia. Suggested reference not tracable.
10-359	A	21	35			"drought or flood" is better than " drought and flood" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Not agreed.
10-360	A	21	51			Krihara, 2005 should be read "Kurihara et al., 2005"	It is correctly cited as Kurihara et al., 2005 in

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Masatoshi Yoshino, United Nations University)	the text and in Figure 10.3.
10-361	A	22	1			The word "Yangtze" and "Changjiang" in the other parts of the text should be unified (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	done.
10-362	A	22	1			Table 10.6 in Page 33: Delete 'Years' and '2004' in first column. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	done.
10-363	A	22	4	22	13	This part before "the number" should be moved to the session 10.3.1 Future climate change scenarios (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Not agreed.
10-364	A	22	4		51	First sentence mentioned South and Southeast Asia but these subregions are not covered in the discussion which covers only East Asia. Need to bring in results of modelling experiments for South and Southeast Asia as they become available. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	<u>Will be attempted at later stage of revision when more recent published materials are available.</u>
10-365	A	22	23	22	23	delete '(Fig. 10.3)' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Why – this is the only place in chapter where fig 10.3 has been cited?
10-366	A	22	35	22		"predicated" should be "projected" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Yes – corrected.
10-367	A	22	35		35	should be "heavy rain" instead of "Heaby rain" (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	Yes – corrected.
10-368	A	22	38	22	49	Fig 10.3 are too small, difficult to read (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	<u>Will be updated later.</u>
10-369	A	22	38			Fig. 10.3 in Page 22: Delete it. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Why – this is the only place in chapter where fig 10.3 has been cited?
10-370	A	22	50	22	51	"predicated" should be "projected" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Yes – corrected.
10-371	A	22	50			Fig. 10.3 - enhance the border of land masses, since it is very difficult to interpret the spatial extent of changes. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	<u>Will be updated later.</u>
10-372	A	23	1	23	20	"Section 10.3.3 comment: delete the section Sea level rise." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Why – the recent issue of rapid sea level rise makes it a very relevant topic for Asia.
10-373	A	23	3			what about regional specificity? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	<u>Additional information would be added later on regional aspects of SLR.</u>
10-374	A	23	3		19	Section 10.3.3. Key references required for both paragraphs. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Will be inserted later.
10-375	A	23	5	23	10	Need to quote the literature on the figure mentioned in the text	Will be inserted later.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	
10-376	A	23	5	23	10	This paragraph is about the past sea level rise. It should be removed to the session 10.2.4.3. Reference about this paragraph should be given. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	No – not agreed. Note the last sentence on acceleration.
10-377	A	23	5	23	19	It is necessary to put a paragraph about the projected trend for 100 years (this century) between the two paragraphs, because there seems a big gap between the 20th century's trend and 1000 years' projection about sea-level rise. (Hiromune Yokoki, Ibaraki University)	<u>Yes – will be done for SOD.</u>
10-378	A	23	6	23	8	It is mentioned that "The current rate of sea level rise in coastal areas of Asia is reported to be between 1 to 3 mm per year , marginal greater than the global average". This is not true. Because the high rates of 3 mm/yr along the coast of Bangladesh, for example, is probably due to land sinking in the delatic regions and not due to global warming. We have a recent paper , which gives about 1 mm/yr for the Indian coasts. (Unnikrishnan Alakkat, National Institute of Oceanography)	<u>What about the rates in Southeast Asian coastline? Not accepted. Appropriate citations will be included in SOD.</u>
10-379	A	23	8	23	9	Which region is reffered to in this sentence (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	<u>It's the average for Asia – citation will be included to eliminate ambiguity.</u>
10-380	A	23	9	23	9	Reference needed here. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Will be inserted later.
10-381	A	23	10			From the rate higher than the long term average, it is hard to get the conclusion that the rate of sea level rise has accelerated. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Can't help. Additional citations will be inserted later.
10-382	A	23	12	23	19	This paragraph does not close to the topic about sea level rise in Asia. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	More details will be added in SOD.
10-383	A	23	26	23	31	From "In the SRES" to "N-deposition" is not necessary. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	The term N-deposition is deleted.
10-384	A	24	23	24	34	This paragraph does not close to the topic about Asia. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Major world regions include Asia as well.
10-385	A	24	28		34	why is this reviwed here? Not related to climate impacts (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	It is relevant to adaptation and mitigation approaches for developing countries of Asia.
10-386	A	24	37			In general there should be comparisons in this section with the projections made in the TAR to show what has changed since 2001. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Information in TAR is summarized in 10.1
10-387	A	24	37			I think the sub-sub sections would benefit from having a summary table, to compare features discussed with geographic regions. E.g., table 10.10 (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	One idea is to move Table 10.10 to the end of 10.4.
10-388	A	24	37			weakness of 10.2.4 undermines convincingsness of 10.4. Would expect argments to	

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						combine info on predicted change and historical trend or mechanistic arguments (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	
10-389	A	24	37	25	27	section 10.4.1, it is very difficult to get the summary of impacts, since the climate change scenarios is arranged by SRES scenarios (e.g. A1F1) and time periods (e.g. 2020s,2050s), why not give the information according to each SRES scenarios or time periods. a table would be better to understand authors' arguments. (Xiong Wei, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences)	There no consistent information
10-390	A	24	37	43	7	Section 10.4. Consider a short paragraph to show the thrust of this section and the link to all subsections. As mentioned in the general comments, you could also consider how you want to address the issue of time lines in relation to the impacts. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Try to do this, but not done yet.
10-391	A	24	37			"section 10.4 comment: future climate impacts are presented generally without critical review on the updated work. New improvement of these impact studies is not mentioned." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Incorporate the latest literatures which are mostly reviewed journals.
10-392	A	24	41	25	5	have declines in agricultural production been detected since the TAR? If so, this should be highlighted. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Agricultural production predicted is related to the scenarios and climate model used.
10-393	A	24	41			Session 10.4.1.1 The two paragraphs in this session should be merged together and reorganized+K89 (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	?K89
10-394	A	24	43	28	4	References for Section 10.4.1: (1) Sivakumar M V K, Das HP, and Brunini O. Impacts of Present and Future Climate Variability and Change on Agriculture and Forestry in the Arid and Semi-Arid Tropics. Climatic Change 70 (1-2): 31-72. (2) O'Brien K, Leichenko R, Kelkar U et al. 2004. Mapping vulnerability to multiple stressors: climate change and globalization in India. Global Environmental Change 14: 303-313. (3) TERI. 2003. Coping with global change - vulnerability and adaptation in Indian agriculture. http://www.teriin.org/coping/papers.htm (4) Krishna Kumar K., Rupa Kumar K., Ashrit R.G., Deshpande N.R. and Hansen J.W., Climate impacts on Indian agriculture, International Journal of Climatology, 24, 2004, 1375-139 (Ulka Kelkar, TERI (The Energy and Resources Institute))	Thanks.
10-395	A	24	43	43	7	References for Section 10.4 (multiple sectors): (1) Government of India. 2004. Vulnerability assessment and adaptation. Chapter 3 in National Communication of India to the UNFCCC. www.natcomindia.org . (2) DEFRA. 2005. India-UK collaboration on impacts of climate change in India	Thanks.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						http://www.defra.gov.uk/environment/climatechange/impacts%2Dindia/ (Ulka Kelkar, TERI (The Energy and Resources Institute))	
10-396	A	24	43		47	IRRI (Centeno, 2005) has a new paper on impact of climate change on rice production (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Try to get a ref.
10-397	A	24	45	24	47	In the sentence: "As a consequence of the combined influence of fertilization effect and the accompanying thermal stress and water scarcity under the projected climate change scenarios....," there is an inconsistency with respect to the words "water scarcity", because the Table 10.5 shows an increase in precipitation for Asia except in Central Asia and Winter South Asia. (Janaka Dr Ratnasiri, Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS))	Modify the text.
10-398	A	24	51	24	51	Propose to replace maize with corn, because maize is not cultivated within the region in question. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	Text Deleted
10-399	A	25	3	25	5	not about productivity but about the cropping area (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	?
10-400	A	25	3	25	5	A controversial statement since droughts and floodings may offset the positive effect. There is no reference, anyway. (Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)	?
10-401	A	25	3	25	5	Improve sentence structure. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify text
10-402	A	25	5	25	5	Propose to replace maize with corn, because maize is not cultivated within the region in question. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	Use maize
10-403	A	25	10	25	10	change 'through' to 'though' (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	corrected
10-404	A	25	10			In assessing climate change impacts on agriculture, the effect of increased cloud cover resulting from increased precipitation that would give a reduction of radiation has not been addressed. (Janaka Dr Ratnasiri, Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS))	No references available
10-405	A	25	18			tonne' =tons? (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	corrected
10-406	A	25	27	25		at the end of 2nd paragraph of production and quality "A study on climate change	Not accompanied by ref. so no action.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						impacts on tea plantations carried out in Sri Lanka has shown that the productivity of tea grown at high elevations shows an increase of 2-4% and tea at low elevations show a decrease of 1-3%, depending on the GCMs" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	
10-407	A	25	29			How about the relationship between the changes of productivity and farming system? Whether could give a concept that could or in what degree the change of the farming system be able to reduce the negative impacts of climate change on the unit productivity? (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Appropriate citation on this aspect will be explored.
10-408	A	25	29			Good section (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Thanks
10-409	A	25	31	25	42	Unclear how much of decline is due to CC versus soil degradation? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	No references available
10-410	A	25	44	25	49	This part is only general statement or does not related to future impact of climate change. It could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-411	A	25	50	25	50	Use of 'will' should be replaced by ' is estimated to' Study finding should be described carefully! (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Corrected
10-412	A	26	4	26	4	Use of 'will' should be replaced by ' are likely to' (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Text deleted
10-413	A	26	4	26	14	This paragraph does not close to the topic about the impact of climate change.It could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-414	A	26	4	26	5	attach 'Rising sea levels will ... most concentrated.' to the end of Line 42 of Page 26 (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-415	A	26	5	26	14	delete the sentences 'In India, urbanization ... billions in Asia.' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-416	A	26	27	26	39	This paragraph is only general discussion, without any detailed data (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-417	A	26	27	26	28	delete the sentence, 'In Asia and the ... FAO, 2004a).'	Modify the text
10-418	A	26	27		39	Evidence about fisheries linkages/impacts is weak. Review literature more carefully. What about flood regimes and fish life cycles? This might be biggest threat for climate change and it intersects with floodplain uses and withdrawals (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	No references available

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-419	A	26	29		30	...predator to limate change...' not clear what is meant by this statement. (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	Modify the text
10-420	A	26	32	26	33	it may be put more clearly "lower availability of dissolved oxygen due to rise in surface air temperatues." (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	corrected
10-421	A	26	41	27	20	Session 10.4.1.4 This session is only general discussion, without any detailed data. At least the last two paragaphes could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Retain the text
10-422	A	26	43	26	45	delete two sentences, 'Half the world's ... many countries.' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Retain the text
10-423	A	27	2			"yield declines projected" is ? Usually yield will continually increase due to technological progress. (Mitsuhiro Nakagawa, Ibaraki University)	Yield means production in this text
10-424	A	27	3			why is there no attention to important fertility transitions well underway in many countries of the region? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	No references available
10-425	A	27	5	27	13	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Retain the text
10-426	A	27	5			why no consideration of competition between meat and cereals here? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	No references available
10-427	A	27	9			What are 'orphan crops'? (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Deleted
10-428	A	27	12			remove "are". (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	corrected
10-429	A	27	15	27	20	attach this paragraph to the end of Line 3 of Page 27 (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Retain this text as it is
10-430	A	27	22			The titile is suggested to change to "Loss from extreme climate events and pests" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Retain as it is
10-431	A	27	22	28	4	delete those paragraphs (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Retain the text
10-432	A	27	22			In Section 10.4.1.5 Crop diseases could also deteriorate the quality of food. Particularly in instances when the disease incidence is partial then the good could get mixed the diseased ones and result in poor quality of the farm produce or the finished product (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	No references available

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-433	A	27	24	28	4	Session 10.4.1.5 This session is only general discussion, without any detailed data. At least the last paragraph from could be deleted. Other two paragraphs should be reduced (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Retain and modify the text
10-434	A	27	24		25	Zhang and Guo 2004' in the Lit cited appears as 'Zhang and Gao..' (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	Corrected
10-435	A	27	27			The sentence "Asia has most developing countries including some poorest countries in the world" is not factually correct. Asia has only 37 countries of which 2 are developed, whereas Africa has 54 countries of which all are developing. Of the 20 poorest countries in the world, only 3 are in Asia, while 16 are in Africa (UN Databases). (Janaka Dr Ratnasiri, Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS))	Deleted
10-436	A	27	27			but how much confidence is there in how global warming will impact ENSO or Asian monsoons? Doesn't this over-ride this confidence? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Finding refs.
10-437	A	27	27			Replace El Niño with ENSO. For example, it is known that frequency of tropical cyclones decreases during El Niño, but increases during La Nina. (Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)	Modify El Nino with ENSO
10-438	A	27	36			Change "cropping" to "mono-cropping" (Janaka Dr Ratnasiri, Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS))	Text deleted
10-439	A	27	43	27	46	Decreasing pathogen mortality due to cold winter temperature shoul be replaced by warmer winter temperature as it occurs in the ealier satement at row of 43. It should be consistent with prejected winter temperature scenario in the same section. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Corrected
10-440	A	28	9	28	9	change 'Water availability and demand' to 'Water availability, quality and demand' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Not necessary/ quality is written separately
10-441	A	28	11	28	12	The sentence "The most serious threat caused by climate change in Asia is water scarcity characterized by temperature increase and precipitation decrease" is not consistent with the information given in Table 10.5, which shows increased precipitation in Asia, except in Central Asia and winter South Asia. (Janaka Dr Ratnasiri, Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS))	10.5 done by adding "mainly in central Asia"
10-442	A	28	14			of what? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	It seems main text is ok.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-443	A	28	17	28	22	"section 10.4.2 comment: delete from Changes in runoff to the catchments... to line 22." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	10.4.2 there is no comment
10-444	A	28	24	28	26	10 28 24 28 26 (Under the of this century .) (Zhang and Liu, 1994) Delete this paragraph. It is an impact of observed (20th century) climate change. (Ke-Rang Li, Chinese Academy of Sciences)	First projected sentences could be deleted
10-445	A	28	29	28	31	The paragraph mainly talking about the water resource related to glacier. But the water resource shortage in North China could not be attributed to this type. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	This paragraph is separated.
10-446	A	28	31	28	34	delete the sentence, 'In Northwest China, ... Wang et al., 2001).'	Deleted
10-447	A	28	34	28	35	Widespread recession of glacier in Asia would have many severe environmental impacts, such as enhanced evaporation from grassland and wetland, it is hard to understand how recession of glacier can lead to enhanced evaporation from grassland and wetland, while increasing air temperature could be the case. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Done/ deleted
10-448	A	28	36			Add the sentence "Increased sea surface temperature resulting from climate change will enhance the occurrence of cyclones in the Indian Ocean." (Janaka Dr Ratnasiri, Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS))	Done/ deleted
10-449	A	28	37	28	38	This issue has been already dealt with earlier in this Chapter. Not clear what is "Location of reinsurance industry". (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Done / deleted
10-450	A	28	50	29	6	This paragraph is better put at the beginning of the session 10.4.2.1 (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	10.4.2.1 done /deleted
10-451	A	28	50	29	6	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Done/
10-452	A	28	50		51	truism - says nothing. What do you mean here? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Done/deleted
10-453	A	28	51	29	3	Poorly structured sentence. (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	Done / deleted
10-454	A	29	1		6	meaningless para - rewrite or drop (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Done / deleted

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-455	A	29	8	29	8	delete this line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Is title
10-456	A	29	10			how? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	deleted
10-457	A	29	10	29	14	Salinity has been a big problem in the Indus basin areas of Pakistan. Several studies have been undertaken on this for the World Bank. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	If reference will be available could be added.
10-458	A	29	20	29	27	The heavy metal, particularly mercury, is important to emphasize. A case of Newmont at Buyat, Sulawesi and other parts of Indonesia (Kalimantan for example) have shown the contamination of mercury as result of gold mining (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	If reference will be available could be added.
10-459	A	29	20	29	29	This paragraph is not about future situation of water quality. It could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Done/ deleted
10-460	A	29	26		27	this seems to assume uniform decline in ppt. which has not been forecast (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Done/ deleted
10-461	A	29	29	30	14	session 10.4.2.3 It is better to merge this session into the session 10.4.2.1. Most part in this session are about water availability instead of flood or drought (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	10.4.2.3 not necessary but could be edited later
10-462	A	29	31		32	weird sentence - rephrase (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-463	A	29	32	29	33	not clear (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	Deleted
10-464	A	29	36			"northwest" should be "Northwest" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Accepted
10-465	A	29	41	29	44	not clear what authors are saying. (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	Retain as it is
10-466	A	29	50			what do you mean? Surely must indicate per capita? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Per capita
10-467	A	30	1			may be modified to read as "December, January and February implying lesser storage and greater water stress during a subsequent lean monsoon season." for better clarity. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	done
10-468	A	30	4			Following sentence should be added: Increasing air temperature and decreasing rainfall tendencies are prevailing in the arid and semi-arid areas in NW to NE China. These conditions provide more severe environment problems to the farmers (Yoshino, 2005). [Ref.: Yoshino, M., 2005: Agroclimatological problems in the Taklimakan desert and surrounding area in NW China. Jour. Agric. Meteorology,	Accepted

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						61(1), 1-14] (Masatoshi Yoshino, United Nations University)	
10-469	A	30	6		14	are these reliable studies. Why choose this and not refer to other more recent work? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Finding ref.
10-470	A	30	9	30	10	Is ADB report primary source of river flow data and projection analysis? If not, suggest that primary source is used. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Finding ref.
10-471	A	30	13			remove repetition (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	done
10-472	A	30	17			This subsection contains several sub sub sections and even paragraphs of varying writing style and quality. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	10.4.3 Unaccepted
10-473	A	30	19	30	19	change 'Sea level rise and coastal erosion' to 'Sea level rise and inundation' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Revised as "coastal erosion and inundation of coastal lowland"
10-474	A	30	19			Section 10.4.3.1 should also include effect of sea level rise on coral reefs. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	revised
10-475	A	30	21	30	23	delete two sentences, 'The global ... ACIA, 2004).'	Deleted
10-476	A	30	25	30	25	" ...one time greater than..." this means X1. Do you mean twice as much (i.e. X2)? (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	X1
10-477	A	30	28	30	28	Zhujiang, Changjiang and Huanghe should be consistent throughout the report, for example, Changjiang and Huanghe i.e., Yangtze River and Yellow River. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	accepted
10-478	A	30	37			needs explanation. Unit is incorrect. Should be a rate (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Revised
10-479	A	30	37			Change "4500 cm" to "45 metres". (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	revised
10-480	A	30	46		47	unclear meaning. Check text (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	revised
10-481	A	30	47	30	47	insert 'be' before 'more' (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	revised
10-482	A	30	50	30	50	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	revised

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-483	A	31	1	31	4	delete three sentences, 'Coastal low land ... Wassmann et al., 2004).'	revised
10-484	A	31	1			The lowlands will not "tend" to be, they WILL be inundated. (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	revised
10-485	A	31	4			how does this argument work? Annual rates of change are miniscule relative to other factors like storm surges - argument is faulty (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-486	A	31	7			"..number of coastal population flooded.." should be " number of people flooded in coastal populations". (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	revised
10-487	A	31	12	31	15	Sentence is not clear to me. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	revised
10-488	A	31	12			sentence doesn't make sense, rephrase (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	revised
10-489	A	31	12			Not clear. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	revised
10-490	A	31	18			misleading stats. Sea-level rise doesn't happen in single step (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	revised
10-491	A	31	26		27	This sentence belongs to section 10.5 (Adaptation). (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Deleted
10-492	A	31	27			have any benefits of coastal flooding been reported. Could sea-level changes impacts of other human activities? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-493	A	31	29	31	36	This paragraph may be removed to the beginning of the Session 10.4.3 (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Retain as it is
10-494	A	31	29	31	36	Arctic coastal area will be significantly damaged (see chapter 12) (Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)	Arctic coastal area is treated in Ch 12
10-495	A	31	29	31	36	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Retain it
10-496	A	31	47			update. Already happened (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	But this text cites a ref.
10-497	A	31	49			yes but this from a very low baseline, population are still largely rural in most countries (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-498	A	32	1	32	7	The unit of the area should be unified to km ² . It conflicts me that two different units are used to show the area.	revised

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Hironune Yokoki, Ibaraki University)	
10-499	A	32	7			too vague a citation (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	revised
10-500	A	32	9	32	9	Should 'estuarine' be inserted before 'ecosystems'? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	revised
10-501	A	32	9	32	17	This part is only general statement or does not related to future impact of climate change. It could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Deleted
10-502	A	32	9	32	17	delete the sentences, 'Saltwater ecosystems ... 1999).' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Deleted
10-503	A	32	9			Replace "Saltwater ecosystems" with "Marine ecosystems". (Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)	Deleted
10-504	A	32	19			"River Yangtse" should be "Yangtze River". ". The word "Yangtze" and "Changjiang" in the orther parts of the text should be unified (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Accepted, but the text deleted
10-505	A	32	19	32	19	Along River Changjiang should be changed Yangtze River (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	The text deleted
10-506	A	32	19		25	Belongs to section 10.5. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Deleted
10-507	A	32	22	32	22	Again, please directly metion the types of ecosystems under threats that are urgently needed to restore. I would suggest mangroves, coral reefs, and peatlands (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Deleted
10-508	A	32	24	32	24	reference to 'past glory' is unnecessary (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Deleted
10-509	A	32	24			Glory? What? Explain. Which cultures? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-510	A	32	27	32	29	delete two sentences, 'Among aquatic ... Paerl et al., 2003).' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-511	A	32	35			this is also anthropogenic. Explain. Doubtful logic. Could it be opposite. Reliance leads to good management. Exploitation for international trade and by foreign companies over-exploits because they can move elsewhere (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-512	A	32	36	32	45	This paragraph does not related to future impact of climate change. It could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-513	A	32	42		43	Surveys on reefs are conducted annually and it is likely that Wilkinson (2006) can	OK, The data will be updated if new report

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						be incorporated into the final version of this chapter. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	will be published.
10-514	A	32	43	32	45	10 years seems too short a time for the reefs to recover. Are you sure? (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Data by Wilkinson show recovering during last years.
10-515	A	32	47			unclear. Do you mean inconsequential? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Yes
10-516	A	33	0			Suggest moving column 4 to the last column, so that the other columns would add up to 100%. Also suggest changing it to provide only the reef recovered data, since the reef destroyed information is already in column 3. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Modify the table
10-517	A	33	1	33	2	Table 10.6. Please mention the source of this information (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	revised
10-518	A	33	1			Table 10.6 could be deleted too (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Retain the table
10-519	A	33	1			delete years in table under title "region/years" (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	revised
10-520	A	33	1			Table 10.6. See above comments for revision of Wilkinson. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	accepted
10-521	A	33	6	33	11	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Retain the text
10-522	A	33	11			what do others say about this? Is it a large enough effect? What about sea-level rise, UV radiation ... (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	revised
10-523	A	33	13			Sub-sub-subsection '10.4.3.4 Marine fisheries and aquaculture' could be re-located in sub-sub-subsection '10.4.1.3 Livestock, fishery, aquaculture' in Page 26. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	accepted
10-524	A	33	13	33	13	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Move it to 10.4.1.3
10-525	A	33	14	33	20	move the sentences ('The Asia-Pacific ... industrial pollution.') to the front part of Line 28 of Page 26 (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Accepted
10-526	A	33	16	33	26	From "most of" to "fishery activities" could be deleted because it does not related to climate change (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	S Modify the text and move it to 10.4.13.
10-527	A	33	19			aquaculture itself can promote depletion of fisheries. Consider 4 kg of fish feed for 1 kg of shrimp or salmon (see and reflect on pg 34 lines 8-13) (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	To be checked – Batima and Li

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-528	A	33	20	33	23	delete this sentence (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Accepted
10-529	A	33	20		23	reasons for over-exploitation are related to large trawler fleets as much as anything else (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Noted
10-530	A	33	21			"status quo" - this is not desirable (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-531	A	33	25	34	13	move these paragraphs to Line 40 of Page 26 (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Accepted
10-532	A	33	26	33	27	The "Recent studies" mentioned need to be referred to. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	Finding refs.
10-533	A	33	38	33	39	Replace "Marine fishes" with "Marine fisheries". Also replace "Main marine commercial fishes" with "Principal marine fishery species". (Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)	accepted
10-534	A	33	39	33	39	change 'litle' to 'small' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Accepted
10-535	A	33	39			these are standard names - use scientific (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Consider the comment
10-536	A	34	1			"may be", not "may". (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Accepted
10-537	A	34	2	34	2	insert additional reference, '; Zhang et al., 2004', after '(Su and Tang, 2002'. You can find Zhang et al. (2004) in Progress In Oceanography 61: 245-265. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Accepted
10-538	A	34	8		13	think about this! See comments page 33 (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Noted
10-539	A	34	16			In sub-subsection '10.4.4 Natural ecosystems and biodiversity', biodiversity and endangered species were poorly stated. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	10.4.4 Consider this
10-540	A	34	18	35	22	Please refer to Tanaka (2002) on the impact of climate change on dwarf-bamboo distribution. This paper illustrates that the growth of 4 dominant forest floor species of dwarf-bamboo is sensitive to snow-cover change accompanied by climate change. The pdf file of this paper can be downlowd from http://cse.ffpri.affrc.go.jp/ntanaka/2005GERSasa.pdf . (Nobuyuki Tanaka, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute(FFPRI))	The text is deleted
10-541	A	34	20	34	30	This part is only general statement on impact of climate change. It could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	deleted

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-542	A	34	20	34	30	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	deleted
10-543	A	34	20			First para of 10.4.4.1 is general and not specific to Asia. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	10.4.4.1 deleted
10-544	A	34	20	34	30	"section 10.4.4.1 comment: delete these lines." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	10.4.4.1 deleted
10-545	A	34	21	34	22	Due to the climate change, distribution of some species generally would shift northward or southward in northern or southern hemisphere respectively. Change the word in the following. From "shift southward" to "shift poleward" (Kenji Omasa, The University of Tokyo)	deleted
10-546	A	34	22	34	22	Should 'southward' be changed to 'northward'? Reference here. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Deleted
10-547	A	34	22			inaccurate. You mean northern limits of distributions of those species in Asia lie on northern hemisphere (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-548	A	34	22	34	22	Tree species are expected to shift southward, it is not properly expressed and speceis dependent. Actually, tree normally shift northward under climate change. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Deleted
10-549	A	34	22	34	22	I think that tree species in the northern hemisphere are expected to shift northward or to higher elevation. NOT SOUTHWARD. (Tetsuya Matsui, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute)	Deleted
10-550	A	34	22	34	24	Some studies evaluated the effect of soil nitrogen on forest carbon uptake and storage (Friend et al. 1997, Hajima et al. 2005, Pepper et al. 2005). Please add "nitrogen availability" as an important factor to estimate the forest productivity. "In addition, climate change will alter forest productivity depending upon location, tree species, water availability, "nitrogen availability" and the effects of carbon dioxide fertilization." The lack of soil nitrogen restrains increase in plant growth under high CO2 and high temperature conditions. Friend A.D., A.K. Stevens, R.G. Knox and M. G. R. Cannell, 1997: A process-based, terrestrial biosphere model of ecosystem dynamics (Hybrid v3.0), Ecological Modelling, 95, 249-287. Hajima T., Y. Shimizu, Y. Fujita and K. Omasa 2005: Estimation of net primary	Deleted

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						production in Japan under nitrogen-limited scenario using BGGC Model. Journal of Agricultural Meteorology, 60(6), 1223-1225. Pepper D.A., Del Grosso S. J., McMurtrie R.E., and Parton W. J., 2005: Simulated carbon sink response of shortgrass steppe, tallgrass prairie and forest ecosystems to rising [CO ₂], temperature and nitrogen input, Global Biogeochemical Cycles, 19, (Kenji Omasa, The University of Tokyo)	
10-551	A	34	22			"southward" is not correct. Northward is right. (Nobuyuki Tanaka, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute(FFPRI))	NA deleted
10-552	A	34	26		30	delete (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	deleted
10-553	A	34	32	34	34	The two lines before "moreover" could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	deleted
10-554	A	34	32	34	40	Using process-based model, some studies mentioned the risk of alpine ecosystem in Japan under global warming. e.g. Ishigami et al, 2003; Ishigami et al, 2005. Ishigami, Y., Y. Shimizu, and K. Omasa, 2003: Projection of climatic change effects on potential natural vegetation distribution in Japan. Journal of Agricultural Meteorology, 59(4), 269-276 (in Japanese with an English abstract). Ishigami, Y., Y. Shimizu and K. Omasa, 2005: Evaluation of the risk to natural vegetation from climate change in Japan, Journal of Agricultural Meteorology 61(1), 69-75 (in Japanese with an English abstract). (Kenji Omasa, The University of Tokyo)	Consider in revising the text
10-555	A	34	32			Strange sentence. Means that if population increase, biodiversity per capita decreases... (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Deleted
10-556	A	34	32			" ... per capital.." ? (David Saltz, Institute for Desert Research, Ben Gurion University)	Deleted
10-557	A	34	32	34	32	What does "per capita" mean in this context? (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Deleted
10-558	A	34	32	34	32	What does the "per capita" mean here? (Xiong Wei, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences)	Deleted
10-559	A	34	32	34	40	"section 10.4.4.1 comment: provide references to support statements in this paragraph." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	10.4.4.1 deleted partly

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-560	A	34	34	34	34	"up to 50% of the region's total biodiversity is at risk due to climate change", is it the real situation? Please give the references. (Xiong Wei, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences)	Finding refs.
10-561	A	34	34			Reference required. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Finding refs.
10-562	A	34	42	34	51	Coverage is weak. More details could be added on forest cover change in each of the regions in Asia. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Modify the text
10-563	A	34	42	34	51	In Japan, there are some studies about effects of soil nitrogen on forest productivity under global warming. Hajima et al. (2005) indicated a possibility of over-estimation on forest productivity in the former model studies because of neglect of soil nitrogen effects. They showed concretely that NPP of a model (BIOME3) without soil nitrogen effect overestimated about 20% in 2050 to about 30% in 2080 under A2 and B2 scenarios in comparison with BGGC Model with soil nitrogen effect. Hajima T., Y. Shimizu, Y. Fujita and K. Omasa 2005: Estimation of net primary production in Japan under nitrogen-limited scenario using BGGC Model. Journal of Agricultural Meteorology, 60(6), 1223-1225. (Kenji Omasa, The University of Tokyo)	Incorporate refs and modify the text
10-564	A	34	45	34	46	"More than 90% of the dominant forest species Fagus crenata (beech tree) in Japan could disappear by the end of this century (Matsui et al., 2004a,b)." has exaggerated the conclusion. As the first author of those papers cited, I would appreciate if the sentence will be changed as follows: "About 90% of potential habitat for the dominant forest species Fagus crenata (beech tree) in Japan could disappear by the end of this century (Matsui et al., 2004a,b)" (Tetsuya Matsui, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute)	done
10-565	A	34	45	34	46	"Fagus crenara" should be italicized (Tetsuya Matsui, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute)	done
10-566	A	34	45			add comma. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	done
10-567	A	34	45	34	46	This sentence should be "More than 90% of the suitable habitat for a dominant forest species, Fagus crenata....", because the change is predicted for the potential suitable area of Fagus crenata. (Nobuyuki Tanaka, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute (FFPRI))	NA
10-568	A	34	46	34	48	This statement must be qualified with the proviso that natural forests should not be	Noted

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						removed in order to establish plantations, which is what is happening in many parts of Indonesia. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	
10-569	A	34	51			this is rather ambivalent. It could be positive (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	NA No line 51
10-570	A	35	2	35	4	Are there other references that confirm that lightning strikes would increase by 30-40%? (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Finding additional refs.
10-571	A	35	5		11	any refs? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Finding refs.
10-572	A	35	7	35	7	Should be "extinction" rather than extension. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Corrections made
10-573	A	35	9	35	10	Illegal hunting of tigers may be a greater threat than sea level rise. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	NA
10-574	A	35	13	35	22	This paragraph does not related to future impact of climate change. It could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Move to 10.5
10-575	A	35	13			what do you mean here? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Move to 10.5
10-576	A	35	13		22	how is it related to climate change vulnerability? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Move to 10.5
10-577	A	35	13		22	Belongs to section 10.5. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	10.5 Move to 10.5
10-578	A	35	26	35	28	delete this sentence, 'Higher temperature ... water scarcity.' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Retain as it is
10-579	A	35	44			Check the statement of "boundary of farming-pastrol transition region to the south in Northeast China" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Check to the south or north
10-580	A	36	1			Good section (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	OK
10-581	A	36	3	36	12	Section is weak in that permafrost thawing is already occuring, not expected to start in the future. Is 'rocks' supposed to be 'soil'? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Modify the text
10-582	A	36	14	36	33	Fig 10.5 is too small, difficult to read (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	10.5 legend should be bigger
10-583	A	36	36	36	39	delete two sentences, 'The most ... Jorgenson et al., 2001).'	Retain as it i

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-584	A	36	44	36	44	Line contains an abrupt change in topics from permafrost to glaciers. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	?
10-585	A	36	49	37	7	This part is only general statement on impact of climate change. It could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Deleted
10-586	A	36	49	37	7	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Deleted
10-587	A	36	51	36	51	Should indicate direction of affect. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Deleted
10-588	A	37	10	38	27	In the section on human health the impacts of increased fire activity in Indonesia and Russia needs to be mentioned. Russian fires in 2003 had impacts on air quality in Seattle via atmospheric aerosol and smoke transport. In 1998 Japan suffered from strong air pollution from fires. The UNEP publications offer a source of information here. Because forest fires are predicted to increase under scenarios of global warming, this is a health impact that can be linked to climate change. (Heiko Balzter, Centre for Ecology and Hydrology)	10.4.5 Agreed. Modify the text if refs. available
10-589	A	37	12	37	17	delete 'in Asia. Altered patterns ... cold winters.' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Shortened, but not entirely deleted.
10-590	A	37	12	37	17	"section 10.4.5 comment: delete line 12 to line 17 upto: ...summers and less cold winters." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Shortened, but not entirely deleted.
10-591	A	37	16		33	repetitive, very general. Delete (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Shortened
10-592	A	37	17	37	17	insert 'and t', to the front of 'There is already ...', and delete 'T' in 'There is already ...' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Revised in a different way, according to 10-590 revision.
10-593	A	37	18	37	21	The sentence "Throughout Asia the emissions of sulfur dioxide have grown over the past few decades and as a result the urban air quality has deteriorated significantly contributing to widespread heat stress and smog induced cardiovascular and respiratory illnesses in the region' needs recasting considering that: SO2 is supposed to cause cooling in the atmosphere; Tropospheric ozone is responsible for the smog formation and aerosols are responsible for respiratory diseases. (Janaka Dr Ratnasiri, Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS))	Revised
10-594	A	37	18			where? Not clear here (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Revised.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-595	A	37	18		20	how is this relevant? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Because the effect of air pollution exacerbate the effect of heat stress.
10-596	A	37	18	37	21	There are many pollutants that have led to a deterioration in air quality in Asia, not just sulfur dioxide. Particulates, carbon monoxide, and Pb are bigger contributors to air pollution in several Asian cities. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Revised using refs
10-597	A	37	19			spelling error (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Done
10-598	A	37	25			are there any diseases expected to decline in prevalence? Any vestors likely to have "smaller" ranges? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	It depends on the specific situations. This part is revised
10-599	A	37	27			why say it here? How are these 2 different (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Don't know what "these 2" means. If this means "anomalies" and "higher temperatures," then, the difference is that the former conveys two different meanings, i.e., higher temperature and long duration of heat spell.
10-600	A	37	27			"scientifically proven"?? Need to rephrase this. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Rephrased.
10-601	A	37	41			elsewhere emphasis on drier. Which is it, where? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Keep it as it is
10-602	A	37	42	37		at the end of the 2nd paragraph of Human Health "A study on the impact of climate change on malaria occurrence in Sri Lanka has shown that there will be an expansion and shifting of perennial and seasonal zones into areas that have hitherto been rare or free of malaria (Dhanapala, A.H., 1998)" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	NA
10-603	A	37	45			interactions with other ocean chemistry bio processes? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Yes
10-604	A	37	49	37	51	Cardiovascular disease is not water-borne and neither is it infectious. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Wrong reading by the reviewer.
10-605	A	38	5		14	Need to relate to climate. Just stating diseases that happen is insufficient for an assessment (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Shortened
10-606	A	38	5			massive attack on the livelihoods-poor language (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Revised
10-607	A	38	5			Replace "Bird flu" with "Avian flu".	Deleted

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Jilan Su, Second Institute of Oceanography, State Oceanic Administration)	
10-608	A	38	5	38	15	"section 10.4.5 comment: delete line 5 to line 15. Presenting thses health issues without link to climate change does not make sense here." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Deleted
10-609	A	38	9			poor language (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-610	A	38	17	38	27	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Deleted
10-611	A	38	17	38	27	This is a good introductory paragraph and could be made the first paragraph for Section 10.4.5. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Move to the top of this section
10-612	A	38	17	27		Belongs to section 10.5. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	There is just a word "adaptation," but most of the paragraph is on "impact."
10-613	A	38	30			this is not an appropriate title given 10.4.1., 4.2 etc. are all about human activities as well why not: urbanization and industrial change (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	10.4.6 Not Acceptable. Retain the title as it is.
10-614	A	38	30			"Section 10.4.6 comment: the sub-heading of Human dimension is very broad and would like to suggest to change to Human settlement." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Not Acceptable. Retain the title as it is.
10-615	A	38	32			The title of the session is not suitable for content. "climate extremes and" could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Not Acceptable. Retain the title as it is.
10-616	A	38	32	39	14	Session 10.4.6.1 This is only general statement on migration for the impact of climate change. Lack of detailed data. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Cite references and shorten the text
10-617	A	38	32	39	14	"section 10.4.6.1 comment: no relevant references are cited." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Cite references.
10-618	A	38	34	38	42	The message in this paragraph is not strongly clear. Urbanization and migration is important. It would be more understandable if you could link between urbanization (migration) and potential conflicts among existing resource users and migrant users on the scarce resources. Human displacements are also preceded by conflicts. And the scarcity of the resources are clearly associated with high population pressures and poor government policies that commonly favor the development of large scale plantations, which also remove the access to natural resources by indigenous	Cite references.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						communities. (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	
10-619	A	38	34			so what? definitional problems are huge (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Finding refs.
10-620	A	38	38			wow! Why say this? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Finding refs.
10-621	A	38	40		42	poor argument, rewrite paragraph (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-622	A	38	44		51	Reference required. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Cite new references.
10-623	A	38	46	38	48	Don't necessary to indicate the statement that lead to sudden spikes in rural-to-urban migration levels that might lead to socio-political unrest in China and India. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Deleted
10-624	A	38	47		48	should migration and mobility be considered a climate adaptation that reduces vulnerability to climate change (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Acceptable. Delete "that might ... unrest"
10-625	A	39	1		49	where are citations, evidence? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Finding new references.
10-626	A	39	5	39	14	There is a need to stop the conversion of good agricultural land to urban sprawl. Some mention should be made of new crop varieties that are better adapted to higher temperatures. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Not acceptable: Comments should be considered in Adaptation.
10-627	A	39	5		14	This paragraph is not on migration. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Acceptable: Modify text based on references, if no reference, delete.
10-628	A	39	16	40	2	Sub-sub-subsections '10.4.6.2' and '10.4.6.3' were merged. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Acceptable: 10.4.6.2 Urban development, infrastructure linkages, energy and industry
10-629	A	39	16	39	16	change 'Urban development and infrastructure linkages' to 'Urban development, infrastructure linkages, industry and energy' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Acceptable: same as the above
10-630	A	39	16			urban/industrial impacts probably deserve their own higher level subheading (10.4.6) consider citing Louis Lebel's papers (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Acceptable: same as the above
10-631	A	39	16			Section 10.4.6.2 does not include anything that is specific to Asia, or that is hard data on the issue at stake. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Acceptable: Shorten the text, and add references specific to Asia

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-632	A	39	18	39	24	This paragraph is only general statement and it does not related to climate change It could be deleted. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Acceptable: Shorten the text, and add references
10-633	A	39	18	39	28	delete 'Many of these ... warming alone.' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Acceptable: Shorten the text, and add references
10-634	A	39	18	39	24	Shorten the section as it is not relate either directly or indirectly to climate change (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Deleted
10-635	A	39	26	39	38	Most of this paragraph is only general statement. It could be reduced. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Shorten the text
10-636	A	39	35	39	38	There is a need for better planning of urban areas in coastal regions where sea-level rise may be significant. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Not Applicable
10-637	A	39	40	39	40	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Delete the title line
10-638	A	39	40			"section 10.4.6.3 comment: this section does not have meaningful substance." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text
10-639	A	39	43			very surprising finding. What is the basis. Are comprehensive studies available? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-640	A	40	1	40	2	delete the sentence, 'Table 10 provides ... sectors.' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Deleted
10-641	A	40	4			Table 10.7 is only a general concept, and it is not specialized for Asia of Countries of Asia (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Deleted
10-642	A	40	4			Table 10.7 in Page 40: Delete it. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Deleted
10-643	A	40	4			table: row 3, col. 3 - re decline of turbine efficiency.... - meaning not clear... (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-644	A	40	4			Title of Table 10.7 and 10.8 should specify that the info in the table pertains to Japan. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Table 10.7 deleted. Add Japan to the Table 10.8 for clarification
10-645	A	40	4			Table 10.7 What is meant by "reinsure industry"? (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Delted
10-646	A	40	4			In Table 10.7, under the Energy column - one of the threats that the dams on the rivers feed by glacial melt are faced with is from rapid siltation. It has been	Deleted

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						reported that due enhanced silt loads the turbines get damaged as they were designed to take lesser silt loads. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	
10-647	A	40	4			Table 10.7. These examples are specific to Japan. Make it clear in the caption. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Deleted
10-648	A	40	11			The title should add "in Japan" (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Acceptable
10-649	A	40	11			good table (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Thanks
10-650	A	40	11			Caption in Table 10.8 should be mentioned "in Japan". (Dr. Bundit Limmeechokchai, Sirindhorn International Institute of Technolgy, Thammasat Univ.)	Acceptable
10-651	A	40	11			Table 10.8 (row 4) should be "thunderstorms" (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Acceptable
10-652	A	40	11			Table 10.8 (last line) should read "1 degree increase in cooling water temperature" (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Acceptable
10-653	A	40	11			Table 10.8. These examples are specific to Japan. Make it clear in the caption. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Acceptable
10-654	A	41	2	41	17	This paragraph does directly not related to impacts of futute climate change It could be deleted. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text and add references
10-655	A	41	2		17	what does this para have to do with scope of this chapter? Delete? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text and add references
10-656	A	41	8	41	10	South Asia could well be the biggest market by 2050. Safer to say "well before the end of this century". (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Modify the text
10-657	A	41	19	41	30	This paragraph is only general statement and it does not directly related to impacts of futute climate change It could be deleted. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Deleted
10-658	A	41	19	41	30	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Deleted
10-659	A	41	19		30	what does this have to do with climate impacts and vulnerability? Are there policy trade-offs or interactions? Explain or delete? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Deleted
10-660	A	41	19	41	30	This section does not relate specifically to Asia, and some parts of it are already dealt with in other previous sections. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at	Deleted

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						College Park)	
10-661	A	41	19		30	Belongs to section 10.5. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Deleted
10-662	A	41	24	41	25	In Asia, the use of renewables is likely to reduce the rate of increase in fossil fuel consumption rather than the total amount of fossil fuel use, for the next few decades. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Deleted
10-663	A	41	32			very weak framing. Makes more sense to include "costs" of disasters type analysis in discussion of impacts of those disasters. Important financial issues like insurance, credit, investments in protection etc are not really discussed anywhere nor how national capacities to pay vary relative to vulnerabilities (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text, considering points indicated.
10-664	A	41	34	41	36	These three lines is not about Asia. It could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Retain the text with a ref.
10-665	A	41	34	42	16	TERI is undertaking a review of the preparedness of the Indian insurance industry to climate change. This will be published and disseminated at the UNFCCC COP-11, Montreal, December 2005 (Ulka Kelkar, TERI (The Energy and Resources Institute))	Modify the text.
10-666	A	41	36	41	36	What year dollars? Is it PV? (Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)	Deleted
10-667	A	41	37	42	4	This part of text and Table 10.9 is about the current risk and not about the future. It could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Deleted
10-668	A	42	1	42	4	Metodology of damage estimation should be presented, at least in the foornote. For exanple, what is the value of statistical life, what are other components of damage. (Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)	Deleted
10-669	A	42	1	42	3	A comparison of climate variability/climate change-related disasters via-a-vis other natural disasters (non-climate change/climate variability related) show that figures will be about equal. Can't Table 10.9 just show climate change-related damages? (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Deleted
10-670	A	42	3			Table 10.9 Where are Tsunamis included? Suggest adding the numbers from the December 2004 tsunami and the October 2005 earthquake in Pakistan and India. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Deleted
10-671	A	42	18			Session 10.4.6.5 The text in this session is only general statement and it does not directly related to impacts of futute climate change It could be deleted. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Acceptable: Modify the text using new references

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-672	A	42	18			Section 10.4.6.5 does not include in-depth analysis of the issue. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	: Modify the text using rferences
10-673	A	42	18			In the section 10.4.6.5 on 'Social Vulnerability', consider adding climate change related stresses in the society acting as flash points for riots and other similar law and order situations. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	Modify the text using new references
10-674	A	42	20	42	24	"section 10.4.6.5 comment: this section does not have meaningful substance. Please delete lines from line 20 to line 24 upto...natural hazards (Hewitt, 1997)." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text using new references
10-675	A	42	28			Is there any room for discussion of the opposite proposition, namely agricultural societies because they have to live with climate change variability have better adaptive capacity in many ways to climate change than industrial or service. The only real difference is that such societies are poorer and less powerful and so unable to draw on savings or demand them in times of needs and hence vulnerable (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text using new references
10-676	A	42	31			rubbish. Urbanisation is as much a response to poverty as a way out (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text using new references
10-677	A	43	10	52	2	Section 5 on Adaptation is very long. Much of the information is very general, and would apply equally in any location - it is not Asia-specific. Are the authors able to talk about adaptive capacity in Asia? Is it high or low, and why? Are there examples of adaptation projects from Asia - if so, it would be good to name them. What are the constraints to adaptation which are specific to Asia? This section is currently 9 pages long and could be usefully be cut to 2, which already addresses one-third of the chapter length issue. (Jean Palutikof, Hadley Centre)	10.5 Shorten the text
10-678	A	43	10	52	17	Section 10.5. Consider a short paragraph to link all subtopics. Would suggest that the sustainability issue be considered within this paragraph. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Shorten the text
10-679	A	43	12	43	48	This preamble to the issue does not say much new or relevant to Asia, and can be drastically shortened. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Shorten the text
10-680	A	43	14	43	24	In this paragraph you list several factors, particularly "physical aspects" that associate with vulnerability of people in Asia due to climate change. It seems that social factors, such as institutions and management capacity are not yet explained. I	Shorten the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						agree that "physical factors" would play a role, but in many cases that vulnerability is more associated with social than physical factors. I think it is a big challenge how to design institutions, management capacity and good governance in Asia in order to adapt, mitigate, and suppress the impacts of climate change (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	
10-681	A	43	14	46	5	Village level case studies in TERI (2003) showed that private sector and civil society have key roles to play in supplementing government efforts to reduce vulnerability (e.g. corporate centres providing scientific soil testing services, market information, and transport facilities, and voluntary agencies organising indigenous seed banks). In addition to directly agriculture-related interventions, strengthening of local institutions and higher education levels would have positive gender and equity impacts, contributing to adaptive capacity. (Ulka Kelkar, TERI (The Energy and Resources Institute))	Noted
10-682	A	43	14	43	24	In Section 10.5.1 one of the things that needs to be highlighted is the importance of precise and timely weather and climate information and forecasts for adaptaions in agriculture. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	To be included
10-683	A	43	26	43	48	These two paragraphs could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Shorten the text
10-684	A	43	26			what about food security and equity issues in current generation. Surely these are also very important to sustainability and in many ways technically easier to address (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Shorten the text
10-685	A	43	35	43	38	Pblished work supporting this text - "Climate Impacts on Indian Agriculture" by K. Krishna Kumar et al, Int. J. Climatol. 24:1375-1393 (2004) (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	Shorten the text
10-686	A	43	44	43	46	The part before "The inclusion" could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Shorten the text
10-687	A	43	44	43	46	delete the sentence, 'Policies that ... coping mechanisms.' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Shorten the text
10-688	A	43	46	43	48	attach the sentence 'The inclusion ... climate change.' to the end of Line 42 of Page 43 (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Shorten the text
10-689	A	43	50	45	31	One of the main options for adaptation in agriculture - is cattle stock regulation based on state management and financial support of alternative sectors for local people. Because of social and economic changes the amount of cattle stock rised several times in many Asian countries like Mongolia, Kyrgyzstan, some regions of China etc., which is multiplying the pressure of climate drying and desertification	Shorten the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						there. (Andrey Sirin, Institute of Forest Science Russian Academy of Sciences)	
10-690	A	44	10			Table 10.10. How do the measures in this table differ from TAR-what is new since 2001? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Retain the table
10-691	A	44	10			Table 10.10 The adaptation measures listed in table 10.10 is too common. Whether is able to list some special for Asia or for different sub-regions? (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the table considering Asia specific adaptation
10-692	A	44	10	44	10	Table 10.10: Propose to include reference to fishery in table caption to read: "Adaptation measures in Agriculture and Fishery". Otherwise remove row 4 "Fishery" from the table. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	Modify the table considering Asia specific adaptation
10-693	A	44	10			Table 10.10 : this kind of tables are needed for other sectors (human settlements, etc.) (Hideyuki Kobayashi, Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport)	Modify the table considering Asia specific adaptation
10-694	A	44	10			Source of Table 10.10 should be indicated. (Dr. Bundit Limmeechokchai, Sirindhorn International Institute of Technology, Thammasat Univ.)	Modify the table considering Asia specific adaptation
10-695	A	44	10	44	10	I suggest a new measure in Improvement of Agriculture Infrastructure sector: Using unconventional methods for water supply such as fog collection (Mohammad Rahimi, I. R. of Iran Meteorological Organization)	Modify the table considering Asia specific adaptation
10-696	A	44	10			Table 10.10 is very good, but has nothing specific with Asia. May be it should appear in some other place of the volume, not necessarily in the chapter for Asia. The sentence "breeding fish for high water temperature" needs better language. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the table considering Asia specific adaptation
10-697	A	44	10			Table 10.10 In the "Fishery" row, what is meant by "Breeding fish to high water temperature"? (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Modify the table considering Asia specific adaptation
10-698	A	44	10			Table 10.10 opp. Agricultural Cropping, under farm management one additional bullet should read "enhancing the use of weather and climate information in farm level decisions". There should also be an additional row in the table on "Insurance" (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	Modify the table considering Asia specific adaptation
10-699	A	44	10	44	11	table 10.10 it's too general, and most of the options can be found in other chapters. it can not give the information of which adaptation option is better, or which options should be preferred for a given region. I suggest, if possible, ranking the adaptaion options according to subcontinents or counties.	Modify the table considering Asia specific adaptation

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Xiong Wei, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences)	
10-700	A	44	10			Table 10.10. This is definitely too general to appear in a IPCC chapter. Be more specific about the measures as to where (relative importance in Asia) or when (2020s, 2050s, or 2080s) they can be used. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	No consistent ref available across countries, i.e. some study based on time frame, some on temperature.
10-701	A	44	12	45	31	These four paragraphs are only general statement and it could be deleted. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-702	A	44	12	45	7	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-703	A	45	12			"increasing feed supply from cropping" - not clear (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-704	A	45	13			What is "eco-environment"? (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-705	A	45	18	45	20	The introduction of this paragraph would be misleading. At present, it is not the case of sustainable harvest. Impact of climate change are not felt by small communities, and the behaviour of these small communities is mostly driven by traditional knowledge or rules that govern the distributional rights of fishing or resource harvest. Small communities also deplete resources due to population pressures, and global market demands. I think it is more wise to warn that sustainable harvest is barely practiced by small communities. In the future, these small communities would b more vulnerable due to severe climating change (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Modify the text
10-706	A	45	28	45	31	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-707	A	45	29	45	31	Paragraph cumbersome. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-708	A	45	33			"section 10.5.1.2 comment: this section does not have meaningful substance." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text
10-709	A	45	35	45	35	change 'cause' to 'affected' (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Modify the text
10-710	A	45	35	45	41	"section 10.5.1.2 comment: delete these lines --repetition" (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-711	A	45	43	45	47	Are hunger and malnutrition on a decline in Asia? I thought they were generally declining. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Modify the text
10-712	A	45	49	46	5	This paragraph is only general statement and it could be deleted. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-713	A	46	1			Reference required. Which WHO publication? (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Modify the text
10-714	A	46	2	46	3	What is "food based dietary guidelines"? Is not food and diet same thing? (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-715	A	46	8			Session 10.5.2 The content on desertification is not suitable in this on hydrology and water resources (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-716	A	46	8			"section 10.5.2 comment: this section is too general and can be in anywhere." (Yonguan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text
10-717	A	46	10			"desertification and" in the title should be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-718	A	46	10	46	42	Sub-sub-subsections '10.5.2.1' and '10.5.2.2' were merged. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-719	A	46	10	46	10	change 'Desertification and water scarcity' to 'Desertification, water scarcity, and water management' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-720	A	46	10			Section 10.5.2.1 does not deal with desertification at all, in spite of its heading. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-721	A	46	12	46	19	This paragraph should be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-722	A	46	12	46	19	delete this sentence (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-723	A	46	12	46	13	Conversion of pasture into grassland should be addressed as well. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Modify the text
10-724	A	46	12	46	13	Not clear - forest is not grassland. The whole section does not say much. Not clear why desertification is brought in - desertification is valid only in drylands, hence only in those Asian countries that have drylands. Authors should be more specific in use of terms - not every water stress is desertification.	Modify the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	
10-725	A	46	21	46	33	This section is busy and difficult to follow with too many numbered points. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Modify the text
10-726	A	46	35	46	40	Strategies for alleviating water scarcity should also include the reuse of sewage water and rainfall harvest. This approach may fall in broadening the water sources and reduction of water use. Since these three bullets are too brief, I suggest to make some elaboration. Alleviating water scarcity is also essential to ensure water supply for wildlife and cattle. (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Modify the text
10-727	A	46	42			Session 10.5.2.2 The text in this session is only general statement . (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-728	A	46	42	46	42	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-729	A	46	42	47	13	The emphasis onmarket based interests is just one view. Should also discuss rights-based approaches and how these two policy discourses interact. Despite heading no mention of how climate change interacts with dams and inter-basin transfers and how these new challenges might be "managed" for example in relation to environmental flows, sedimentation and river bank or coastal erosion and delivery of nutrients to coastal zones. (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-730	A	46	42			Section 10.5.2.2 is not based on any literature or data. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-731	A	46	44	46	51	delete this paragraph (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-732	A	46	44	47	13	Reference required on MBIs. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Modify the text
10-733	A	47	8	47	13	Suggest adding reference to M. S. Reddy, N.V.V. Char, S. Ayub Qutub et al. (2005), "Water Needs in South Asia", edited by Toufiq A. Siddiqi and Shirin Tahir-Kheli, published by Global Environment and Energy in the 21st Century, Honolulu. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Modify the text
10-734	A	47	15			Session 10.5.2.3 The text in this session is only general statement . (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-735	A	47	15			Section 10.5.2.3 is not based on literature, and is very generic in such a sensitive issue as re-use of wastewater. It does not provide data and well-based targeted options.	Modify the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	
10-736	A	47	17		39	Reference(s) required. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Modify the text
10-737	A	47	42			session 10.5.3 The text in this session is only general statement . (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-738	A	47	44	48	14	Sub-sub-subsections '10.5.3.1' and '10.5.3.2' were merged without title. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-739	A	47	44	47	44	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-740	A	48	4	48	4	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-741	A	48	6	48	14	This paragraph is too brief. Please elaborate more by giving some success stories (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Modify the text
10-742	A	48	9		11	Include Sri Lanka which is usually cited for its outstanding ICZM programme in a developing country. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Modify the text
10-743	A	48	17			Change "systems" to "ecosystems" to conform with the title of the section on vulnerability. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-744	A	48	17			10.5.4 Natural systems and should be read "Natural ecosystems and " (Masatoshi Yoshino, United Nations University)	Modify the text
10-745	A	48	19			Session 10.5.4.1 Most of the text in this session is only general statement . (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-746	A	48	19	49	20	Sub-sub-subsections '10.5.4.1' and '10.5.4.2' were merged without title. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-747	A	48	19	48	19	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-748	A	48	21	49	2	In this paragraph, I did not find a concept of sustainable forest management. I suggest to rewrite this paragraph and include major issues that cause deforestation. Then, you would discuss how to achieve or implement sustainable forest management. Major stakeholders need to be well considered are forest concessions, forest plantations, indigenous or local communities, and the government. (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Modify the text
10-749	A	48	21	48	29	This section is general and adds little new information.	Modify the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	
10-750	A	48	21	48	24	"section 10.5.4.1 comment: delete upto...decades (Isaev et al., 2004)." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text
10-751	A	48	31	49	2	The style of this subsection is very different from others. Use of C- may be confusing. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Modify the text
10-752	A	48	31	48	37	This part could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-753	A	48	31	48	50	This section of "sustainable forest management' deals solely with carbon sequestration. This should be highlighted in the title. It would be useful if some figures are provided, based on literature, if such literature already exists. The language of this section should be improved too. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-754	A	48	33	48	34	that increase either agricultural productivity and sustainability or supply from non-wood products. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Modify the text
10-755	A	48	34	48	36	This sentence is not clear for understanding. (Nobuyuki Tanaka, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute(FFPRI))	Modify the text
10-756	A	48	36	48	37	Sustainable timber production should be changed into ecosystem services, it includes timber production and all many other functions. Actually, plantation in Asia will be managed intensively in limited areas in order to achieve more timber or wood production, leading to reduction of the pressure on exploitation of natural forests that have a great values of biodiversity and ecological functions. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Modify the text
10-757	A	48	36	49	2	"section 10.5.4.1 comment: delete from line 36 of page 48: It is...." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text
10-758	A	48	38	49	2	delete this part (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-759	A	48	40	48	46	storage management should also include practice to reduce emission of GHGs during forest operation, such as tending and thinning, fire control and hearvesting etc., based on sustainable forest management. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese	Modify the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						Academy of Forestry)	
10-760	A	49	4			Session 10.5.4.2 The text in this session is only general statement and not related to the adptation to climate change. It could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-761	A	49	4	49	4	delete the line (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Modify the text
10-762	A	49	4	49	20	Biodiversity conservation, this section need to be rewrite as it does not clearly describe adaptation and mitigation option, instead, it still touch on pressure or implication of future change on biodiversity. Expansion of nature reserve or protected areas, and restrict introduction of invasive alien species should be strongly amphasized. (Shirong Liu, Institute of Forest Ecology, Environment and Protection, Chinese Academy of Forestry)	Modify the text
10-763	A	49	4			This section somewhat overlaps with the previous one, and does not specifically address biodiversity conservation. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-764	A	49	4	49	20	"section 10.5.4.2 comment: delete the sub-section because it is not about adaptation." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text
10-765	A	49	5	49	20	In this paragraph, you just focus on biodiversity on forests. Why you do not also include the conservation of freshwater biodiversity. (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Modify the text
10-766	A	49	23			"section 10.5.5 comment: delete the section because it is not about adaptation." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	10.5.5 Will be shortened, but not entirely deleted.
10-767	A	49	25			The opening sentence is a repetition of what was said in p. 37 line 14 under Impacts on Health. There are several instances of such repetitions under Impacts and Adaptations. (Janaka Dr Ratnasiri, Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS))	Modify the text
10-768	A	49	36			The sentence "Assessment of the impact of climate change is the first step for exploring adaptation strategy" should appear under Section 10.5. (Janaka Dr Ratnasiri, Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS))	Modify the text
10-769	A	49	41	49	43	Does this mean that there is no literature on this subject?	Modify the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)	
10-770	A	49	41		43	This sentence is too general. Need to elaborate and bring in more specific measures. See page 38, lines 17 to 27, which gives some idea of possible strategies and measures to be taken. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Modify the text
10-771	A	49	46	51	30	What is the meaning of this "Human Dimensions" heading. In wahat sense is human health (5.5) not a human dimension and construction of dams (5.2) or coastal infrastructure (5.3) not a human activity. Section needs new heading and better scoping argument. (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-772	A	49	46	51	30	Why doesn't 'Human Dimensions' include population growth and poverty? (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Modify the text
10-773	A	49	46			"section 10.5.6 comment: suggest to change the sub-heading to Human settlement. (see No 17)" (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text
10-774	A	49	48	49	48	section 10.5.6.1. title is perhaps wrong. You mean disaster and mitigation management? (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Modify the text
10-775	A	49	50	50	5	The part before "base on" could be deleted (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-776	A	49	50	50	3	"section 10.5.6 comment: delete these lines upto ... downstream." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text
10-777	A	50	16	50	16	The factor is not weak land use planning but the weak enforcement of land use that causes poor people to be more vulnerable to climate change (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Modify the text
10-778	A	50	16	50	17	Bangladesh could be mentioned as one example of a country where high popelation density has provided a strong incentive for people to move to coastal areas highly exposed to typhoons and floods. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Modify the text
10-779	A	50	16	50	21	"section 10.5.6 comment: delete these lines upto ... (Kelly and Adger, 2000)." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text
10-780	A	50	19	50	23	This paragraph only gives part of the reasons for migration. But it does not give the adaptaion measures. So it does not match with the title of the Session 10.5	Modify the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						(Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
10-781	A	50	21			It should be mentioned that an ecological migration policy has been implemented in some regions such as North China and coral reef islands. (Mitsuhiro Nakagawa, Ibaraki University)	Modify the text
10-782	A	50	27	50	46	Is an example you have described (ski industry) the most relevant to Asia? (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Modify the text
10-783	A	50	27		36	Include insurance for tsunamis (see general comments on chapter). (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Modify the text
10-784	A	50	38		46	This paragraph is not relevant to the context of WGII (Hideyuki Kobayashi, Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport)	Modify the text
10-785	A	50	38	50	46	No references in this section. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-786	A	50	38	50	46	"section 10.5.6.2 comment: delete the paragraph because it is not about adaptation." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Modify the text
10-787	A	50	48	51	30	Regarding heat islands. It is important to define the sources of heat islands. These commonly include big hotels, condos and offices in the tropics. By reducing airconditioned temperatures from 18C into 22-25C may be one of important action (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Modify the text
10-788	A	50	48			Session 10.5.6.3 The text in this session is only general statement . (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify the text
10-789	A	50	50	51	30	For a reference on the health risk of heat stress of 10.5.6.3 Urban planning and development. (Mitsuru ANDO, Toyama University of International Studies)	Modify the text
10-790	A	51	12			Passive cooling technologies reduces the building cooling loads. It is not directly related to climate changes unless more studies are referred. (Dr. Bundit Limmeechokchai, Sirindhorn International Institute of Technolgy, Thammasat Univ.)	Modify the text
10-791	A	51	19	51	21	Late afternoon is frequently the hottest time of the day, so a 2-hour recess starting at noon may not help. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Modify the text
10-792	A	51	26	51	30	Cumbersome language, and may be nothing substantial in this section. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-793	A	51	33			This section is very low standard relative to others. Rewrite or drop (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-794	A	51	35	52	2	You mention three aspects. However, it seems you have explained only two. Perhaps the third aspect is government policy (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Modify the text
10-795	A	51	35	51	52	The three aspects are not complete-there is no third point made. Does this section advance from the TAR? (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Modify the text
10-796	A	51	35	52	52	Suggest rewriting section 10.5.7. There are too many double words separated by /. Some statements need to be reworded, e.g. lines 47-48. Assessments of climate impacts with "precise accuracy" cannot be made for any region or sector, rather than for only some regions or sectors. Some referenes should also be added. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Modify the text
10-797	A	51	35	52	2	Section 10.5.7. The paragraph mentioned 3 aspects. The third aspect is not fully identified. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Modify the text
10-798	A	51	37			why is this constraint? Migt it be a source of response diversity? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-799	A	51	39			in what? is it same for tropics and temperate? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-800	A	51	41			where in Asia? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-801	A	51	42			Language. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify the text
10-802	A	51	44	51	47	It is questionable. There is no reference anyway. (Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)	Modify the text
10-803	A	51	46			lack by who? About what? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-804	A	51	47		48	Can we really assess future impacts of climate change with precise accuracy? (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Modify the text
10-805	A	51	48			careful. Much of this technology is what has caused climate change (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-806	A	51	50			policy approaches? What do you mean? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-807	A	52	5			Session 10.6 The two cases are not successful. The two cases has not much difference from the statement in above sessions: (1) case study should give integrated results on change, impacts, response. (2) case study should be able to	10.6

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						separate impacts of climate change from the other factors. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	
10-808	A	52	5			should be some rationale for why they are selected and what they are supposed to illustrate. Make sure emphasis is on understanding climate impacts not background descriptions (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	NA
10-809	A	52	5			I think the case studies section could be taken out - if the flexibility exists. (Govindarajan Srinivasan, India Meteorological Department)	Case studies are important to demonstrate the impacts of climate change – not acceded to.
10-810	A	52	16			According to the text and the table. Huanghe Delta is not a right expression. It might be Huanghe-Huaihe Delta. Please the author check it. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Done
10-811	A	53	0	53		Tianjin is out of the catchment of Huanghe (Yellow River Basin). (Toshiaki Ichinose, National Institute for Environmental Studies)	Noted
10-812	A	53	0			table row 11 - "coastal protection" - what does it mean?; under mangoves, where is data on Haiphon?; where is data on Ca Mau, Bac Lieu etc.? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Revised
10-813	A	53	1			Table 10.11 (1) column 3. "Huang" is not a right expression. Tianjin locates in the Haihe Delta, insteade of Huanghe Delta. "Huanghe" might be "Huanghe-Haihe". Please check it. (3) column 4 and 5, The climate zone of Changjiang and Zhujiang deltas should be sub-tropical. (3) fill in the blank cells (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Revised
10-814	A	53	2	53	2	Table 10.11: Propose to include explanation of SLR in legend below the table. (Michael Gytarsky, Institute of Global Climate and Ecology)	Accepted and revision made.
10-815	A	53	3	53	3	on the infromation of Chao Phraya delta, see the detail of comment in the attached file of Table 10.11 (Thanawat Jarupongsakul, Chulalongkorn University)	Revised
10-816	A	54	23			Language. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Revised.
10-817	A	54	36	56	5	I share concern of authors in process of receding and thinning the Himalayan glaciers, caused by global climate change. Glaciers in territory of Tajikistan behave similarly. There are 8492 glaciers in Tajikistan by the total area of 8476,2 square km, or about 6% of all territory of the Republic (Catalog of glaciers of USSR,1969-1980). About 25% of the water in Tajikistan rivers comes from snow and glacial melts. "...the shootings of front of Zerafshan glacier have shown, that the glacier is actively degraded. Since 1908 for 1986 the glacier has receded almost on 1 km. The researches counted on Abramov glacier, have shown, that since 1850 for 1984 its	This information has been appended in the revised text with appropriate citation in section 10.2.3.2.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						lower boundary has mounted on 80 m, and the volume of ice in the bottom has degreased on 630 milliomm cubic m" (Water resources of Tajikistan. Dushanbe, 2003, p.29). (Shavkat Azimov, Physical-technical Institute of Tajik Academy of Sciences)	
10-818	A	54	36			Section 10.6.2 This section is important not only for the rivers in the Indo Gangetic Plains but also the people and the economies of the countris in the Himalays. The section can be further strengthened by making use of information available from other parts of the Himalayas like glacial studies from Nepal and Bhutan. See UNEP and ICIMOD report avialable online http://www.rrcap.unep.org/issues/glof/ . (Thinley Namgyel, National Environment Commission)	Yes – revised.
10-819	A	54	36			Section 10.6.2 - it is not clear how much in this section is also mentioned in previous sections, and how much of it relates to the last five years. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Repetition / duplication avoided. Available statistics on recent trends are provided.
10-820	A	54	46	54	46	delete '(see Table 10.12 below)' (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Irrelevant editorial comment
10-821	A	55	1			Table 10.12 in Page 55: Delete it. (Suam Kim, Pukyong National University)	Irrelevant editorial comment
10-822	A	56	1	56	5	The paragraph ends with a question. An effort should be made to provide at least a partial answer to the question. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Corrections done.
10-823	A	56	8			Session 10.7 . Most of the text in this session is only general statement. It seems not close to the topic of the session. The sustainable development challenges here should be challenges of climate change to the sustainable development or the challenges of environmental impacts for sustainable development. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	10.7 Modify the text
10-824	A	56	8			Section should focus on intersection with climate change but does not. Rewrite or drop (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify the text
10-825	A	56	8			"section 10.7 comment: This section needs to be re-written thoroughly. Rather than discussing the implications of climate change for sustainable development, this section deals with implications of issues related to sustainable development." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Yes, elaborated, but it does implications for sustainable development.
10-826	A	56	8			"section 10.7 comment: amend the heading to Implications for Sustainable Development." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources,	Yes, done

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						Environment and Sustainability)	
10-827	A	56	10			Preamble to 10.7 - very nice, but good for all regions, not just Asia. If the issues brought forward in this section appear elsewhere in the volume, then this section is redundant. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	We do not know if other chapters has such preamble. But at least we think it is important.
10-828	A	56	19	56	27	You mention several key issues regarding sustainable. I think you cannot forget an issue of globalization. In Asia, I have observed that globalization serving for rapid economic achievements have led more resource destruction or habitat loss. This issue is important to discuss because rapid economic growths also accelerate the process of climate change. For example, rapid deforestation in Indonesia is associated with high wood demand from China, and the change of lifestyles, from rural into more urban or modern lifestyles as seen on TV (Gusti Anshari, Faculty of Agriculture, Universitas Tanjungpura)	Globalization is of course an important issue. But the problem is what is special in globalization for Asia. We will hunt references to see if any information could be added.
10-829	A	56	24			"section 10.7 comment: amend the sentence to Economic growth and equality." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	The title of 10.7 is changed into "implication for sustainable development".
10-830	A	56	25	56	27	Acronyms should be defined. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Done.
10-831	A	56	25			"section 10.7 comment: amend ICT to Information and Communication Technology (ICT) ." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Done.
10-832	A	56	34			Sections 10.7.1, 10.7.2 and 10.7.3 are not specific to Asia and are not backed by literature references. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	At this moment, there are no many literatures specially/directly on this topic, but at least these are important issues for Asia.
10-833	A	56	36	56	36	Reference here would help. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Yes, check and add.
10-834	A	56	46			"section 10.7.2 comment: amend the sub-heading to Economic growth and equality." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)	Equitable development is better.
10-835	A	56	48	57	5	Very few studies have looked at climate change and economic changes together. One study is O'Brien et al (2004) and TERI. 2003. www.teriin.org/coping which looks at the combined impacts of globalization and climate change. (Ulka Kelkar, TERI (The Energy and Resources Institute))	Check; but this is also not specific for Asia

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-836	A	57	8	57	26	<p>I completely agree with authors in their estimation of important role of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) in social, economic, and political life. It would be desirable, that the international organizations and the funds anxious with a problem of global change of a climate considered development ICT, in particular, in region Asia as the powerful tool of increase of consciousness of the population and in every possible way promoted ICT expansion in region.</p> <p>Availability ICT will lead the greater number of people to their greater knowledge and comprehension of and the natural environment in which they live as a part of uniform space of the Earth. Thus should their responsibility for an environment and its careful use will be raised.</p> <p>My point of view is based on own positive experience in the given area. Due to the International Scientific and Technology Center (www.istc.ru) help during 2004-2005 as a result of Communication Support Program we create the communication network for 14 scientific research institutes of the Academy of sciences of Republic Tadjikistan.</p> <p>Access to the Internet and e-mail was received with hundreds scientists, post-graduate students and students. We are sure, that it has considerably expanded their horizons and a society has received the new citizens conceiving globally. (Shavkat Azimov, Physical-technical Institute of Tajik Academy of Sciences)</p>	Consistent to the text.
10-837	A	57	8			<p>The Technology is not clearly defined-Internet? Information management? Etc. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)</p>	Done
10-838	A	57	19			<p>It should be mentioned that concerning "information sharing" each country has a responsibility to share domestic information related to climate changes. (Mitsuhiro Nakagawa, Ibaraki University)</p>	(To Add) it is there.
10-839	A	57	29			<p>Section 10.7.4 - same comment as above. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)</p>	At this moment, there are no many literatures specially/directly on this topic, but at least these are important issues for Asia.
10-840	A	57	46		47	<p>Please be specific about 'lag of scientific lore'. What is this? (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))</p>	It means that scientific research could not explain the phenomena we see or feel. (wrong position)
10-841	A	58	8			<p>should begin with short paragraph on scope? Uncertainties in what? priorities for what? without this framework text that follows appears like a random collection (and maybe is) (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)</p>	10.8 Modify and shorten the text
10-842	A	58	10			<p>Session 5.8.1 Most of the text in this session is only general statement .It is not specialized for Asia (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)</p>	Modify and shorten the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-843	A	58	10	59	8	Section 10.8.1. Should include some discussion on the time lines 2020s, 2050s, and 2080s. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)	Modify and shorten the text
10-844	A	58	12			this includes uncertainties that are magnified rather than reduced by weak synthesis and assessment processes (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	Modify and shorten the text
10-845	A	58	12	58	28	This section is generic and may be removed. Actually all 10.8.1 section is not specific to Asia and does not add anything on TAR. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify and shorten the text
10-846	A	58	32	58		Is it imperfect knowledge? (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Modify and shorten the text
10-847	A	59	11	59	11	Title should better reflect content of section ie Vulnerability of key sectors. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Modify and shorten the text
10-848	A	59	11			Table 10.13 is an effective general summary of the report and should be highlighted as such in a separate section, e.g. 10.9. Should be included in Executive Summary also. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Modify and shorten the text
10-849	A	59	11			heading and content that follows do not match. Revise (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)	OK
10-850	A	59	11		23	Can you include description of how values (-2 to +2) were assigned? (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))	Modify and shorten the text
10-851	A	59	13	59	19	Text should more clearly define methods used to a) define level of vulnerability and b) define levels of confidence. (Michael Brady, Canadian Forest Service)	Modify and shorten the text
10-852	A	59	13	59	15	It should give some explain on the standards for judging the confidence level (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify and shorten the text
10-853	A	59	21		22	Positive impact on food production in Northern Asia is questionable. So are water resources. More precipitation is not always better. (Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)	Not Positive impacts
10-854	A	59	21	59	22	Table 10.13 is a useful summary (Jean Palutikof, Hadley Centre)	Thanks.
10-855	A	59	21			Table 10.13. Do the degrees of vulnerability reflect subjective assessments or are they the result of some computer models? (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)	Expert judgement based on TAR's table in Asian Chapter

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-856	A	59	22	59	22	please see the attached file of Table 10.13 (Thanawat Jarupongsakul, Chulalongkorn University)	?
10-857	A	59	24			Session 10.8.3 The text in this session is only general statement .It is not speciallized for Asia. (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)	Modify and shorten the text
10-858	A	59	24			Nothing in 10.8.3 is specifically relevant to Asia, or new. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)	Modify and shorten the text
10-859	A	59	26	60	6	Section 10.8.3, which has nothing to say about impacts on Asia, should be deleted. (Jean Palutikof, Hadley Centre)	?
10-860	A	60	9	60	51	I have to agree with authors's statement, typed on lines 11-12, that "in general, the level of social-economic development of countries and regions in Asia is relatively low. I also agree that "A number of fundamental scientific questions relating to the build-up of greenhouse gases in the atmosphere and the behaviour of the climate system need to be critically addressed which include ...(f) the direct and indirect effects of the changing distributions of aerosols."(lines 13-20). But I can testify, that the situation with researches on the given theme in our region gradually improves. I would like to give an example: The ISTC project #1238 "Aerosol pollution as result of dust storms" (Project Manager Dr. Abdullaev Sabur F) submitted in 2005 by the Physical-technical Institute of Tajik Academy of Sviences in collaboration with US Department of Agriculture, NASA and some other foreign organisation already has a status Approved without Funding. One of the main project goals is control of aerosol atmospheric pollutions formed after dust storms, its influence on climate change and crop productivity and people health.(http://tech-db.istc.ru/ISTC/sc.nsf/html/projects.htm?open&id=T-1238). The following positive example concerns directly to lines 33-34: In March, 2000 the scientists from four nuclear physics research institutes in the Central Asia Republics of Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan, and the Cooperative Monitoring Center of Sandia National Laboratories embarked on a three-year cooperative transboundary river monitoring experiment. The experiment, named NAVRUZ (meaning "new beginning"), monitors basic water quality parameters, radionuclides and metals in the Syr Darya and Amu Darya rivers, and their major tributaries. These rivers – which are shared among all the countries -- are crucial for domestic, agricultural and industrial use throughout Central Asia. Contamination of these rivers is a result of water pollution and radioactive contamination from uranium mining, industry, and other activities, and poses a threat to the environment and the health and safety of those living nearby.	Modify and shorten the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						<p>Participating countries are collecting water, bottom sediment, vegetation and soil samples from a total of 60 stations along the rivers. These samples are then sent to laboratories in Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan and the United States for analysis. Samples are also being collected at two locations along the Rio Grande in central New Mexico.</p> <p>Data from this project are being posted on this Internet site as they become available for use by the participants and by scientists and the public worldwide. (http://ironside.sandia.gov/Central/centralasia.html). I can add that at the following stage of experiment NAVRUZ there will be also measured the researched rivers water discharge by the newest measuring system "to develop the working model of water balance and water quality for transboundary rivers Amu Darya and Syr Darya in their middle and lower current (Basin of the Aral sea). This basin includes territories of Republics of Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan, and Turkmenistan." (http://tech-db.istc.ru/ISTC/sc.nsf/html/projects.htm?open&id=T-1163).</p> <p>(Shavkat Azimov, Physical-technical Institute of Tajik Academy of Sciences)</p>	
10-861	A	60	9			<p>Session 10.8.4 Most of the text in this session is only general statement . (Xiuqi Fang, Beijing Normal University)</p>	Modify and shorten the text
10-862	A	60	9			<p>why is there no review here of what previous writers have said about research gaps?; what about gaps between knowledge and action? Between what is known and what is done and their causes? Should this be a new section? (Louis Lebel, Chiang Mai University)</p>	Modify and shorten the text
10-863	A	60	9		51	<p>Section 10.8.4. Should tie up discussion with the time lines 2020s, 2050s, and 2080s. (Poh Poh Wong, National University of Singapore)</p>	Modify and shorten the text
10-864	A	60	11	60	20	<p>"section 10.8.4 comment: delete this paragraph which is irrelevant to VIA." (Yongyuan YIN, Adaptation and Impacts Research Group/Institute of Resources, Environment and Sustainability)</p>	Modify and shorten the text
10-865	A	60	15	60	16	<p>A clarification could be added that natural gas, a fossil fuel, is mainly methane. Also that the carbon in the atmosphere is mainly in the form of carbon dioxide. (Toufiq Siddiqi, Global Environment & Energy in the 21st Century)</p>	Modify and shorten the text
10-866	A	60	28			<p>The only relevant material is from this line and onward, in this section. (Uriel Safriel, Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the University of Maryland at College Park)</p>	Modify and shorten the text
10-867	A	60	33		34	<p>We also need the capability to maintain existing systematic observation facilities. (Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))</p>	Modify and shorten the text

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
10-868	A	60	45			adaptation strategies for urban population, urban settlements and infrastructure could be added (Hideyuki Kobayashi, Ministry of Land, Infrastructure and Transport)	Modify and shorten the text
10-869	A	60	46	60	51	For further research it is important to get an integrated assessment of climate change on agriculture, forest and human health, since most studies analysed each effect separately. Another important research area is the feasibility of adaptation measures and estimation of adaptation cost. (Alexander Golub, Environmental Defense)	Modify and shorten the text
10-870	A	61	0	61		"Basnayake, B.R.S.B., Wijayasundara, G.W.C. and Dharshika, D.W.T.T., 2005, "Simulation of 1997/98 El Nino event using RegCM3 model", Proceedings of the 61st Annual Session of Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS)" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	Check ref.
10-871	A	61	0	61		"Basnayake, B.R.S.B., Ratnasiri, J and Vithanage, J.C., 2004, Rainfall and Temperature change Scenarios for Sri Lanka, Paper presented at the AIACC Asia-Pacific Regional Workshop, Manila , Philippines, 2 – 6, November 2004" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	Check ref.
10-872	A	61	0	61		"Basnayake, B.R.S.B. and Vithanage, J.C., 2004, Rainfall change Scenarios for Sri Lanka under the anticipated Climate Change, Proceeding of the International Conference on Sustainable Water Management in the Changing Environment of Monsoon Region", Colombo, Sri Lanka, 17 - 19, November 2004" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	Check ref.
10-873	A	61	0	61		"Basnayake, B.R.S.B. and Vithanage, J.C., 2004, Impacts and Adaptation of Climate Change with emphasis on Downscaling of future Climate Change Scenarios as an Impact Assessment Tool - A Sri Lanka Perspective, Proceedings of the Second International Conference on Climate Change Impacts Assessment (SICCIA), Grainau, Germany, June 28 - July 2, 2004" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	Check ref.
10-874	A	61	1	76	51	Reference: For Peak Oil Scenario: 1) Campbell, C. J., 2002: Forecasting global oil supply 2000-2050. Hubbert Center Newsletter 2002/3. M. King Hubbert Center, Colorado School of Mines, Colorado, USA. For health risk of heat stress 10.5.6.3 Urban planning and development: 2) Ando, M., S. Yamamoto, K. Wakamatsu, 2004: The impacts of global warming on human health and adaptation. Japanese Journal of Biometeorology, 40(s), pp. 317-328. (Mitsuru ANDO, Toyama University of International Studies)	Check ref.
10-875	A	61	41	61		"Basnayake, B.R.S.B., Fernando, T.K and Vithanage, J.C, 2002, "Variation of air temperature and rainfall during Yala and Maha agricultural seasons", Proceedings	Check ref.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter-Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						of the 58th Annual Session of Sri Lanka Association for the Advancement of Science (SLAAS)" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	
10-876	A	63	0			"Department of Meteorology-Sri Lanka, 2003, Study report on the Heavy rainfall events on 17th May 2003 and associated floods in the Sabaragamuwa and Southern provinces" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	Check ref.
10-877	A	63	27	63		"Dhanapala, A.H., 1998: Sensitivity of Malaria Potential Transmission to Climate Change in Sri Lanka, Asian Profile, 26(4), 283-292" (B.R.S.B. Dr. Basnayake, Department of Meteorology)	Check ref.
10-878	A	67	12	67	12	Please add the reference: "Japan Meteorological Agency, 2005: Climate Change 2005, 374pp. (in Japanese)". (Masao Mikami, Meteorological Research Institute, JMA)	Check ref.
10-879	A	69	38	69	39	Title of Matsui et al. (2004a) is not correct. The correct title is: "Probability distributions, vulnerability and sensitivity in Fagus crenata forests following predicted climate changes in Japan". (Tetsuya Matsui, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute)	Check ref.
10-880	A	69	38	69	41	"Fagus crenata" should be italicized (Tetsuya Matsui, Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute)	Check ref.
10-881	A	71	8	71	10	Note to authors: Listed reference (PAGASA), 2001: Documentation and Analysis of Impacts of and Response to Extreme Climate Events, Climatology and Agrometeorology Branch T.P No. 2001 is a six-volume report Vol. 1 is the Climate Sector and is C.A.B. T.P. No. 2001-2, 55 pp Vol. 2 is the Health Sector and is C.A.B. T.P. No. 2001-3, 28 pp Vol. 3 is the Disaster Management Sector and is C.A.B. T.P. No. 2001-4, 25 pp Vol. 4 is the Water Resources Sector and is C.A.B. T.P. No. 2001-5, 91 pp Vol. 5 is the Environment Sector and is C.A.B. T.P. No. 2001-6, 21 pp Vol. 6 is the Agriculture Sector and is C.A.B. T.P. No. 2001-7, 43 pp I suggest appropriate listing would be: Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA) 2001; Documentation and Analysis of Impacts of and Response to Extreme Climate Events, Climatology and Agrometeorology Branch T.P. No. 2001-2 to T.P. No. 2001-7, 263 pp Additional references I cited in my comments are the ff. Amadore, L.A., 2005 - Crisis or Opportunity : Climate Change Impacts. Paper commissioned by the Greenpeace-Southeast Asia	Check ref.

IPCC WGII AR4 FOD Expert Review Comments

Chapter- Comment	Batch	From Page	From Line	To Page	To line	Comments	Notes of the writing team
						<p>Relox, N.A., Perez, R.T. and Villareal, G.E., 1998; Epidemiological Study for Metro Manila Using Climatic Variability, PAGASA, Natural Disaster Reduction Branch No. 96</p> <p>Arceo, H.O., Quibilan. M.C., Aliño, P.M., Lim, G. and Licuanan, W.Y., 2001; Coral Bleaching in the Philippine Reefs: Coincident Evidences with Mesoscale Thermal Anomalies. Bulletin of Marine Sciences (Philippines), 69 (2), February 2001</p> <p>Jose, A.M., Cruz, N.A., Manalo, V.C. and Verceles, E.R., 2000; Preliminary Studies on Monitoring Sea Surface Temperature Anomalies over the Central and Equatorial Pacific and Predicting Potential Effects in the Philippine Climate Variability, PAGASA/Climatology and Agrometeorology Branch T.P. No. 2000-1, 13 pp</p> <p>Tibig, L.V., 2005; Trends of Extreme Temperatures and 24-Hr Rainfall in the Philippines: 1961-2003, PAGASA Climate Forum, April 2005</p> <p>PAGASA, 2005; Climatological Statistics (1971-2000)</p> <p>(Lourdes Tibig, Philippine Atmospheric, Geophysical and Astronomical Services Administration (PAGASA))</p>	
10-882	A	76	23	76	23	<p>Zeqiang, Yunlong, Youxiao, Erfu are Chinese first names. (Toshiaki Ichinose, National Institute for Environmental Studies)</p>	Corrected